

Jinnah's Use of Islam in his Speeches

Tariq Rahman*

Abstract

Mohammad Ali Jinnah, the founder father of Pakistan, used words relating to Islam and Muslims in his speeches. This has been interpreted differently by people according to their ideological orientations. The liberals maintain that he wanted to create a state for Muslims and not an Islamic state while the religiously oriented ideologues asserted that he wanted to create an Islamic state. Another line of reasoning implying that Pakistan was made for pragmatic (to secure rights from an unsympathetic majority) not for ideological reasons also supports the liberal position. However, this argument is easily refuted by the upholders of orthodoxy so it is not the strength of the argument or the authenticity of the sources which wins the debate; it is official authority. There are a number of books for students of Pakistan studies which purvey the official, orthodox view. The question is one to give up or is there room for a rational debate on this issue. In my view, providing material for the debate is necessary. This is what this article does. It is meant to encourage debate about the exact meaning of Jinnah's use of the Islamic idiom in his speeches to provide answers to whether he wanted to create an Islamic state or a modern, democratic state for a Muslim majority but one which would give equal rights to non-Muslim citizens. The data used in this article include several collections of speeches of Mr Jinnah. The four volumes of Yusufi, which contain most of them, is our major text. However, it has been supplemented by such additional material as is missing from this text.

Mohammad Ali Jinnah, the founder father of Pakistan, has been referring to the subject of, and therefore has used words, Islam and Muslims in his speeches. This has been interpreted differently by people according to their respective ideological leanings. Putting it succinctly and crudely, the liberals maintain that he wanted to create a state for Muslims and not an Islamic state while the religiously oriented ideologues claimed that he

* Dr Tariq Rahman, HEC Distinguished Professor & Professor Emeritus, Dean School of Education, Becaonhouse National University, Lahore.

wanted to create an Islamic state. The ‘liberal’ position is expressed by, among others, Tariq Ali who says that Jinnah wanted a secular, democratic Pakistan.¹ The opposite position is that of Sharif ul Mujahid who, quoting extensively from the same speeches which will be used below, asserts that Islam ‘occupies the central place in Jinnah’s perception of the historical basis of the Pakistan demand, [and] he would also concede Islam a critical role in Pakistan once it was established.’²

Another line of reasoning implying that Pakistan was made for pragmatic (to secure rights from an unsympathetic majority) not for ideological reasons also supports the liberal position. Thus, Ayesha Jalal’s book, *The Sole Spokesman*,³ which argues that Jinnah wanted to safeguard the interests of the Muslims of India not create an ideologically oriented, Islamic state is often cited by people who deny that Jinnah wanted to create an Islamic state. However, since this is the position taken by at least two major Indian accounts of Jinnah’s work by Ajeet Javed and Singh, this argument is easily refuted by the upholders of orthodoxy.⁴ In the end it is not the strength of the argument or the authenticity of the sources which wins the debate. It is official authority. Thus, we have a number of books for students of Pakistan studies which purvey the official, orthodox view, about which Akbar S. Ahmed remarks while referring to such textbooks, ‘those who doubt risk being labeled traitor’.⁵ Yet, Ahmed’s own conclusion about Jinnah’s Islamic terminology in his speeches, is that they reveal ‘the unequivocal Islamic nature of Pakistan’.⁶ So, is one to give up or is there room for a rational debate on this issue. In my view, providing material for the debate is necessary. This is what this article does. It is meant to encourage debate about the exact meaning of Jinnah’s use of the Islamic idiom in his speeches to provide answers to whether he wanted to create an Islamic

¹ Tariq Ali, *Can Pakistan Survive? The Death of a State* (Harmondsworth: Penguin Books, 1983).

² Sharif ul Mujahid, *Ideological Foundations of Pakistan* (Islamabad: Shariah Academy, International Islamic University, 1999), p.6.

³ Ayesha Jalal, *The Sole Spokesman: Jinnah, the Muslim League and the Demand for Pakistan* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1985).

⁴ Riaz Ahmad, *Quaid-i-Azam Mohammad Ali Jinnah: Second Phase of His Freedom Struggle 1924-1934* (Islamabad: Quaid-i-Azam University, 1994), pp.4-11.

⁵ Akbar S. Ahmed, *Jinnah, Pakistan and Islamic Identity: the Search for Saladin* (Karachi: Oxford University Press, 2007), p.28.

⁶ *Ibid.*

state or a modern, democratic state for a Muslim majority but one which would give equal rights to non-Muslim citizens.

However, the present article does not seek an answer by pointing to Jinnah's personal lifestyle. It neither refers to his marriage with Ruttie Jinnah, whose identity as a former Parsi beauty and sartorial elegance along modern lines, so provoked Jinnah's religious antagonists.⁷ Nor does it refer to his dietary preferences which Wolpert referred to in his biography entitled *Jinnah of Pakistan* (1984).⁸ Nor, indeed, does it take into account the several hagiographies which make him into a Pakistani saint—one who is always dressed in *sherwani*, Jinnah cap and has his eyes fixed upon heaven.⁹ Instead, it is only focused upon his words as given in his speeches. He does use Islamic idiom concerning the nature of the state, womens' place in society, the nature of citizenship and so on. The question is what did he actually mean? Was he using them as a political strategy in order to mobilize ordinary people, whose worldview was religious and for whom such words had a resonance since they were about the sacred? Or did he use them sincerely under the impression that he could interpret them correctly notwithstanding the different interpretations of the *ulema*? This remains an enigma with certain consequences for the future of Pakistan.

Let us first describe the data which has been used in this article. There are several collections of speeches of Mr Jinnah.¹⁰ There is much information which provides insights into the worldview of the people who looked up to Jinnah as their greatest leader (the Quaid-i-Azam as they called him) in the *Jinnah Papers* edited and compiled by Z.A.

⁷ For her dress see Khwaja Razi Haider, *Ruttie Jinnah* (Karachi: Oxford University Press, 2010), p.60; For opposition see Saad R. Khairi, *Jinnah Reinterpreted: the Journey from Indian Nationalism to Muslim Statehood* (Karachi: Oxford University Press, 1995), p.468.

⁸ Stanley Wolpert, *Jinnah of Pakistan* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1984).

⁹ Qazi Sayyid Abdul Hannan, *Meer-e-Karwan Mohammad Ali Jinnah* [Urdu: The Leader of the Caravan] (Karachi: Rahbar Publications, 1995).

¹⁰ Rafique Afzal (ed.), *Speeches and Statements of the Quaid-i-Azam Mohammad Ali Jinnah, 1911-36 and 1947-48*, Lahore 1966; Jamil Uddin Ahmad (ed.), *Speeches and Writings of Mr Jinnah* (Lahore: Sheikh Muhammad Ashraf, 1976); Khurshid Ahmad Khan Yusufi (ed. & collected), *Speeches, Statements & Messages of the Quaid-i-Azam*, 4 Vols (Lahore: Bazm-i- Iqbal, 1996); S.M. Burke, *Speeches and Statements 1947-1948* (Karachi: Oxford University Press, 2000).

Zaidi.¹¹ Our corpus consists of the speeches of M.A. Jinnah. Since these have been repeated in several collections, the four volumes of Yusufi, which contains most of them, is our major text. However, it has been supplemented by such additional material as is missing from this text.

Increase in the use of Islamic references

The first thing which strikes the researcher is that that Islamic references increase as Jinnah's demand for securing the rights of Muslims in India takes the form of a separate homeland over the years. In the first volume covering speeches from 1934 till 1937, when he was still emphasizing upon the rights of minorities, out of 178 speeches there is only one reference to Islamic law (0.56 per cent). It is about a law being adopted by the Viceroy's Council about adopting Muslim personal law instead of local customs and usage.

