

Book Reviews

Khwaja Razi Haider, *Quaid-i-Azam kay Bahattar Saal (Quaid-i-Azam's seventy-two years, 1876-1948)*, published by Fiction House, Lahore, 2014, pp.328, price, Rs.700/-.

The birth centennial celebrations of Quaid-i-Azam Mohammad Ali Jinnah in 1976 generated widespread academic interest in the life and times of the founder of Pakistan both at home and abroad. In Pakistan, scholarly works were published by the Government of Pakistan (under the auspices of the National Book Foundation) as well as by individual authors interested in researching unexplored aspects of Jinnah's life. The book under review falls in the latter category. The author, Khwaja Razi Haider, is an established historian and former director of the Quaid-i-Azam Academy—the premier research institution established during the centenary year. Besides numerous Urdu works, Razi Haider is the author of the ground-breaking biography of Quaid-i-Azam's illustrious wife Ruttie Jinnah, in English, which was published by the Oxford University Press in 1995. The first edition of the present book was published in 1976 and the third revised edition in 2014.

As the title suggests, the book covers life and times of Jinnah in chronological order with brief chapters for each year. Despite this physical separation, the narrative is skillfully integrated in terms of a central theme that runs through all the chapters. This unique structure gives the reader an opportunity to see the gradual evolution of Jinnah's political career. It ensures that no significant event is overlooked. The book is detail-oriented, a style that is a hallmark of Razi Haider's research.

The book has a broad scope. It narrates not just Jinnah's personal and political life but also encompasses political developments that affected the South Asian subcontinent since the last quarter of the 19th century: right through the Partition of Bengal, annual sessions of the Indian National Congress, political contribution of Mohammad Ali Jauhar and his Caliphate movement in the wake of the fall of the

Ottoman empire, the Roundtable Conference between the British government and Indian leaders, and a host of other significant topics.

The narrative is highly readable and engaging. There are plenty of interesting issues and facts, both major and minor, throughout the book that keep the reader's attention. In the pages of the book, one finds such interesting facts that the Indian independence activist and romantic poet Fazlul-Hasan Hasrat Mohani had earned his bachelor's degree from Aligarh University; that the essayist and novelist Abdul Haleem Sharar had presented the idea of partition of India in 1890; and that the great scholar Syed Suleman Nadvi had written a poem on Jinnah (some verses are quoted in the book).

A remarkable feature of this work is the number of sources, both in English and Urdu, that have gone into its making. Razi Haider has done extensive research in the course of writing this book. He corroborates facts and even points out if sources disagree. As a result, the research work that has come out is highly informative and authoritative. The book is comprehensive in its coverage and will continue to serve as a useful reference guide for any research undertaking on the struggle for the creation of Pakistan.

History & Sociology
Claflin University, USA

Mohammad Yousuf

Dr Arifa Farid, *Liberalism and Islam*, published by BCC&T Press, Karachi, 2016, pp.231, price, Rs.600/-.

The book under review stands as masterpiece on the subject. Dr Arifa, being a professor of philosophy, has introduced the concept of liberalism in western and American philosophy in detail, prior to that she talks about the development of this concept throughout the intellectual history of mankind.

The second chapter of the book deals with the concepts of neo liberalism and liberalism in postmodern discourse. Though these two terms have been used interchangeably by Rawls and others, Dr. Arifa has dealt with the delicate difference between the two and its implications in history of philosophy and destiny of the nations and cultures. In this case, she has explained five types of neo liberalisms that emerged in the West:

- 1) Cultural neo liberalism
- 2) Political or ideological neo liberalism
- 3) Neo liberalism as a phenomenon of international relations

- 4) Critical neo liberalism
- 5) Philosophical basis of neo liberalism

She has written on these issues scholarly and with philosophical depth. Her discourse on neo liberalism and Islam is worth reading and an invaluable contribution on this topic.

Chapter 3 may be taken as continuation of the previous chapter. It elaborates the difference between dialect and rhetoric as philosophical terms and their role, throughout the intellectual history, for solving different deep-rooted problems and their practical impact on political and social aspects of Muslim countries. The most important aspects are political in nature where we can see world powers playing their role in shaping Muslim's 'thinking paradigm'.

Fourth chapter of the book she has devoted to Bernard Lewis's semantic book 'What went Wrong' which hit the market in 2002. Since Lewis is a well-known scholar on the Muslim World, especially on Middle East, this book was taken very seriously by both Muslims and non-Muslims. In this book and in another *The Crisis of Islam*, he has tried to explain Muslim political psychology, which resulted in the fall of Muslim civilization and their 'political frustration' that caused 9/11 and its aftermaths. In this chapter, Dr Arifa has amply dealt with this book and its impact on Muslim World. In her critical appreciation of this book, she appears as the best academician of our country.

Chapter 5 is very important in the sense that it provides an overall view of the development of secularism, a misunderstood concept in the Islamic world, and its historical background. It also talks about important thinkers who took part in shaping the concept of secularism in Christian-West. In this article, the author has come up with Allama Iqbal's views on and against western secularism when looked it from Islamic lense. This chapter provides a deep insight in to the issue.

The events of 9/11 turned the pages of history so quickly and harshly that resulted in 'great distortion' of the face of Muslims in the history. The passive pace of Interfaith Dialogue took speed and the world felt a pressing need for more and more dialogue between 'Civilizations'. The chapter 6 focuses on the background of 'Interfaith Dialogue' and room for pro-existence of different communities in a 'pluralistic world'. This article contains very thought provoking material on this subject.

The author in chapter 7, has identified the factors, which are playing their role in distortion of moral values and very web and woof of Muslim culture in Pakistan. The moral condition of our society is deteriorating day by day and the factors leading to it are becoming stronger on daily basis. In order to understand its devastating effects on

the society, it is mandatory to look into this issue very objectively. The learned author has spoken on this problem in a very articulate way.