The law which was presented was worded as follows:

Notwithstanding any custom, usage or law to the contrary, in all questions regarding succession and so on the rule of decision in case where the parties are Muslims shall be the Muslim personal law.¹²

M.A. Jinnah said drop 'law'.¹³ Dr Ziauddin Ahmad said 'all the laws which are contrary to *shariat* should also be replaced'.¹⁴ In short, while Ziauddin Ahmad wanted to bring about what is called Islamization (making the *shariah* supreme law), Jinnah only wanted to empower women. In the years to come Jinnah's references to Islam grew as indicated below:

Vol.1: 1934-1937 (178 items) Islamic items 01 (0.56 per cent).

Vol.2 1938-1941 (179-450) = 272 total. Islamic items 17 (6.25 %)

Vol.3 1941-1945 (451-792) = 342 total. Islamic items 25 (7.10 %)

Vol.4 1946-1948 (793-1100) = 308 total. Islamic items 26 (8.44 %)

However, merely a quantitative measure does not tell us much about what Jinnah meant by these terms. His meaning emerges when the speeches are considered as a whole and the identity of the audience is also taken into account.

The extracts from the speeches are given in the following pages with relevant details: when and where was the speech delivered? what

¹¹ Z.H. Zaidi, (ed. and comp.), *Jinnah Papers*, 4 Vols. (Islamabad: Cabinet Division, National Archives, Government of Pakistan, 1990s).

¹² Khurshid Ahmad Khan Yusufi, *op.cit.*, Vol.1, p.617.

¹³ *Ibid.*, p.13.

¹⁴ *Ibid.*, p.621.

were the words used ? are there any qualifying words suggesting as to what the speaker probably meant by the words he used? and, as a result of all these considerations, the probable meaning of the speaker may be inferred by the reader. The author's remarks present the author's interpretation of the meaning and explain the reasons why such an interpretation has been preferred to others.

Thematic analysis of speeches of M.A. Jinnah

The speeches are analyzed with reference to seven themes. Those which mention Islam but do not fall into any of these categories are under the heading 'miscellaneous'.

1. Liberal Humanist values
2. Democracy versus theocracy
3. Emancipation of women
4. Pakistan's identity (is it an Islamic or a Muslim state?)
5. Conception of citizenship
6. Rule of Islamic law (*shariah*).
7. Anti-clergy.
8. Miscellaneous

By liberal-humanist values I mean the values of the European enlightenment: liberty, equality, fraternity etc. By democracy I mean the system of choosing one's leaders through elections and such other political institutions – political parties, constitution, adult suffrage, parliament etc—which were the distinguishing feature of western, and specifically British, political system. The term emancipation of women refers to considering them having the same rights as men and being equal to men in all respects. At number 5 is the crucial question of Pakistan's political identity i.e was it conceived as an Islamic state, a Muslim state (i.e one which has a majority Muslim population) or a secular state. This relates to the conception of citizenship i.e are all citizens equal in political and social and economic rights or does the state discriminate between them. Jinnah's conceptions of citizenship is contrasted to Abul Ala Maudoodi's to bring about the differences between them. In this context Maudoodi begins with certain rulings of medieval Muslim jurists concerning the dress code of *zimmi*s. They prescribed some distinguishing feature in their dress so that they could be distinguished from Muslims. Maudoodi does not insist upon this but he does try to defend the arguing that conquered peoples imitate the lifestyle of their conquerors and lose their identity and pride. These apparent restrictions

were meant to combat this problem.¹⁵ This touches upon the important question of what Jinnah means when he says, as he does at places given below, that there will be Islamic law in Pakistan. His anti-clergy remarks will also be considered to understand what his true world view was and what does the Islamic idiom really signify.

The text of the speeches with remarks by the author

The extracts of the speeches given below does not follow a chronological order as the arrangement is thematic. The important point to be remembered is that the references to Islam increased over the years. Let us not look at individual speeches to find out how they related to the themes given above.

1. Liberal humanist values

Excerpt	Remarks
<p>2.1 (1) Speech in reply to the address presented by the Muslims of Gaya, 1 January 1938.</p> <p>When we talk of Islam we take it as an all-<u>embracing</u> word. We do not mean any ill will. The foundation of our Islamic code is that we stand for liberty, equality and <u>fraternity</u>'.¹⁶</p>	<p>Jinnah's idea of Islam is that it enshrines enlightenment (liberal humanist) values of liberty, equality & fraternity.</p>
<p>2.4 (2) Speech at the meeting of the Students Union, Anglo-Arabic College, Delhi, Feb 3, 1938.</p> <p>[Jinnah rose to speak <u>amidst shouts of 'Allah-o- Akbar' & 'Islam Zindabad'</u>]</p>	

¹⁵ Syed Abul Ala Maududi, *Islami Riyasat* [Urdu: The Islamic State], 1940s Comp. Khurshid Ahmed (Lahore: Islamic Publications. 1st ed., 1972, this ed. 1977), p.485; for a discussion of the place of minorities in medieval Muslim societies see Michael Bonner, *Jihad in Islamic History: Doctrines and Practice* (Princeton and Oxford: Princeton University Press, 2006), pp.87-91.

¹⁶ Khurshid Ahmad Khan Yusufi, *op.cit.*, p.692.

<p>‘When we speak of Islam the average Hindu gets alarmed. I want free Islam in a free India. It means a code for which there is no parallel in the world. It is a complete system of jurisprudence, and social and economic fabric. It has got fundamental principles and has equality, fraternity and liberty on its basic principles’.¹⁷</p>	<p>Again he refers to <u>enlightenment</u> values.</p>
<p>2.14 (3) Message to Muslim University, Aligarh, Oct 18, 1940.</p> <p>‘..... we will shirk our responsibility in establishing ourselves as a progressive <u>nation</u> in this country.’¹⁸</p>	<p>Again ‘progressive’ i.e liberal ideas.</p>
<p>3.9 (4) Address to the Students of Ismail College, Bombay, Feb 01, 1943.</p> <p>‘which government’, he asked ‘claiming to be a civilized government can demolish our mosque, or which government is going to interfere with religion which is strictly a matter between God and man?’.¹⁹</p>	<p>He has a <u>secular</u>, modern view of religion i.e that it is a personal matter.</p>

¹⁷ *Ibid.*, p.719.

¹⁸ *Ibid.*, pp.1942-43.

¹⁹ *Ibid.*, p.1674.

4.19(5) Address to Bar Association, Karachi on the occasion of the Holy Prophet's birthday, Karachi, 25 Jan 1948.

‘The Prophet was a great teacher. He was a great lawgiver. He was great statesman and he was a Sovereign who ruled. No doubt, there are many people who do not quite appreciate when we talk of Islam’.

‘Islam is not only a set of rituals, traditions and spiritual doctrines. Islam is also a code for every Muslim which regulates his life and his conduct in even politics and economics and the like. It is based on the highest principles of honour, integrity, fairplay and justice for all. One God and the equality of manhood is one of the fundamental principles of Islam. In Islam there is no difference between man and man. The qualities of equality, liberty and fraternity are the fundamental principles of Islam’.

Thirteen hundred years ago he [The Prophet] laid the foundations of democracy’.²⁰

Emphasizes liberal ideas of liberty, equality and democracy referring to Islam.

²⁰ *Ibid.*, p.2670.