The Chapter 8 very eloquently speaks about modern trends in western and Pakistanian philosophy. Being a professor of philosophy, she deserves to talk on current philosophical trends all over the world. In this brief article, as the subject is very vast, she has done justice to it.

Traditional Muslim thought divides the world into two poles: Dar al-Islam and dar al-Harb, which means the former is world of Islam and the latter is the world of war against Islam. Muslims living in European and American diaspora cannot live peacefully if having in mind this dichotomy of ideas. They are facing the crisis of multiple identities, from which the people of Muslim world are free. The author has dealt with this important issue very scholarly in Chapter 9. In diaspora, Muslims have to establish their own institutions in order to perform their religious duties and other rituals without disturbing their legal status.

The chapter on 'Islam and Other Religions' is equally important as the other chapters. It argues against those who try to paint the picture of Islam and Muslims in a hostile way. This article traces back the true spirit of Islam regarding other religions and faiths.

The last and final chapter deals with Allama Iqbal's concept of history. I am of the opinion that this is the core concept of his seminal book *Reconstruction of Religious Thought in Islam*. Without clear concept of history, one cannot explore the development of thought in any philosophy or religious school. History of the world, and naturally of Islam also, had played a pivotal role in shaping Muslim thought and Muslim philosophy both. In this chapter, the author has elaborated the views of philosopher poet regarding 'The History'.

This volume contains very valuable material on variety of issues. This book will be strongly appreciated by the academia, not only in Pakistan but also all over the world.

SZABIST,
Karachi

Mohsin Naqvi

Mohsen Keiany, *Balochistan Architecture, Crafts, and Religious Symbolism*, published by Oxford University Press, Karachi, 2015, pp.341, price, Rs.3,000/-.

Physical environment, history, culture and religion together define the parameters of temporal, spatial and spiritual existence of a people, regardless of their level of development. The book under review is based

on a study carried out to see the interaction of these factors, and significance of symbolism in the rural and tribal architecture of Balochistan. The hypothesis clearly seeks links between religio-cultural beliefs, art and architecture. The author, Mohsen Keiany, an artist, trained initially in fine arts, and for his doctoral and post-doctoral study in architecture, is well-qualified to take up a study which involves multi-cultural, multidimensional and multi-layered exploration and technical understanding of the products of apparently very simple people of a resource-poor region. The methodology followed is mainly of case study through field work, by recording the living patterns, traditional art, crafts, customs and cultural practice by sketching. Moreover, discussion and interviews with people, tribal chiefs, artisans, and craftsmen were held for revealing the spirit of continuing the traditional and explaining their religio-cultural beliefs.

The first part of the book (Chapter one and two) introduces Balochistan as a region, expanding into the details of its history, culture, lifestyle, languages, settlement patterns and social environment. The nomadic, semi-nomadic and settled patterns of life are explained in their architecture in particular. Among the crafts, rugs are focused as to their material and symbolism. A detailed section is on mosque architecture, with special focus on the minarets. An intrinsic unity and harmony is discernible among these three aspects of life, as the book tries to explain. Literature survey was conducted for historical and theoretical aspects of the study. The next three chapters explain the architecture of the three major social groups of rural Balochistan. Chapter six focuses on rugs. Starting from the Islamic architecture and development of mosque architecture, typology to explain rural mosques in Balochistan is given in Chapter seven. The Next chapter deals with four basic elements of mosque—*mihrab*, *minbar*, dome and minaret. This chapter presents the origin, functions and typology of minarets at length. Chapter nine outlines the symbolic values of minarets in particular.

The author set out to this exploration between 2003 and 2009, spending several months in visiting 238 mosques. Technique of 'imageability' is applied to elicit 78 persons' image of their environment; here about their image of the mosque was explored. The sketches are very useful, in addition to the photographs, and their mutuality in explaining the similarity in art and architecture. No wonder, the author being an artist, the book contains more than 251 pictures/sketches. In this sense the book has become useful for students of both anthropology and architecture. These pictures are a panorama into history of architecture and art, spanning over ancient Egyptian (imaginary lighthouse of Pharos) and ancient China (pictographic writings) till the 21st century rural

mosques of Balochistan. Islamic architecture is specially referred here from Europe, Africa, Middle East, Central Asia and India.

The types of dwellings of nomadic, semi-nomadic and settled people of Balochistan are explained with reference to their building material, design, structure, and the logic/philosophy behind using that material. For settled people, house with one room, two rooms, more than two rooms, and also with two-storey are described, which are common throughout the province. The principles of gender segregation—*purdah*, *hijab*, *baithak*—are observed strictly in architecture and practice. Their social and religious connotations—privacy, artistic and spiritual—are highlighted with reference to their adaptation characteristics. Here religious come very close to the secular use. The author emphasizes the harmony between cultural heritage, social norms, and the indigenous spirit. In Balochistan this harmony is maintained between the locally available material, nature of the space formed, and the architectural rhythm created thereof.

Regarding rugs, Keiany asserts that these are also a product of the process of culture. He holds that the elements of religiosity, when brewed within the cultural process, come out in the form of artifacts so uniquely indigenous, and so comprehensively symbolic that one needs to have a deeper understanding of both the culture and the art to appreciate them. The design and features of rugs of Balochistan, when analyzed as cultural textbooks, reveal the life style of major ethnic groups of the province. These rugs, as the author shows have dark, fragile somber colors, and small size if woven by the nomads. Their patterns show nomadic life with camels and travel, seasonal migration, animals, birds, flowers and geometric patterns, all typifying a peaceful nomadic life. But after 1979, the patterns started weaving in the history of conflict and terror. So there came the war rugs, with pistol, rifles, dynamites, tanks, helicopters, fighter planes, bombs, etc. It is beyond any doubt that women weavers must have an aversion for war knitted in each knot, but when these rugs were encouraged by the international buyers, they were produced in considerable number. Economics commercialized the hatred, too. The prayer rugs, however, are of two types: straw mat and prayer carpet. The Prophet tradition (*sunnat*) is associated with the reed mat. Head and shoulder design and step design are two popular mat styles. The basic plans of a mosque and prayer mat are similar, with extended area of *mihrab*. The rugs are decorated mostly with geometric motifs. The symbols of arch, tree, lamps, and garden have Islamic connotations. The obvious pictures of Kaaba and a mosque, and religio-symbolic value of animals is also discussed. Shamanistic beliefs are shown in animal motifs, too.