<p>4.22 (6) Address to officers and men of the 5th Heavy Ach Ach and 6th light Ach Ach regments, Malir, 21 Feb 1948.</p> <p>'Now you have to stand guard over the development and maintenance of Islamic democracy, Islamic social justice and the equality of manhood in our own native soil'.²¹</p>	<p>In support of liberal-humanist and democratic ideas.</p>
---	---

2. Democracy versus theocracy

Excerpt	Remarks
<p>3.2 (1) Speech at Muslim University Union, Aligarh, 02 Nov 1941.</p> <p>Refers to Mr. Munshi's statement that Pakistan would be a religious state and clarifies:</p> <p>'Is it not an incitement to the Sikhs and Hindu? Telling them that it would be a religious state excluding them from all power, is entirely untrue 'Islam stands for justice, equality, fairplay, toleration and even generosity to non-Muslim who may be under our protection. They are like brothers to us and would be the citizen for the State'.²²</p>	<p>Makes it clear that Pakistan will not be a 'religious state' Moreover, his idea of citizenship is different from Maududi's who does not give equal rights to non-Muslim citizen.</p>
<p>3.11(2) Presidential address delivered at the 30th session of the All India Muslim League, Delhi 24 April, 1943.</p> <p>'Ladies and Gentlemen, we learned</p>	<p>He supports Western</p>

²¹ *Ibid.*, p.2691.

²² *Ibid.*, p.1470.

<p>democracy 1,300 years ago. It is in our blood and it is far away from the Hindu society as are the <u>Arctic regions</u>' (p.1705).²³</p> <p>'A lot of mischief is created. Is it going to be an Islamic government? The constitution and the government will be what the people will decide.'²⁴</p>	<p>democracy but refers to the caliphate equating the concept of 'bait' (promising allegiance to a ruler) by a few with adult franchise. However, he never refers to any specific form or instance of 'bait' using his reference to history for emotive purposes. He does, however, refute the charge that the government of Pakistan will be Islamic.</p>
<p>3.22 (3) Message to the <u>Editor, Muslim Views Colombo (Ceylon)</u> on the occasion of the Holy Prophet's Birthday, Bombay, Feb 5, 1945.</p> <p>'Islam came in the world to establish democracy peace and justice'²⁵</p>	<p>Supports democracy. Expresses Liberal ideas in Islamic <u>idiom</u>.</p>
<p>3.23 (4) Telegram from Mr.Jinnah to Mr. Abdul Qayum, Bombay, 20 Aug 1945.</p> <p>'Serve selflessly the national cause of Muslim India and all that Islam stands for ----'.²⁶</p>	<p>For him Islam stands for <u>reviving</u> AIML.</p>
<p>3.24 (5) Interview to a representative</p>	

²³ *Ibid.*, p.1705.

²⁴ *Ibid.*, p.1720.

²⁵ *Ibid.*, p.1992.

²⁶ *Ibid.*, p.2043.

<p>of the <u>Associated Press</u> of America, clarifying various aspects of Pakistan, Bombay, Nov 8, 1945.</p> <p>‘Politically, Pakistan would be a democracy’.</p> <p>He then goes on to say that Hindus will have a hand in Government’.²⁷</p>	<p>Supports democracy and that non-Muslims would be part of the government. Maududi denies that anyone other than Muslims should run the state machinery.</p>
<p>4.2 (6) <u>Speech at the conclusion of the Muslim Legislators Convention</u>’ Delhi, 10 April, 1946.</p> <p>‘What we are fighting for? What are we aiming at? It is not theocracy, not for a theocratic state. Religion is there and religion is dear to us. All the worldly goods are nothing to us when we talk of religion; but there are other things which are very vital; our social life, our economic life, and without political power, how can you defend your faith and your economic life’.²⁸</p>	<p>Makes it clear that he does not have a theocracy in mind and that political power is necessary for meaningful and respectable existence.</p>
<p>4.5 (7) <u>Speech at a Meeting held under the auspices of the Muslim League Branch in Great Britain, London, 13 Dec, 1946.</u></p> <p>‘Democracy is in the blood of Musalmans, who look upon complete equality of manhood. I give you an example. Very often when I go to a mosque, my chauffeur stands side by side with me. Musalmans believe in fraternity, equality and liberty’.²⁹</p>	<p>Defends democracy but he is actually talking of egalitarianism without clarifying that this type of seeming equality is confined to some formal situations though it is the theoretical ideal given in</p>

²⁷ *Ibid.*, p.2098.

²⁸ *Ibid.*, p.2277.

²⁹ *Ibid.*, p.2482.

	the Islamic texts.
<p>4.8 (8) Speech at a reception given by the Memon Chamber of Commerce, Bombay, 27 Mar 1947.</p> <p>“Democracy is in the blood of the Musalman and we have stood for equality, fraternity and liberty and there is no chance of one man acting on his whims’.³⁰</p>	<p>Supports Western democracy and human rights but is completely wrong about the history of the Muslims as given for the Arabs (Tabari 9 vols) and others. All these histories show that the rulers were mostly authoritarian and there was no equality, fraternity or liberty in any medieval society.</p>
<p>4.9 (9) Statement on the congress demand for a free Pathan state, New Delhi, 28 June 1947.</p> <p>The Khan brothers say that Pathanistan will be based on ‘Islamic conception of democracy, equality and social justice’ <u>insinuating that</u> Pakistan will disregard the same. This is to ‘mislead’.³¹</p>	<p>He <u>implies</u> that Pakistan will be democratic.</p>
<p>4.20 (10) Speech at Shahi Darbar, Sibi, 14 Feb, 1948.</p> <p>Mentions ‘Principle of Muslim democracy’ and says: ‘It is my belief that our salvation lies in following the golden rules of conduct set for us by our great law giver, the Prophet of</p>	<p>Supports democracy but refers to Islam without specifying any specific laws or rules which will be followed.</p>

³⁰ *Ibid.*, p.2538.

³¹ *Ibid.*, p.2,580.

<p>Islam. Let us lay the foundation of our democracy on the basis of truly Islamic ideals and principles. Our Almighty has taught us that 'Our decisions in the affairs of the state shall be guided by discussions and consultations'.³²</p>	
<p>4.21 (11) Broadcast talk to the people of Australia 19 Feb 1948.</p> <p>'But make no mistake: Pakistan is not a theocracy or anything like it. Islam demands from us the tolerance of other creeds and we welcome in closest association with us all those who, of whatever creed, are themselves willing and ready to play their part as true and loyal citizens of Pakistan'.³³</p>	<p>Asserts clearly that Pakistan is not a theocracy. Emphasizes the modern conception of the equality of citizens.</p>
<p>4.22 (12) Address to officers and men of the 5th Heavy Ach Ach and 6th light <u>Ach Ach</u> regments, Malir, 21 Feb 1948.</p> <p>'Now you have to stand guard over the development and maintenance of Islamic democracy, Islamic social justice and the equality of manhood in our own native soil'.³⁴</p>	<p>In support of liberal-humanist and democratic ideas.</p>

³² *Ibid.*, p.2682.

³³ *Ibid.*, p.2688

³⁴ *Ibid.*, p.2691.

4.23 (13) Broadcast talk on Pakistan to the people of the United states of America, Karachi, 1948 February.

‘The constitution of Pakistan has yet to be framed by the constituent Assembly. I do not know what the ultimate shape of this constitution is going to be, but I am sure that it will be of a democratic type, embodying the essential principles of Islam. Today, they are as applicable in actual life as they were 1300 years ago.

Islam and its idealism have taught us democracy. It has taught equality of men, justice and fairplay to everybody.....

In any case Pakistan is not going to be a theocratic state — to be ruled by priests with a divine mission. We have many non-Muslims — Hindus, Christians, and Parsis — but they are all Pakistanis. They will enjoy the same rights and privileges as any other citizen and will play their rightful part in the affairs of Pakistan’.³⁵

Clarifies that Pakistan will not be theocracy, supports liberal-humanist values, reiterates the modern conception of equal citizenship for all but also refers to Islam in a general way.

³⁵ *Ibid.*, pp.2,692-93

5.2 (14) 'Protection to Minorities' 14 July 1947.

Q. 'Will Pakistan be a secular or theocratic state?

A: 'You are asking me a question that is absurd. I do not know what a theocratic state means'.