The author has presented views of world scholars on Islamic architecture, regarding its origin, inclusivity, symbolism, and infinite unity in multiplicity of forms based on *Tawhid*, shown in infinite patterns, especially the arabesque, a uniquely Islamic form, which has a unifying principle behind it (p.192).¹ The section on mosque architecture specifically deals with the Islamic aspect of Balochistan art, architecture and lifestyle. The artistic tradition inherited and practiced by Balochistan has no doubt links with its geography, society, ideology, and history. Islamic architecture has also inherited from its non-Islamic past, and the variation it encountered during expansion of Islamic state gave its chance to adapt the local characteristics of the new conquered land, thus a universal blending of rich elements is discernible in Islamic cultural heritage. The same is true for any part of Pakistan. Balochistan, with its strong tribal culture presents more affinity with heritage, than experimentation in modern tradition. The aspect of symbolism is essential to all Islamic arts, and it adds abstraction, transcendence, unity as well as infinity—key elements of Muslim philosophy, beliefs and worldview.

The mosque, Arabic *masjid*, is no technical requirement for Muslim worship even then it is at the heart of Islamic architecture, as well as a sign of Muslim residence, identity, strength, and weekly congregation. Architecturally, a typical mosque is defined by Soanes and Stevenson as ‘a domed building with a minaret; a niche (*mihrab*) or other structures indicating the direction of Meccca ... a platform for preaching (*minbar*); and a place, generally a courtyard, where water fountains or taps were provided for obligatory ablution before prayer’. The author explains evolution of mosque architecture from early days of Islam, to custom built mosques for formal communal congregation in the 7th century BC. The author mentions that standard mosque style was consolidated during the reign of Abbasids (750-1258 AD). The traditional plan of mosques is usually a single domed square in Turkey², which is not followed in simple flat roof mosques of Balochistan, but minarets are there, which accentuate the importance of minaret as a sign of mosque more than that of the dome. Though domes appeared in later stages, or when more sophistication was acquired in styles, but rural areas are largely deprived of it. They simply make a symbol of dome in most of the cases. These features are seen in the urban mosques of

¹ Arabesque has been recognized as distinctly Islamic feature, predominant in Islamic art and architecture, and this is evident from its being referred so frequently in any book of Islamic art and architecture.

² Sheila S. Blair and Jonathan M. Bloom, *The Art and Architecture of Islam* (Ahmadabad: Mapin, 1995), p.230.

Balochistan, but the rural mosques are basic open ones, weak in forms, but true to the principles, concepts and symbolic meanings—the assertion the author proves throughout his section on Balochistan mosques.

Keiany's survey of simplest form of mosques in Balochistan is inspiring, since it endorses the pristine Islamic spirit of seeking unification with God through a spiritual endeavor, regardless of the forms and features of praying area. It affirms that 'the whole surface of earth is our *masjid* (a place to prostrate)'. This rural, which is essentially 'tribal' as well, showing the early Islamic phase of simplicity, and astonishingly the desert conditions in both places, makes it a sort of replica, too. A line of stones, or mud wall, just to mark the wall, a pointed corner to indicate *qibla* and as *mihrab*, and the crudest form of stones used to indicate minarets at places, represent not only a high degree of abstraction but also of the purity of faith as well. This is a unique quality of this study. The rest is cultural refinement of this relationship.

Regarding minarets, the building material varies from stone, mud, reeds, straw, wood, baked or unbaked bricks, clay, glazed tiles, and cement moldings, to metal. One would wonder to know of minarets containing pitchers, animal's horns, smoking pipe stalks, glass objects and medicine bottles on their tops. These are not without any purpose; the local people explain their thirst, a perpetual vow for rain and plenty of water in desert of Balochistan, for putting the pitchers in holy places in hope. Same is for medicine bottles: to beg for health. The horns signify God's blessing as per local beliefs, so are put on the top of minarets. But the *hookah minars* and glass containers are mostly for decorating the holy place—the house of God—the way the people deemed the best. The simple expression of simple wishes is really fascinating.

Among many aspects of rural life in Balochistan, this book highlights, without saying, the gravest one: poverty, dearth of basic necessities of life, and water—the most essential of these. And on the other plane it illuminates the mystic spirit of plain folk—profound trust in God—to believe that if 'we are living as nomads (travellers), it is His wish, so we comply.' This is how the author takes the reader along to a journey from stone-marked mosques of Bedouins into the subconscious of believers as well. In short, the book is a kaleidoscope of multiple colours and existential dimensions of rural Balochistan.

Arif Hasan, Noman Ahmed, Mansoor Raza, Asiya Sadiq-Polack, Saeed Uddin Ahmed and Moizza B. Sarwar, *Karachi the Land Issue*, published by Oxford University Press, Karachi, 2015, pp.357, price, n.p.

With a self-explanatory title, the book under review, addresses a very complicated issue of land use and management in Karachi. The authors, mostly well-known for their previous writings on urban issues, have discussed and elaborated various dimensions and explicated the factors involved, with minute details in certain aspects.