A correspondent suggested that a theocratic state meant a state where only people of a particular religion, for example, Muslims, could be full citizen and non-Muslims would not be full citizen.

A: 'Then it seems to me that what I have already said is like throwing water on a duck's back.

When you talk of democracy. I am afraid you have not studied Islam. We learned democracy thirteen centuries ago'.³⁶

He suggests Pakistan will be democratic. It will not be a theocracy.

3. Emancipation of women

Excerpt	Remarks
<p>2.4 (1) Speech at the meeting of the Students Union, Anglo-Arabic College, Delhi, Feb 3, 1938.</p> <p>[Jinnah rose to speak <u>amidst shouts of 'Allah-o- Akbar' & 'Islam Zindabad'</u>]</p> <p>'If I have freed you — and I feel I have — from the influence of some undesirable 'mullas' and 'maulvis', having been forced from their <u>clutches</u>, we must free and emancipate our women'.³⁷</p>	<p>He is in favour of the <u>emancipation</u> of women and against the clergy.</p>

³⁶ S.M. Burke, *op.cit.*, p.15.

³⁷ Khurshid Ahmad Khan Yusufi, *op.cit.*, p.716.

<p>2.13 (2) Address to the students of Jinnah Islamia College for Women, Lahore, 25 March, 1940. You young ladies are more <u>fortunate</u>.</p> <p>‘You young ladies are more fortunate than your mothers. You are being emancipated. I don’t mean that you should copy the west. But I do mean that man must be made to understand and made to feel that woman is his equal’³⁸</p>	<p>A liberal-humanist idea of gender equality.</p>
<p>2.5 (3) Speech delivered at the meeting of the Muslim University Union, Aligarh, 5 Feb 1938.</p> <p>‘ Having freed ourselves from the clutches of the British Government, the Congress, the <u>reactionaries</u> and so called Maulvies, may I appeal to the youth to emancipate our women.’³⁹</p>	<p>Again speaks of the emancipation of women and against the clergy.</p>
<p>2.5 (4) Presidential Address at the special session of the all India Muslim League, Calcutta, 17 Apr 1938.</p> <p>‘We have in no small degree removed the <u>overwhelming</u> influence of a certain section who used to pass off as Maulanas and Maulvis. We have made effects to take our women with us in our struggle’⁴⁰</p>	<p>Again speaks of the emancipation of women and against the clergy.</p>

³⁸ *Ibid.*, p.1190.

³⁹ *Ibid.*, p.727.

⁴⁰ *Ibid.*, p.785.

<p>3.8 (5) ‘Speech at the Jinnah Islamic College for Girls, Lahore, Mar 22, 1942’.</p> <p>‘If Muslim women support their men, as they did in the days of the Prophet of Islam, We should soon realize our goal’.⁴¹</p>	<p>He endorses the emancipation of women but seeks its justification in Islamic history without providing exact instances of the state of women in this history.</p>
<p>3.16 (6) Speech at the Meeting of the Muslim University Muslim League, Aligarh, Mar 10, 1944.</p> <p>‘You should take your women along with you as <u>comrades</u> in every sphere of life, avoiding the corrupt practices of western society’.⁴²</p>	<p>Supports the emancipation of women but distances himself from Western ways.</p>
<p>4.4 (7) Address to a meeting of Muslim girl students and ladies, New Delhi, 3 Nov 1946.</p> <p>Says that Islam gives the highest status to women and ‘I am a believer in the emancipation of women’. Adding ‘Go slow, do not forget the glorious heritage and traditions of Islam’.⁴³</p>	<p>Supports the emancipation of women but uses the idiom of Islam.</p>

⁴¹ *Ibid.*, p.1658.

⁴² *Ibid.*, p.1853.

⁴³ *Ibid.*, p.2445.

4. Pakistan's identity (is it an Islamic or a Muslim state?)

Excerpt	Remarks
<p>2.12 (1) Presidential speech in a meeting held on Iqbal Day, Lahore, 25th Mar, 1940.</p> <p>‘If I live to see the ideal of a Muslim state being achieved in India and I were then offered to make a choice between the works of Iqbal and the rulership of the Muslim state, I would prefer the former’.⁴⁴</p>	<p>He does not use the words ‘Islamic state’.</p>
<p>3.1 (2) Speech at the Flag Hoisting ceremony at Urdu Park, Delhi, 23 Oct 1941.</p> <p>‘I am confident that we will acquire a place in this land where we <u>can live honourably, according to Islamic tradition and culture, and it is in your hands</u>’.⁴⁵</p>	<p>No <u>mention</u> of an Islamic state or Islamic laws.</p>
<p>3.12 (3) Speech at the flag hoisting ceremony, Quetta, 2 July, 1943.</p> <p>‘You will realize the important part your <u>promise</u> will play in that Islamic kingdom’.⁴⁶ <i>The Morning News</i>, 04 July 1943.</p>	<p>The word ‘Kingdom’ is strange. It is never used anywhere else. Moreover, he calls it ‘Islamic’ not Muslim but fails to explain the difference.</p>

⁴⁴ *Ibid.*, p.1188.

⁴⁵ *Ibid.*, p.1457.

⁴⁶ *Ibid.*, p.138.

<p>3.17 (4) Speech at the Annual Conference of the Punjab Muslim Students Federation, Lahore, March 18, 1944.</p> <p>Pakistan was a <u>goal</u>. The world would find out that 'there was a Muslim state which would revive the past glories of Islam'.⁴⁷</p>	<p>Not an 'Islamic' state but a Muslim majority one.</p>
<p>4.15 (5) Message in a broadcast from the Pakistan Broadcasting Service, Lahore, 30 Oct, 1947.</p> <p>'<u>great</u> independent <u>sovereign</u> Muslim state'.⁴⁸</p> <p>'This biggest Muslim state in the world'⁴⁹</p>	<p>Does not call it 'Islamic'.</p>
<p>4.17 (6) Speech at the meeting of the All India Muslim League Council, Karachi, 14-15 Dec, 1947.</p> <p>Again calls Pakistan 'Muslim nation'.⁵⁰</p>	<p>Calls Pakistan a Muslim state not an Islamic state.</p>
<p>4.18 (7) Interview to Robert Stimson, correspondent of BBC, 19 Dec 1947.</p> <p>'The Muslims have only just won their own Muslim homeland'.⁵¹</p>	<p>Calls Pakistan a Muslim state not an Islamic state.</p>

⁴⁷ *Ibid.*, p.1857.

⁴⁸ *Ibid.*, p.2645.

⁴⁹ *Ibid.*, p.2646.

⁵⁰ *Ibid.*, p.2656.

⁵¹ *Ibid.*, p.2658.

<p>4.20 (8) Speech at Shahi Darbar, Sibi, 14 Feb, 1948.</p> <p>‘Under the authority of our new Muslim state of Pakistan’ <u>[First Shahi Darbar of Baluchistan is held]</u>.⁵²</p>	<p>Calls Pakistan a Muslim state not an Islamic state.</p>
<p>4.23 (9) Broadcast talk on Pakistan to the people of the United states of America, Karachi, 1948 February.</p> <p>‘Pakistan is the premier Islamic state’⁵³</p>	<p>One of the very few places where Pakistan is called an ‘Islamic’ rather than a ‘Muslim’ state.</p>
<p>4.26 (10) Speech on the occasion of the opening ceremony of the state Bank of Pakistan, Karachi, 01 July 1948.</p> <p>[Runs down the capitalism of the west].</p> <p>‘We must work our destiny in our own way and present to the world an economic system based on true Islamic concept of equality of manhood and social justice’.⁵⁴</p>	<p>Apparently refers to Islamic concepts of economic management but, in fact, never prohibits banking which is based on interest which was the demand of the <i>ulema</i>.</p>
<p>5.1 (11) ‘Muslim India will make its contribution to world peace’ 07 July 1947</p> <p>‘.... Their new greatest Muslim sovereign state in the world with complete Unity, discipline and faith’.⁵⁵</p>	<p>Calls Pakistan a ‘Muslim’ not an ‘Islamic’ state.</p>

⁵² *Ibid.*, p.2675.