Karachi, ranked as the world's fifth largest metropolis in 2003, has now been ranked as the largest city with a population estimate of 18 million, and it has achieved this status by beating two each cities of China and India. In just seven years it doubled its population.³ In a way it is an outfall of the population dynamics triggered by the reaction following the incident of 9/11 in the country and the region, as well. Karachi was the third highest dense city in 2007 after Mumbai and Kolkata, while it now inhabits about 5257 person per sq. km. Its management is highly deficient, and recently it has assumed the status of the filthiest city of the world—a shameful fact that no Karachiite would deny these days.

Karachi lies in a geographical region, which is largely barren, semi-arid regarding annual average rainfall hence natural growth of forest/tall trees vegetation is restricted. But it has natural channels for two sea ports, red-sand and rocky beaches, moderate weather, and sea breeze effective in clearing pollution as well. Agriculture is insignificant but the land is still valuable for construction. There is easy availability of state-owned land in Karachi, which sells at very low price (termed as book value).

The conflict theorists assert that the social system is operated to enhance the benefits of the powerful, and the land issues in Karachi are a textbook example of this theorem. Here the governments, the law-enforcement agencies and even the defence institutions of the country are eagerly involved in the land business. The private sector, in collusion with the government actors, is also bagging huge benefits. The development of urban infrastructure, transport network, industries, commercial concerns, residential projects, upgrading of urban facilities, and the ambitious planning of urban capitalist developers, all contribute to put pressure on the land in the metropolitan limits and its periphery. Evictions, displacements, terrorism, local ethnic strife, and political

³ <http://www.citymayors.com/statistics/largest-cities-mayors-intro.html>

conflict at the local, national and international level, have contributed in shaping the issues in today's Karachi. The book highlights the process of victimization through manifold management confusions and also the interplay of vested political, ethnic, commercial interests, and thus identifies the victims as 'the city and its poorer inhabitants'. It indicates the approach of the writers, who feel the city as an organic unit, and the poor people as worth-consideration category of its residents, who, undoubtedly are as important contributors and functionaries of this extremely class-conscious urban conglomeration, as those who own the business or operate as government high-officials. Due to skyrocketing of land prices provision of housing now poses greater problems for the lower and lower middle classes, and the present scenario of capitalist growth of housing sector made it next to impossible during the last decade. Moreover, the development projects have also exhibited an anti-poor bias by grabbing their land and evicting them out of meager housing facility they had afforded so far, for building commercial or residential projects which facilitate only the better-off section. The poor are, therefore, expelled to the margins of the city. From there they have to travel longer distance to workplaces, schools, hospitals and urban facilities; they are even deprived of basic human need—socialization. The city has been devouring many rural settlements, forcing their residents to submit to the land market pressures, or be victimized in many shameful ways, burning their huts being one such act.

An important aspect of this urban explosion is demographic dynamics of the city, intimately connected with that of the province and the country, as these have been pushing out a huge number of people to this primate city of the country, thus it has been growing at a pace of 6 per cent annually. However, the latest estimate has found a shrinking of this migration to almost half due to 'high incidence of acts of terrorism and the breakdown of law and order' in the city.⁴

The subject is very complex, but the writers owing to their own old involvement with the city and its growth, and having been witness to the evolution of problem, they have explained it adeptly. The issue becomes clear if one just notes down the factors and actors involved in it; to mention a few there are multitudes of laws, 13 management agencies, and a rich culture of corruption.

The book has adopted multi-pronged approach to comprehend the issue in focus from different angles. It has used interviews/discussion with a diverse sample from the stakeholders. It has utilized both the

⁴ Social Policy and Development Centre, *The State of Social Development in Urban Pakistan*, Annual report 2014-15, Karachi, 2016, p.3.

primary and secondary sources. The chapters of the book clearly highlight the important dimensions, such as: review of laws, statutes and regulations about land management; financing the housing sector including credit; actors and factors in the land related conflicts; and suggestions for a more equitable land policy. The book is not merely a collection of available data but special surveys about experiences and perception are conducted. Expert investigations and data analyses have been undertaken to complete the picture.

The comprehensive methodological approaches are reflected well in the information presented in appendices. The book has devoted 152 pages to eight appendices, containing data and information on: the persons interviewed; financial institutions providing fund for housing; review of 25 factual videos related to land scams; method explaining compilation and analysis of press clipping about the subject; gentrification of Karachi's coastline; interviewees involved in real estate business and transaction; localities selected for consumer surveys; issues associated with affordability; and location and analysis of questionnaire data. The fifth appendix contains list of questions asked from 13 interviewees, developers/officers of al-Adil Builders, Rao Mega City, Manager Khuda ki Basti, one civil lawyer, estate agents working with Pak Estate Agency, Bismillah Estate, Omar Colony, and in Lyari, Federal B. Area, a homeless mother, an office bearer of Association of Builders and Developers (ABAD), a buyer, and a displaced Jain person. This sample shows that various stakeholders are included skillfully; even a case of political patronage was included which supports people only temporarily.

The data in Appendix 6 point out a crucial aspect of the study: the difference between book value and market value of the plots/houses, and testifies to the fact that this has helped the developers and sellers enormously. The same exposition makes the reader understand why the recent legal procedural changes by the government are introduced regarding sale of the government lands. Obviously if a flat value turns 441.67 per cent higher than the book value only in four years, one can see the margin of profit. Here are also included cases of depreciation of values of flats as well, but that is merely up to 29 per cent.

This book tells us that the key land actors are found guilty of messing up. In this respect the writers hold: 'Rather than developing and implementing master plans, land-use agreements and regulations, and providing easy entry and exit into the land market, they facilitate land grabbing and land conversions, and have turned land in Karachi into a political and ethnic resource'. (p. xvii). The new actors of the land

market are now traders and traffickers, who largely use illegally earned/extortion money.

Karachi is treated here very objectively as a mega city, as to its estimate of population and strategic location. The recommendations largely call for simplifying the rules/regulations and procedures, monitoring their implementations through strong civil society organizations, and improving the legal framework, as the need is felt. Major obstacles felt in realizing this proposal are ethnic conflict, feeding upon ethnic-factions leaders, weaknesses of the justice system, crimes such as coercion, and target-killing for manipulating the market.

This book is relevant for all those who are interested in comprehending the demographic, management, planning, political, economic, sociological and human profiles of the largest city of the world.

Pakistan Study Centre,
University of Karachi

Anwar Shaheen

Ahmad Ali Khan, *In Search of Sense: My Years as a Journalist*, published by Sama Publications, Karachi, 2014, Introduction: I.A. Rehman, pp.579, price, Rs.1,200/-.

This account of a career in journalism by Ahmad Ali Khan, long-time editor of *Dawn* and well-known journalist, is not simply a chronological narrative of his career but also includes valuable elements that collectively contribute to the making of a rich and varied life and the moulding of a mature and visionary personality. The editor of the book, rather the 'assembler' of the book, Dr Naveed Ahmad Tahir, known for her academic association with the Area Study Centre for Europe of the University of Karachi, is also the narrator's daughter and has included a charming selection of letters that were exchanged between Ahmad Ali Khan and his wife – the famous Urdu novelist Hajra Masroor. This section displays the personal and emotional side of an externally reserved personality which would not be normally exposed to the public eye. We have to thank Dr Naveed Tahir and Mr I.A. Rehman for their inclusion. Then there are tributes from those around Ahmad Ali Khan – his family, his friends and admirers. Strangely enough there is nothing expressed on a personal note by Dr Naveed, who painstakingly put together this valuable volume, apart from a formal Foreword. This tells the story of her efforts at assembling the scattered material that composes this book. Perhaps her filial bonds have excluded the informality that

comes from being so intimately connected with the subject. Incidentally, I was surprised at her fulsome gratitude towards me for some minor translations I did at her request. This was utterly unnecessary – as the Persian saying goes: *Hisaab-i-dooston dar dil*.

The complete book, as we now have it, is a chiaroscuro of diverse elements — personal, familial, political and socio-cultural. It is a rounded picture of the eventful years of the 20th century that brought about momentous changes in the life of the inhabitants of the S. Asian subcontinent. More especially affected was the community of Muslims — who were bound to suffer the aftershocks of decisions made elsewhere by those who were inimical to them. The onus of survival cast them into a life-and-death struggle. The state of Bhopal, ruled in succession by five Muslim queens, was a remarkable abode of Muslim culture and this nurtured the personal identity of Ahmad Ali Khan. Offered the chance of working for a Ph.D. in Lucknow University, Ahmad Ali Khan tested the temper of the times and opted for a life that would be swayed by the major event then unfolding — the emergence of Pakistan.

Subsequent chapters describe how Ahmad Ali Khan plunged into the turbulent waters of political activism and journalism in a broad geographical area covering Bhopal, Bombay, Delhi, Karachi and Lahore. This interaction with the broad range of intellectual and journalistic life shaped and matured his personality. One may sometimes seek the undefined verity externally and later discover that it lay hidden within him all the time. This is seen in the transient attraction socialism had for Ahmad Ali Khan. *It was the contrast between theory and reality* that disillusioned him. Eventually, the world of socialism came crashing down with the Berlin Wall and the break-up of the Soviet Union. There was no 'romance' – only 'dalliance' – with the alien ideology on the part of Ahmad Ali Khan, who then returned to his roots.

The memoirs end chronologically with the dismissal of the Junejo government by Gen. Ziaul Haq. Recollections by his family and friends follow next. The 29 letters referred to earlier are given after some remarkable editorials on constitutionalism and suchlike important issues. The letters in Urdu [covering 1951-2007] are given in the conclusion. In view of the aging of the paper it might have been better if the letters had been composed afresh.

An autobiography or a collection of memoirs cannot strictly have an end – only have a penultimate end. Thus the final years of Ahmad Ali Khan's life should have been detailed and filled out by Dr Naveed to bring the narrative to a logical conclusion. The various newspaper tributes could also have been included. It would be interesting to know –

whether by the pen of the writer or Dr Naveed – if the ‘search for sense’ actually attained its objective, or are we going further and further away from sense. In any case, we must thank Dr Naveed Ahmad Tahir for her arduous assemblage of vast and variegated material and presenting it in final form to the readers, associates and admirers of her father. It exhibits the diverse features of a multi-faceted personality of great intellectual ability having all the laudable human values in full measure—one who would champion the truth and resist all efforts to suppress it. Such principled journalists and writers are more of a ‘vanishing breed’ and as time passes the search for them may well yield few results.

Department of English
Karachi University

Syed Munir Wasti

Muhammad Hamza Faruqi, *Meher-i-Darakhshan* published by Majlis Taraqqi-e-Adab, Lahore, 2016, pp.480, price, Rs.500/-.

It has appeared at last. This is the final and definitive biography of the well-known scholar, author, journalist and man-of-letters Ghulam Rasul Meher [d.1971]. The author has a long list of publications relating to the great Meher and now his magnum opus is the culmination of a lifetime of academic endeavor. M. Hamza Faruqi has previously produced such well-researched and authentic works on Meher such as the *Meher biti* [autobiography of Meher], the *Safarnama Hijaz* [Journey to the Hijaz] and the journalistic disputes between Meher and Zafar Ali Khan. The chief value of all these works is that they are based on first hand information obtained from many years of personal contact and familiarity of course, scholarly investigation is not reflected but is in fact brought out with a wealth of detail and a host of references.