⁵³ *Ibid.*, p.2692.

⁵⁴ *Ibid.*, p.2787.

⁵⁵ S.M. Burke, *op.cit.*, p.9.

<p>4.27 (12) Message to the Nation on the occasion of the First Anniversary of Pakistan, Karachi, 14 Aug 1948.</p> <p>‘It is one of the largest Muslim states in the world.....’⁵⁶</p>	<p>Calls Pakistan a ‘Muslim’ not an ‘Islamic’ state.</p>
<p>5. 4 (13) ‘Preserve peace for the sake of Pakistan’, 24 Aug 1947.</p> <p>‘..... So that before long it can justify its position as the largest Islamic state in the world’⁵⁷</p>	<p>Calls Pakistan an Islamic not a Muslim state here.</p>
<p>5.5 (14) Educational progress of Frontier province 18 Apr 1948.</p> <p>‘..... this mighty land has now been brought under a rule, which is Islamic, Muslim rule as a sovereign independent state’.⁵⁸</p>	<p>Calls it both ‘Islamic’ and ‘Muslim’</p>

5. Conception of citizenship

Excerpt	Remarks
<p>3.5 (1) Statement in reply to Mr. Gandhi’s appeal regarding an article published in the <i>Dawn</i>, New Delhi, March 11, 1942.</p> <p>‘The Hindus and other communities in Pakistan will be treated with justice and fairplay, <u>nay</u>, with generosity. It is so enjoined upon us by the highest authority — The Quran and Prophet’.⁵⁹</p>	<p>Refers to religion in support of his views to give equal rights to religious minorities which Maududi does not support.</p>

⁵⁶ Khurshid Ahmad Khan Yusufi, *op.cit.*, p.2790.

⁵⁷ S.M. Burke, *op.cit.*, p.40.

⁵⁸ *Ibid.*, p.201.

⁵⁹ Khurshid Ahmad Khan Yusufi, *op.cit.*, p.1538.

<p>3.7 (2) Speech at the annual seminar of the All India Muslim Students Federation, <u>Jullundur</u>, Nov 15, 1942.</p> <p>Non Muslims will 'be treated on a footing of equality of manhood not only according to our modern civilized government but because of our religious instructions which enjoins that every non-Muslim minority under a Muslim government shall be treated justly and fairly'.⁶⁰</p>	<p>Heritage — no laws etc.</p> <p>He refers to modern political ideas of equal citizenship in a modern state irrespective of faith but adds that Islamic political theory endorses these modern ideas.</p>
<p>3.9 (3) Address to the Students of Ismail College, Bombay, Feb 01, 1943.</p> <p>'which government', he asked 'claiming to be a civilized government can demolish our mosque, or which government is going to interfere with religion which is strictly a matter between God and man?'.⁶¹</p> <p>Again repeats that non-Muslims will be treated as a civilized government should treat them 'as it is <u>an injunction</u> in the Quran'.⁶²</p>	<p>He has a <u>secular</u>, modern view of religion i.e that it is a personal matter.</p> <p>He refers to modern political ideas of equal citizenship in a modern state irrespective of faith but refers to Islam without, however, quoting chapter and verse.</p>

⁶⁰ *Ibid.*, p.1647.

⁶¹ *Ibid.*, p.1674.

⁶² *Ibid.*

<p>3.18 (4) Speech at the Concluding Session of the Punjab Muslim Students Federation conference, Lahore, Mar 19, 1944.</p> <p>‘Our bedrock and sheet-anchor is Islam. There is no question even of Shias and Sunnis’.⁶³</p> <p>In the same speech he warns communities:</p> <p>‘Islam is our guide and a complete code for our life. We don’t want any red or yellow flag. We don’t want any isms, <u>socialism</u>, communism, or national socialism’.⁶⁴</p>	<p>This is a modern concept of equality of citizenship which the ulema have not accepted. They do distinguish in citizenship according to faith.</p>
<p>4.8 (5) Speech at a reception given by the Memon Chamber of Commerce, Bombay, 27 Mar 1947.</p> <p>‘We <u>assure</u> the Hindus that in Pakistan the minorities will be treated justly, fairly and generously. The whole history of Islam has shown that. The whole teaching of Islam is in that direction’.⁶⁵</p>	<p>Repeats this very often but his idea is that of modern democratic notions of citizenship and he shows no awareness of the status of <i>zimmi</i>s which Maududi does.</p>
<p>4.10 (6) Presidential Address to the Constituent Assembly of Pakistan, Karachi, 11 Aug 1947.</p> <p>This begins: ‘You are free, you are free to go your temples, you are free to go to your temples, you are free to</p>	<p>It is not a <i>volte face</i> as made out to be. He always said that he was</p>

⁶³ *Ibid.*, p.1859.

⁶⁴ *Ibid.*, p.1861.

⁶⁵ *Ibid.*, p.2538.

<p>go to your mosques or to any other places of worship in this State of Pakistan ‘...You may belong to any caste or <u>creed</u> — that has nothing to do with the business of the State’.⁶⁶</p> <p>‘In the course of time Hindus would cease to be Hindus and Muslims would cease to be Muslims, not in the religious sense, because that is the personal faith of each individual, but in the political <u>sense</u> as citizens of the state.’⁶⁷</p>	<p>trying to secure rights for all minorities, especially the Muslims of India. When Pakistan was achieved the Hindus and Christians were minorities in the new state and he emphasized their rights as citizens. He had modern, democratic ideas of citizenship quite at variance with the ideas of the <i>ulema</i>.</p>
<p>4.21 (7) Broadcast talk to the people of Australia 19 Feb 1948.</p> <p>‘But make no mistake: Pakistan is not a theocracy or anything like it. Islam demands from us the tolerance of other creeds and we welcome in closest association with us all those who, of whatever creed, are themselves willing and ready to play their part as true and loyal citizens of Pakistan’.⁶⁸</p>	<p>Asserts clearly that Pakistan is not a theocracy. Emphasizes the modern conception of the equality of citizens.</p>
<p>4.23 (8) Broadcast talk on Pakistan to the people of the United States of America, Karachi, 1948 February.</p> <p>We have many non-Muslims — Hindus, Christians, and Parsis — but they are all Pakistanis. They will enjoy the same rights and privileges as any other citizen and will play their rightful part in the affairs of Pakistan’.⁶⁹</p>	<p>Reiterates the modern conception of equal citizenship for all but also refers to Islam in a general way.</p>

⁶⁶ *Ibid.*, p.2604.

⁶⁷ *Ibid.*, p.2605.

⁶⁸ *Ibid.*, p.2688.

⁶⁹ *Ibid.*, pp.2692-93.

6. Rule of Islamic law (*shariah*)

Excerpt	Remarks
<p>2.15 (1) Speech at a public meeting, Ahmadabad, Dec 27, 1940.</p> <p>[Let us in the minority provinces] 'face our fate, but free the Muslim Majority provinces to live and form their own government in independent states in accordance with Islamic Laws'.⁷⁰</p>	<p>He says 'Islamic Laws' here but is in fact talking of Muslim rule in the provinces in which they form majorities. This is about political power and not about Islamic political ideology.</p>
<p>3.6 (2) Speech at a meeting held under the Auspices of Muslim University Union, Aligarh, Nov 2, 1942.</p> <p>'Let me live according to my history in the light of Islam, my tradition, culture and language, and you do the same in your zones'.⁷¹</p> <p>In the same speech 'If you want to live and uphold all that is dear to you, the previous heritage of Islam'.⁷²</p>	<p>Here 'light of Islam' is vague. No definite rules of the <i>Sharia</i> are <u>promised</u>.</p> <p>He talks rhetorically of 'heritage' but lays down no definite set of rules.</p>
<p>3.13 (3) Message to the Muslims of India, on <i>Eid-ul-Fitr</i>, Bombay, Sep 30, 1943.</p> <p>'Let us prove <u>worthy</u> of it and bring about true renaissance of</p>	

⁷⁰ *Ibid.*, p.1298.

⁷¹ *Ibid.*, p.1629.

⁷² *Ibid.*, p.1631.

<p>Islam and revive its glory and splendour'.⁷³ <i>Morning News</i> 01 Oct 1943.</p> <p><u>Interview</u> given to Mr. Beverley Nichols, Bombay, Dec 18, 1943. 'You must remember that Islam is not <u>merely</u> a religious <u>doctrine</u> but a <u>realistic</u> and practical code of conduct'.</p> <p>He goes on to Muslim <u>art, architecture and music</u> too.⁷⁴</p> <p>Concluding speech at the Karachi session of the All India Muslim League, Karachi, Dec. 26, 1943.</p> <p>'What was <u>the bedrock and sheet-anchor of the community</u>, asked Mr Jinnah. : Islam', he said, and added: 'It is the Great Book, Quran, that is the sheet-anchor of Muslim India'.⁷⁵ He goes on to talk of unity.</p>	<p>All these concepts are left undefined. There is no mention of an Islamic state as described by Maududi.</p> <p>His words are close to Maududi but meaning is more like 'culture'. <u>Music</u> is part of culture too. However, Maudoodi means <i>sharia</i> law etc.</p> <p>He is trying to mobilize a pressure group in the form of a Muslim 'nation' and uses religion as the symbol of identity.</p>
<p>Speech before the Mashaiks and Pir Sahib of Manki Sharif, 24 Nov 1945.</p> <p>Let me be clear that Muslims believe in one God, one Prophet, Holy Quran and Islamic principles are the constitution we inherited from Holy Prophet (PBUH) thirteen centuries before, so there will be nothing but only Quranic</p>	<p>The phrase 'Quranic principles' remains subject to varying interpretations and does not commit the speaker to the interpretations of the spiritual leaders who were</p>

⁷³ *Ibid.*, p.1766.

⁷⁴ *Ibid.*, p.1791.

⁷⁵ *Ibid.*, p.1821.

<p>principles will be our Constitution. In order to achieve our goal you should vote in favour of Muslim League candidates.</p>	<p>the audience.</p>
<p>4.1 (4) Speech at a large Ladies Meeting, Shillong, 04 March, 1946.</p> <p>Speaking of <u>evils</u> in Muslim society because of contact with Hindus</p> <p>‘Let us go back to our Holy Book, the Quran. Let us revert to the Hadis and the great traditions of Islam which have everything in them for our guidance. If we correctly interpret them and follow our great Holy Book, The Quran’.⁷⁶</p>	<p>He appears to exhort Muslims to follow the fundamental texts of the faith. However, he offers no precise guidance as to how they are to be interpreted. It should also be added that fundamentalist interpreters of Islam were never quoted by him.</p>
<p>4.7 (5) Speech at a meeting of the <u>Sind</u> provincial Muslim League Council, Karachi, 23 Feb 1947.</p> <p>‘All this we can do and much more can we achieve, if only we do not astray from the path laid down by the greatest Prophet – Muhammad [PBUH]. You must remember that we lost our position in the world, because for some reason or other, could not follow in his foot steps’.⁷⁷</p>	<p>This appeal is very similar to that of the Islamic fundamentalists and the <i>ulema</i> but Jinnah gives no specific policies whereas the former did.</p>

⁷⁶ *Ibid.*, p.2220.

⁷⁷ *Ibid.*, p.2520.

<p>4.9 (6) Statement on the congress demand for a free Pathan state, New Delhi, 28 June 1947.</p> <p>The Khan bothers raised the cry that Pakistan ‘will disregard the fundamental principles of the ‘shariat’ and the Quranic Laws’. He goes on to say that ‘We have not been only proud of our great and Holy Book the Quran, but we have adhered to all fundamentals all these ages...’.⁷⁸</p>	<p>Implies that Pakistan will be governed by Islamic laws but gives no specifics and also promises Western conceptions of equal citizenship for all.</p>
<p>4.20 (7) Speech at Shahi Darbar, Sibi, 14 Feb, 1948.</p> <p>Mentions ‘Principle of Muslim democracy’ and says: ‘It is my belief that our salvation lies in following the golden rules of conduct set for us by our great law giver, the Prophet of Islam. Let us lay the foundation of our democracy on the basis of truly Islamic ideals and principles our Almighty has taught us that ‘Our decisions in the affairs of the state shall be guided by discussions and consultations’.⁷⁹</p>	<p>Supports democracy but refers to Islam without specifying any specific laws or rules which will be followed.</p>

⁷⁸ *Ibid.*, p.2581.

⁷⁹ *Ibid.*, p.2682.

7. Anti-Clergy

Excerpt	Remarks
<p>2.4 (1) Speech at the meeting of the Students Union, Anglo-Arabic College, Delhi, Feb 3, 1938.</p> <p>[Jinnah rose to speak <u>amidst</u> shouts of ‘ Allah-o- Akbar’ & ‘Islam Zindabad’]</p> <p>‘If I have freed you-- and I feel I have --from the influence of some undesirable ‘mullas’ and ‘maulvis’, having been forced from their <u>clutches</u>, we must free and emancipate our women’.⁸⁰</p>	<p>He speaks against the clergy while talking about the emancipation of women.</p>
<p>2.5 (2) Speech delivered at the meeting of the Muslim University Union, Aligarh, 5 Feb 1938.</p> <p>[The ML] has certainly freed you from that undesirable elements of Maulvis and Maulanas’.⁸¹</p> <p>.....</p> <p>.....</p> <p>‘ Having freed ourselves from the clutches of the British Government, the Congress, the <u>reactionaries</u> and so called Maulvies, may I appeal to the youth to emancipate our women.’⁸²</p>	<p>Again speaks of the emancipation of women and against the clergy.</p>

⁸⁰ *Ibid.*, p.716.

⁸¹ *Ibid.*, p.727.

⁸² *Ibid.*

<p>2.6 (3) Presidential Address at the special session of the all India Muslim League, Calcutta, 17 Apr 1938.</p> <p>‘We have in no small degree removed the <u>overwhelming</u> influence of a certain section who used to pass off as Maulanas and Maulvis. We have made effects to take our women with us in our struggle’⁸³</p>	<p>Again speaks of the emancipation of women and against the clergy.</p>
<p>2.15 (4) Presidential Address delivered at the special Pakistan Session of the Punjab Muslim Students Federation, Lahore, March 2, 1941.</p> <p>‘I am not a learned Maulana or Maulvi. Nor do I claim to be learned in theology. But I also know a little of my faith and I am a humble and proud follower of my faith’.⁸⁴</p> <p>[Adds that dividing India is not against Islam].</p>	<p>Does not claim specialized knowledge of religion but claims to have the authority to understand and even interpret it.</p>
<p>2.17 (5) Speech at Iqbal Day Meeting Lahore, 3rd March, 1941.</p> <p>‘He [Iqbal] was the greatest interpreter of Islam in modern times’.⁸⁵</p>	<p><u>This is incorrect and obviously meant to serve the occasion as others, such</u></p>

⁸³ *Ibid.*, p.785.

⁸⁴ *Ibid.*, p.1334.