The book under review has twelve chapters. It begins with an account of the family and ancestry of Meher. It continues with an account of his early education. It then describes the post-academic occupations of Meher resulting in his departure for the princely state of the Hyderabad [Deccan] headed by His Exalted Highness, Mir Mahbub Ali Khan called the ‘Beloved’. The account continues with a description of Meher and his adjustment to life in the principal ‘Indian Native State’ and its socio-cultural ethos in all its richness and splendor. The chapter dealing with Meher’s love of books and his bibliomania is especially interesting. Hamza Faruqi has access of the unpublished correspondence of Meher – especially of a personal nature – and this he uses most appositely. The account for the years 1947-1965 is somewhat deficient in

detail. No doubt this was the time of independence, partition and resettlement in Pakistan. The turmoil must have taken long time to pass.

Meher's association with Allama Iqbal is the subject of a separate chapter. Allama Iqbal was the foremost Muslim intellectual and reviver of Muslim greatness in the subcontinent. Meher cherished his association with him like a precious treasure and his descriptive account of the Allama's discourse, his recitation of his own poetry and his general comments on national and international affairs – as recorded by Faruqi make fascinating reading.

This sense of fascinating enjoyment is not to be found in the section dealing with Meher's relations with Abu'l Kalam Azad – a fellow journalist in Urdu and skilled user of Urdu prose. Azad was a partisan of Hindu communal politics and did not support the Muslim claim to separate nationhood. Azad's life was spent in the pursuit and justification of this treachery. So great was Azad's support for the Hindus that he claimed that they were originally monotheists and that belief in Prophethood was not necessary for their salvation. Thus in his *Tafsir* of Sura al-Fatiha, Azad does not comment on the need for belief in *Tawheed*. These falsities were exposed by Meher in his letter to Azad. The use of the term 'maulana' for both Azad and Meher sometimes is confusing.

An account of the mature journalistic period of his life follows with the details of his disputes with Zafar Ali Khan. During this time, Meher went on a journey to the Hedjaz and he gives his account of the Holy cities of Mecca and Medinah. Meher was a member of the commission sent to investigate the disturbed conditions in the Hedjaz that resulted in a consequence of inter-Arab conflict.

Meher's newspaper, *Inqilab* achieved a large-scale readership and a devoted following among the educated masses. His research works on the *Jehad* movement of Syed Ahmad Shaheed Bareilvi are also of great value, as are his impressions of various journeys within India and abroad. The absence of an index is a serious flaw remarkable in a work of scholarship. It should be mandatory for all such works to contain an index.

In conclusion, one can state that this study of Meher is unlikely to be superseded by another such work in the near future. It will hold the field for years to come. If any new information is discovered about Meher, it will be certain that the Faruqi will be there to present it to the reading public and also advance to new milestones on the road to Meher studies.

Seema Alavi, *Muslim Cosmopolitanism in the Age of Empire*, published by Harvard University Press, Cambridge, 2015, pp.490, price n.p.

This massive piece of research [490 pp.] is a study of 5 Indian Muslims, mostly religious scholars, who achieved a degree of fame or notoriety in the year following the war of independence [1857]. These personalities are: Sayyid Fadl [regarding whom information is scarce]; Rahmatallah Kairanwi, the noted debator who engaged with the famous Christian missionary Pfander in Agra in the premutiny days; Haji Imdadullah Makki, the spiritual preceptor of many Indian Muslim scholars such as the founders of the Deoband Madressah; Siddiq Hasan Khan, the consort of the Begum of Bhopal and a noted Ahl-i-Hadith scholar in his own right; and Jafar Thanaseri, a freedom-fighter of the War of 1857. A study of the life and career of these five men is a rich and rewarding task.

Unfortunately, the author, instead of exploiting the great possibilities that such research contains, has attempted to give her own idiosyncratic opinions and impose them on the structure of her research and analysis. The use of the terms, ‘cosmopolitanism’, ‘cosmopolis’, and ‘ecumenicalism’ and ‘ecumene’, as employed by the author are positively misleading. They are used deliberately as euphemisms to soften the disturbing implications that a term like ‘Pan-Islam’ or ‘Pan-Islamism’ may have. ‘Ecumenicalism’ relates solely to the Christian world and its desire for unity. It cannot be transferred to a similar use to the Islamic world. ‘Cosmopolitanism’ derived from the Greek ‘polis’ [= ‘city’] to indicate supra-national / supra-civic tendencies does not fit in happily with the universal desire of Muslims to unite and form a massive, monolithic unit. No explanation is given why the term ‘pan-Islam’ is so sedulously avoided – as though pan-Islam is a disease that one must mention only in whispers. The term, ‘pan-Islam’ in both its positive and supposedly negative connotations has been in use since the Crimean War [1854] by scholars and politicians such as Gladstone [Prime Minister of Britain], D.S. Margoliuoth [Professor of Arabic, Oxford University], Maulana Mohammad Ali [a fire brand supporter of the ideal idea], William Scawen Blunt in *The Future of Islam* [1875], and recently by J. M. Andau in his *The Politics of Pan-Islam* [OUP, 1990].

The Arabic names of certain personalities and the titles of their books are awkwardly transcribed. There is no bibliography – so that one has to remember where a reference was cited in the absence of a full and proper bibliography. The story of Dulip Singh, the son of Ranjit Singh occupies disproportionate space in the conclusion and has nothing to do with Pan-Islam. Jargon is freely used with no distinction between terms

like ‘imperium’, ‘transimperial’ and ‘subimperial’, ‘actors’ and ‘agents’. The founder of Pakistan, Quaid-i-Azam Muhammad Ali Jinnah has been referred to derisively as ‘Congressman MA Jinnah’ which shows the anti-Muslim and anti-Pakistan mindset of the author at work. The load of admiring adjectives showered upon Abu’l Kalam Azad is wholly undeserved. The conclusion does not draw out important results, deductions and continuations of the global strategy of pan-Islam. All said and done, the book is valuable for the information it contains about the life and pan-Islamic activities of the five personalities. This is based on archival research in UK and USA. The arguments are tendentious and pre-determined and meant to be a buttress for anti-Muslim propaganda so alarmingly proliferated in the print and electronic media.