⁸⁵ *Ibid.*, p.1340.

	as <u>Maududi, Hussain Ahmad Madani and Ashraf Ali Thanvi</u> , had a <u>greater claim to be given this status</u> in India. As for the rest of the world there were many people who deserved that distinction.
<p>3.4 (6) Message to the Annual session of the Punjab Muslim Students Federation to be held at Rawalpindi on Mar 7 and 8, New Delhi, Feb 27, 1942.</p> <p>‘We have in no small degree removed the unwholesome influence and fear of a certain section who used to pass off as Maulanas and Maulvies. We have made efforts to take our women with us in <u>our</u> struggle’⁸⁶</p>	Again condemns the clergy while upholding the liberal-humanist value of the emancipation of women.

8. Miscellaneous

Excerpt	Remarks
<p>2.2 (1) Speech at a public Meeting hold in Jama Mosque, Gaya, 02 Jan, 1938.</p> <p>‘Thirteen hundred years ago, our Prophet (Peace be Upon Him) preached his faith when there was no Muslim’ [spoke in Urdu].⁸⁷</p>	Political speech <u>exhorting</u> Muslims to unite. Religious symbols were used but there is no definite political <u>significance</u> of it.

⁸⁶ *Ibid.*, p.1532.

⁸⁷ *Ibid.*, pp.699-700.

<p>2.3 (2) Speech in reply to an address of welcome presented by the <u>Momin Ansars Jamat, Tantibagh, Calcutta, 6 Jan 1938.</u></p> <p>Said he was proud to belong to the Muslim community & that the Prophet brought about a symbolic revolution single handedly.⁸⁸</p>	<p>Political speech <u>exhorting</u> Muslims to unite. Religious symbols were used but there is no definite political <u>significance</u> of it.</p>
<p>2.8 (3) ‘Speech at the Annual Dinner of the old Boys Association of the Osmania University, Hyderabad, Deccan, 28 Sept 1939.</p> <p>‘I say to every Mussalman that Islam <u>expects</u> you, one and all to do your <u>duty and stand by</u> your people as one nation’.</p>	<p>Brings the western concept of nation as an Islamic imperative to create unity.</p>
<p>2.10 (4) Article on the Constitutional <u>Maladies</u> of India sent at special request of ‘Time and Tide’, London, February 23, 1940’.</p> <p>‘ In Hinduism and Islam, for both these religion are definite social codes which govern not so much man’s relation with his God as man’s relation with his neighbour’.⁸⁹</p> <p>[This is repeated in the presidential address at the 27th</p>	<p>Interprets religion as culture giving his two nation theory.</p>

⁸⁸ *Ibid.*, pp.701-2.

⁸⁹ *Ibid.*, p.1147.

session of the AIML, March 22, 1940, Lahore.	
2.11 (5) Speech delivered at the Muslim University Union, Aligarh, March 6, 1940. 'So far as I have understood Islam, it does not advocate a democracy which would allow the majority of non Muslims to decide the fate of the Muslims'. ⁹⁰	He rejects democracy in India but his reasons are political. He and Maudoodi both want Muslim domination but for different reasons.
3.3(6) Speech at the Concluding Session of the All India Muslim Students' Federation, Nagpur, Dec 28, 1941. He said as long as ML members 'were <u>imbued</u> with the true spirit of Islam and worked <u>harmoniously</u> for the cause of Muslim India.' ⁹¹	He equates the 'Spirit of Islam' as working for Pakistan. This is a political use of the idiom of Islam.
3.10 (7) Message on Iqbal day, Lahore, 20 Mar 1943. 'Islam is the code which has prescribed easy ways and means for that <u>realisation</u> '. (P.)????	By realization he means 'of self' (<i>khudi</i>). This is vague and is meant for the occasion.
3.19 (8) Speech at a meeting of the Students of the Islamia College for Women, Lahore, Mar 26, 1944. 'He said that many impurities and un-Islamic things had <u>crept</u> into	To emphasize unity and to distance himself from the

⁹⁰ *Ibid.*, p.1159.

⁹¹ *Ibid.*, p.1502.

the Muslim society, and it was the task of Muslim educational institutions to educate their children on right lines with a view to enabling them to live the Islamic life'. ⁹²	left. He asks for teaching to live the 'Islamic life' but leaves it undefined.
3.20(9) Address to the members of the League Planning Committee, New Delhi, Nov 5, 1944. 'Our idea should not be capitalistic but Islamic'. ⁹³	 Not defined precisely.
3.21 (10) Message on 'Iqbal Day', being celebrated at Lahore, New Delhi, Dec 8, 1944. 'He had an unflinching faith in Islamic principles, and success in life meant to him the realization of one's 'self', and to achieve this end the only means was to follow the teachings of Islam'. ⁹⁴	 Precisely which teachings one is to follow is left undefined.
3.25(11) Address to the Students of Islamia College, Peshawar, 25 Nov 1945. Talks of planning 'on proper, sound and essentially Islamic basis'. ⁹⁵	 The descriptive term 'Islamic' is left unexplained.
4.6(12) Interview to the	

⁹² *Ibid.*, p.1875.

⁹³ *Ibid.*, p.1961.

⁹⁴ *Ibid.*, p.1967.

⁹⁵ *Ibid.*, p.2120.

<p>Egyptian State Broadcasting service, Cairo, Dec 18, 1946'.</p> <p>'In the Pakistan zone we will be able to safeguard the heritage of Islam and all the glory of our culture and civilization, without any interference from others'.⁹⁶</p>	<p>Refers to Islam as heritage but remains vague about specifics.</p>
<p>4.11 (13) Eid <u>Message</u> to the Nation, Karachi 18 Aug, 1947.</p> <p>'Eid will <u>usher</u> in, I hope, a new era of prosperity and will mark the onward march of renaissance of Islamic culture and ideals'.⁹⁷</p> <p>Reply to the Civic Address presented by the Karachi Municipal Corporation, <u>Karachi</u>, 25 Aug 1947.</p> <p>'It should be our aim not only to remove want and fear of all <u>types</u>, but secure liberty, fraternity and equality as enjoined upon us by Islam'.⁹⁸</p>	<p>Remarks about Islamic culture, give no specifics about the policies or laws to be followed.</p> <p>Basically presents liberal-humanist ideas but adds Islam to them.</p>
<p>4.13(14) Address to civil, Naval, Military and Air force officers of the Pakistan Government, Karachi, 11 Oct 1947.</p> <p>'The idea was that we should have a state in which we could live and breathe as free men and which we could develop</p>	<p>Basically presents liberal-humanist ideas but adds Islamic social justice to them.</p>

⁹⁶ *Ibid.*, p.2492.

⁹⁷ *Ibid.*, p.2612.

⁹⁸ *Ibid.*, pp.2615-16.

according to our lights and culture and where principles of Islamic social justice could find free play'. ⁹⁹	
4.14 (15) Speech at a rally at the University stadium, Lahore, 30 Oct 1947. [Talking about the killings] 'If we take our inspiration and guidance from the Holy Quran, the final <u>victory</u> , I once again say, will be ours'. ¹⁰⁰	Again calls for an apparently fundamentalist assertion of faith but specifies no policies or rules.
4.16 (16) Message to the Armed Forces, security Guard and the people of Rawalpindi, Karachi, 8 Nov 1947. 'I am sure we will march forward through them successfully with the honour and prestige of Pakistan higher than <u>ever</u> and upholding the high traditions of Islam and our national honour'. ¹⁰¹	These 'traditions' are not specified nor is it clear whether they pertain to values based upon religious texts or merely history. If the latter, which history?
4.24 (17) Speech at the Public Reception, Chittagong, 26 march 1948. 'Pakistan should be based as same foundation of social justice and Islamic socialism with emphasis equality and brotherhood of Man'. ¹⁰²	Talks of equality and socialism but prefaces it by using 'Islam'.
4.25 (18) Address to the Tribal	

⁹⁹ *Ibid.*, p.2624.

¹⁰⁰ *Ibid.*, p.2642.

¹⁰¹ *Ibid.*, p.2650.

¹⁰² *Ibid.*, p.2733.

<p>Jirga at Government House, Peshawar, 17 April 1948.</p> <p>‘We Musalmans believe in one God, one Book — The Holy Quran—and one Prophet. So we must stand united as one nation’.¹⁰³</p>	<p>Uses Islam for unity i.e. nation building.</p>
---	---

Discussion

Besides the speeches given above, there is a letter which Jinnah wrote to Amin-ul-Hasanat, the Pir of Manki, on 18 November 1945. The context in which this letter was written needs to be taken into account. The province of NWFP (now called Khyber Pakhtunkwa) was under the influence of the Khan brothers (Khan Abdul Ghaffar Khan and Dr Khan Sahib). The Pir Sahib of Manki was an influential religious leader and Jinnah rightly guessed that if he supported the cause of Pakistan, the Khan brothers’ could be neutralized.¹⁰⁴ However, the Pir demanded that the *sharia* should be imposed once Pakistan was achieved.¹⁰⁵ It was in response to this demand that Jinnah wrote his letter. He begins by saying that Pakistan will consist of 75 per cent Muslims and the government will be of Muslims. From this premise he reaches the following conclusion:

Therefore, there need be no apprehension that the constitution Making Body which will be composed of overwhelming majority of Muslims can ever establish any constitution for Pakistan other than one based on Islamic ideals, nor can the government of Pakistan when it comes into being act contrary to Islamic ideals and principles (Original letter in the possession of the son of the Pir of Manki, Nabi-ul Amin).¹⁰⁶

¹⁰³ *Ibid.*, p.2759.

¹⁰⁴ For details of the Pir of Manki see: Wiqar Ali Shah, *Pir Sahib Manki Syed Amin-ul-Hasanat aur unki siyasi jad-o-Jahad* [Urdu: The Pir of Manki and his political struggle] (Islamabad: National Institute of Historical and Cultural Studies, Quaid-i-Azam University, 1990).

¹⁰⁵ Israj Khan and Toheeda Begum, ‘Quaid-e-Azam Muhamamd Ali Jinnah and Pir Amin-ul-Hasanat of Manki Sharif’, *Abasyn Journal of Social Sciences* 4:2 (2012), pp.401.

¹⁰⁶ Extract quoted from; *Ibid.*, p.402.

It is clear from the above extract that, Jinnah remained evasive as to the facts. He assumes that Muslims would enforce the *Sharia* as defined by the Pir which, of course, never happened. On 24 November 1945, when Jinnah addressed a conference of Pirs and Mashaikhs in the Frontier, a draft of an accord was placed before him stating that every law would be vetted first by religious authorities before being sent to the constituent assembly. It was on this occasion that Jinnah delivered the speech which constitutes his most categorical statement about Islamic polity. As quoted earlier, he stated that, 'Quranic principles will be our constitution'.¹⁰⁷ But the next sentence was an appeal for votes in favour of Pakistan. The fact that the speech was delivered in an assembly of spiritual leaders; that it was meant to persuade them to use their influence for a positive vote for Pakistan; suggest that this appeal to religious sentiment was an election strategy. However, even here the term 'Quranic principles' remains ambiguous. The spiritual leaders, *ulema*, politicians and secular intellectuals could (and did) interpret them differently.

In general, while Jinnah used the idiom of Islam in his speeches, he does not mean by this idiom what the *ulema* mean. For instance, when he talks of democracy he refers to Islam having taught democracy to Muslims but he does not mention that the system of choosing a ruler was *bait* i.e the expression of allegiance to a person by leading Muslim males and not adult franchise of both men and women.¹⁰⁸ Moreover, a caliph was a spiritual leader too while a democratically elected prime minister or president is not. Moreover, a caliph could not be removed from power unless he deviated from the faith while a democratically elected executive was removed by the peoples' votes. All these details Jinnah ignored when he used the word 'democracy'. Even so, he kept repeating that Pakistan would not be a theocracy and that the constitution would be chosen by the peoples' representatives and that he did not know exactly what it would be. In short, he never said Pakistan would be an Islamic state ruled by the *Shariah* as interpreted by learned *ulema*. Indeed, he made many anti-clergy remarks questioning the authority of those whom he belittled as '*mullas*', '*maulvis*' and '*maulanas*'. Apparently Jinnah, like many educated Muslims of that period, believed in liberal-humanist

¹⁰⁷ *Ibid.*, p.404.

¹⁰⁸ Jafar bin Mohammad bin Jaraer al-Tabari (d.310 Hijri), *Tarikh-e-Tabari: Tarikh al-Umam val Muluk*. Trans. from Arabic to Urdu by Syed Mohammad Ibrahim and Habib ur Rahman Siddiqui (Karachi: Nafees Academy, 1977).

ideas, especially in women's emancipation and equal rights of citizenship for all citizens irrespective of their religion or sect. This again, is something which, among others, Maulana Maududi refuted on the grounds that in an Islamic state only Muslims could occupy the crucial posts.¹⁰⁹

In short, taking the whole corpus of Jinnah's statements one comes to the conclusion that he wanted to secure the rights of Indian Muslims which, in his opinion, were not safe in India as it would be Hindu-dominated. First, he tried to secure these rights in a united India and, then, demanded Muslim rule in provinces where there were Muslim majorities. In the process of mobilizing the Muslim masses to support his demand for what came to be known as Pakistan, he used the symbol of Islam. But he interpreted his Islamic idiom without giving exact details of the theological sources which the *ulema* did. This made him support his own liberal-humanist ideas—democracy, women's emancipation, equal citizenship for all—while using the language of Islam. The question is did Jinnah actually understand that the terms he used had different meanings in Islamic literature? Or, did he think that he understood the meanings of these terms better than the *ulema* whose authority he did not need? In other words, did he use the Islamic terms as a politician in order to appeal emotionally to the people without actually meaning what he said. Or, he actually believed what he said but simply did not have the knowledge of Islam to know that what he said with such certitude could have different interpretations among the specialists of religion? Whatever the truth may be, it is a fact that Jinnah was a charismatic leader as Sikandar Hayat argues in a book-length study.¹¹⁰ In the case of such people words take on lives of their own. Jinnah's references to Islam created the illusion among many educated Pakistanis that it is possible to call Pakistan an Islamic state merely on the strength of one's own interpretation of Islam without knowing Arabic or even reading the canonical sources of Islam in translation. Whether this was bluff or merely ignorance, this provided ground to the Islamists to press for the implementation of Islam which seemed to have been promised. For, if it is a question of interpretation of Arabic sources, the claim of the Islamists that they understand these sources better than the average person, educated in secular schools, can hardly be disputed forever.

¹⁰⁹ Syed Abul Ala Maududi, *op.cit.*, p.333.

¹¹⁰ Sikandar Hayat, *The Charismatic Leader: Quaid-i-Azam Mohammad Ali Jinnah and the Creation of Pakistan* (Karachi: Oxford University Press, 2009).

Conclusion

The debate between the liberals and the Islamists (both terms are being used with reference to Pakistan) will not end no matter how many such analyses are presented. Interpretations are not a rational matter; they are extra-rational in nature and one's beliefs, illusions, fantasies infuse them with emotion. However, there are students of Pakistan as a field of study who do not have an extra-rational investment in the answer as an article of faith, there is a possibility that they will be facilitated in their study because the relevant speeches have been collected in one place for the first time. The idea is not to win a debate but to enable people to debate the issue with knowledge and with references to texts.

Ultimately, no matter what Jinnah might have thought, it is for the people of Pakistan to determine what type of state they want Pakistan to be. In a sense then, this article is an account of the past, not necessarily a map for the future.