Department of English
University of Karachi

Syed Munir Wasti

Anwar Hussain Syed, *Versified English Translation of Diwan-i-Ghalib, Vol.1 from Radiff Alph (A) to Noon (N)*, Lahore, 2015, Price, Rs.300/-.

This is a new version in English of the *Diwan-i-Ghalib*. It is versified but the justification of putting a translation in verse has not been given. Verse to verse is far more difficult than verse to prose. The former involves great difficulties in transfer of meaning and also involves sacrifice of meaning. There is no use of rhyme in the translation and its meter is rather free. The Urdu text is not given but the list of contents contains the first line of the ghazal that has been put into English. The translator assumes that the reader has a copy of the Urdu text before him and is easily switching from Urdu to English. In reality, the text [if given] would have made matters more convenient. Secondly, there are many versions of Ghalib’s *Divan* extant in south Asia with their internal differences, such as the texts edited by Dr A.R. Bijnori and Imtiaz Ali Khan Arshi [called the ‘Nuskha-i-Bijnori’ and ‘Nuskha-i-Rampuri’ respectively]. Which is the text used for making the translation? This is not revealed. There are total of 115 translations given ending with the *radif* [= ‘refrain’] *nun*. The proper word for *qafia* is ‘rhyme’. The introduction expresses effusive thanks to Janet Jones but we are not given details of her assistance in this task especially as she herself writes in her brief Foreword that she is ‘ignorant of Urdu’.

The translator has not given a bibliography or any reference to the previous English translations made of Ghalib by Ralph Russell or S.

Rehmatulla. Neither is there any reference to the host of critical material available of Ghalib in many languages by different scholars such as Khurshidul Islam, Ghulam Rasul Meher and Iftikhar Ahmad Khan 'Adeni'. The presence of previous translations should not deter a new entrant into this challenging field but the new entrant should assert as to what new contribution he has made in his translation which was omitted by previous translators. All the English translations from Ghalib were made in the 20th century. Why, with the advent of the 21st century, should they be regarded as antiquated or obsolete?

There are only 2 lines in poem No. 108. The explanation for this has not been given. Ghalib generally regarded his Urdu *Divan* as inferior to his Persian *Divan*. The latter is neglected nowadays as a result of the decline of interest in Persian and its great literature. What are the merits of Ghalib's Urdu *Divan* that make it outshine his Persian *Divan*? Both have issued from the same creative soul! In Persian where there is no gender, the poets' Beloved is taken to be male but in Urdu the Beloved is always female (though addressed as male). Why has the translator made the female Beloved male in his translation? Are the 'heart' and liver both identical as being the seat of the tender emotions. Is this the result of being associated with Allama Fazl-i-Haq Khayrabadi?

The above comments are the result of a cursory reading of the translation which has produced these queries. On the whole, the translator has avoided the pitfalls that are a plenty when one makes a verse-to-verse translation. He has put the Urdu in clear, crisp English diction which shows his expertise in transference of meaning.

Department of English
University of Karachi

Syed Munir Wasti

Qasim Yaqoob, *Urdu Shairi par Jangon kay Asraat (Tehqeeq-o-Tanqeed)* published by City Book Point, Karachi, 2015, pp.319, price, Rs.500/-.

The book under review is a war treatise; people's psychological involvement in it, and the artistic expression of this process embedded in centuries of Urdu speaking community of South Asia. Literature reflects the history of the people, their worldview, philosophical bases of their aspirations, and preferred methods of pursuing their collective goals. It depicts people's history, preserving their struggles through times, for survival, empowerment and dominance. War, as an inevitable method of survival, has remained a dominant factor in the Indian subcontinent

history. Every war has certainly affected the state and society in the following decades. In this perspective, the writer has critically approached the after-effects of wars on the society through Urdu poetry.

The writer has presented a comprehensive overview of war-history, starting from the age when societies came into being and the barbaric man evolved the method of war to survive, till today, when the 'most civilized people' are inventing and using the most advanced and most destructive methods to overpower the enemy and establish their supremacy. He asserts that from prehistory till present, the objectives of war have remained unchanged. Reviewing the history one can note two major reasons behind the wars: religion and ideology. So, the wars had been fought by particular individuals and nations to protect their ideas and propagate their religious notions. It was only after the Renaissance that the Christians diverted their attention towards excelling in economy and commerce, instead of religious pursuits.

Coming to the South Asian region, in Hyderabad Deccan, Urdu as an emerging language saw difficult tumultuous phases. In Northern India, constant political instability and disintegration remained noteworthy feature of the society. Such destabilization had been affecting Urdu literature and poetry. Centralization policy during the British Raj introduced Urdu language to different experiences. From the Deccani phase to the Pakistani phase, wars have left their impact on poetry.

History tells us that wars were not merely weapons of combat, instead, there has been an ongoing struggle to dominate the enemy's economy, culture, philosophy and ideologies. In other words, one nation moves violently to defeat and replace the rivals' ideas by her own. Nowadays, from economic point of view, wars have become an attempt to grab new or more markets and appropriating the natural resources and wealth.

Focusing on the poetry that has emerged in the perspective of wars, the author has also viewed the reaction of regional languages of Pakistan about wars. He claims that regional languages have much richer heritage in this regard than Urdu language, owing to difference in their respective ages. He described different types of war-poetry. The writer also points out that our poets have responded to the wars, but as peace returned, they came back to the poetry of peace and love, which shows that our nation is not militant. (p.30)

From the world epic literature the writer has referred to *Ramayana* and *Mahabharata*. These are not only religious books but they have also provided the foundation for Hindu society. These books represent eastern traditions of sacrifice and family values, and narrate

stories of battlefields. Next to it, the writer has picked *Odyssey* and *Illiad* by Homer from Greek literature. Stories of war of two tribes—Troy and Sparta—are described in these books. These are the best specimens of the epic poetry in Greek literature.

Coming to Pakistan, much of the poetry produced in the perspective of 1965 war remained emotional and time-bound. The war unified the whole nation around the idea of combating ‘the enemy’. The whole nation stood against naked Indian aggression putting their regional trivial differences on the backburner. The poets appreciated and honored the defensive role of armed forces. Presentation of the war scenes, imagery, philosophy and diction, introduced an expression of patriotism in poetry. The following names produced historical memoirs in the annals of Urdu poetry: Amjad Islam Amjad, Fareed Ludhianvi, Shafi Aqeel, Sehba Akhter, Ata-ul-Haq Qasmi, and Ijaz Frooqi. War motivated the poets belonging to different schools of thoughts, such as Zameer Jaffery (comedy), Shorash Kashmiri (progressive) and Ahmed Nadeem Qasmi (humanist).

The poetry emerging out of this war contained idioms, metaphors, similies and historical references. New meanings were given to words like: *ababeel*, *haider-e-karar*, *shaheen*, *bandoq*, *kafan*, *khanjar*, *ibn-e Ali*, Bader-o-Haneen, and Tariq-o-Ziyad, largely immersing them in religious sentiments. At times emotional expression of commoners’ sentiments even compromised the literary worth of poetry.

The 1971 war brought rather different consequences than the war in 1965 for Pakistan. It ended on a sad note due to the separation of East Pakistan. In contrast to the heroic stories and accounts of previous war, the poetry produced in response was full of sadness, occasionally talking about new hopes, and lighting the candles for tomorrow. It was a great national tragedy, so the heroic-style poetry, in the beginning, was soon overwhelmed by tragic feelings. The poets, however, also called for answers to such questions as to why this tragedy happened? Was it inevitable? Who was responsible? Though there was less militarism and more defeat than the war of 1965, the poems written during this war were much effective and strong in tone. This poetry also reflects popular sentiments.

This war gave some more metaphors like: general Yahya, Bhutto, Mujeeb, *mukti bahni*, Dhaka. While new symbolism emerged in *khoon*, *sahel*, *deya*, *bhai*, *jazeera*, *jangle*, *ajnabi*, *lashain*, and *aa’ina*, highlighting the backdrop of war. More blank verse was written this time. Far-reaching effects of this tragedy can be found in the poetry by

Mohsin Ehsaan, Amjad Islam Amjad, Shehzaad Ahmed, Majid Siddiqui, Jon Eliya, and Riaz Majeed, etc.

Here emerged the use of weapons as symbols, meaningfully, which was a valuable addition in Urdu poetry. These were used to explain the poets' minds or ideas. This war also changed the pro-war emotional flood of our poets, and shifted them to some different aspects of war. For instance, Ehsaan Daanish talked about saving the respectful image of nation having the land, the culture, the ideology and a proud history of forefathers. Ahmed Nadeem Qasmi, a patriotic Pakistani ideologue, talked openly about the survival of country and love for the country. Himayat Ali Khan hoped for good and showed optimistic attitude after war devastations. Such contemplations helped in cooling down the war phobia to some extent.

Another historical shift emerged in the American-Afghan war and Kuwait-Iraq war, since then there were two groups on the scene in Pakistan. One group was strongly opposing the American intervention and faced extreme reaction from establishment. The second group was of religious people, insisting upon naming the war by Muslims as *jihad*.

During the decades of the 1980s and 1990s, the style of Urdu poetry appears more universal than a local one. It seems striving for a universal outlook since then. A lot many English translations, variety of creative experiments, and different dimensions adopted in it reflect that it has now added globalized ideas at the intellectual level.

The literature of the years following 1965 and 1971 remained pro-war largely. The political situation arisen in the aftermath of the two wars has altered the perceptions. Afghan-America war in 2001 and Iraq-America war in 2003 produced a different literature. Wars are now being condemned as an act of brutality. It is a pleasant change in contrast to the provocation of war sentiments for the sake of domination or occupation. Followers of all religions have now declared war as inhuman and excluded it out of their essential life systems or life patterns.

On the other hand, it is much interesting to note that Afghan-Russia war has been generally presented as *jihad*. No poet dared to focus on its causes, political aims and far-reaching consequences and participation of Pakistan in this war. American interest and role played by the American intelligence agencies has not been discussed. Women writers, Zubaida Haeyi, Saleha Saboohi, Farkhanda Tabassum emphasized the Afghan girls to hold on the truth strongly. A particular ideological group having Pro-America agenda impacted the poetry mostly. To enhance the religious sentiments a cell was set up. One main purpose of this cell was to dictate and train the Pakistani intellectuals. It published a book by the name of *Karbala sey Kabul tak* in favour of

Afghan *mujahid*. It included poetry by Naeem Siddiqi, Hafeez Tayeb, Tufail Hoshiarpuri, Muzaffar Warsi, Ata-ul-Haq Qasmi, Anwar Masood, Ghafil Karnali, Tehseen Farooqi, etc. The whole poetry included in this book centered on the conflict of *haq-o-batil* (right and wrong). It was not analyzed on human or political basis. It was fully perceived as *jihad*. This collection of poetry conveys a message that collecting such material was for a particular purpose under the instructions by certain quarters.

History and literature both are directly related to people. The selection of poems given and analyzed in the book makes it an attractive and interesting book. Going through it proves more insightful than what the title suggests. It is also a rigorous piece of research. Overview of regional languages had enlarged the scope of research and proved the claim that these languages have reflected the war impact more than Urdu. In this way, it clarifies the comparative worth of Urdu and regional languages poetry.

Including a touch of world literature has given diversity to the work. It enhances the reader's understanding. Writing impact of wars on a sensitive class of society, the author has contributed in a way to people's history as well. Literature exhibits the features of social history, and this book provides food for thought to new researchers to explore its different dimensions.

Fatima Jinnah Degree College,
University of Gujrat

Abeerah Ali