

Book Reviews

Sidsel Roalkvam, Desmond McNeill, and Stuart Blume (eds.), *Protecting The World's Children Immunisation Policies and Practices*, published by Oxford University Press, Oxford, UK, 2013, pp.233, price, n/a.

The number of polio cases detected in Pakistan has been increasing well over 180, thus alarming the health establishment and the society, at large, in Pakistan and at the regional and global levels as well. Any research related to this issue can be helpful in comprehending and then overcoming the spread of diseases which can conveniently be controlled by vaccines.

It is strange to see how the issue of vaccination been politicized and became a global threat thereafter. The book under review deals with a critical issue of immunization of children against a host of killer and debilitating diseases. The issue of polio cases has recently assumed extreme importance in Pakistan due to denial by a significant number of people. Unfortunately every nine out of ten new polio cases identified in Pakistan are from the people who are either living in, or who had to leave their homes from the terror-stricken tribal areas of Khyber Pakhtukhwa province, though such cases have also been detected in all the four provinces and the Federal Capital. The situation has become alarming due to the enhanced probability of exporting the disease to the immediate community neighbourhood, neighbouring countries and also to the farthest parts of the world, where the citizens and governments had successfully eradicated the contagious diseases after a long strenuous struggle. India is one such country which has achieved the status of polio-free country, but both Afghanistan and Pakistan could not achieve this target, mainly due to turbulence caused by wars, violence, terrorism and internal political dynamics. These issues have failed the state machinery in its efforts to overcome the menace; both home-grown as well as imported. Now the homegrown-polio menace is again making

Pakistan a ‘dangerous’ and irresponsible country for rest of the world. In this context the book under review should be taken as a guiding light.

The book is an attempt to assess the assumptions on which today’s immunization programs are based. It judges the practical implications of these assumptions. The first chapter relates history of immunization of children in the USA, reliance on vaccines, size of vaccine market, universal or limited coverage by vaccine, possible difference between global and local programs of immunization. This is meant to identify the elements which are significant for making and understanding the immunization policies in the present day world. Here a brief reference is provided to the smallpox eradication, and the Expanded Programme of Immunization, known as EPI, which started in 1974. While the Child Survival Revolution was pledged in 1982, universal childhood immunization was started in 1984. Achieving a high degree of coverage of immunization for children as a goal was set in 1990, with different targets set for different disease, including ending polio by 2000 and measles in the longer run. New vaccines were planned to be developed and introduced under the Child Vaccine Initiative (CVI) set up in 1990. More initiatives and institutionalization measures continued in the following years. Though there have been complex problems regarding ‘national sovereignty, and about the balance of responsibilities between national governments and international organizations’, the heightened international mobility had pressed for accepting the global governance in public health sector inevitably. (p. 23). The second chapter explains how immunization is offered in a chain-like system, from the global to local levels. Chapter Three deals with the global politics of health, the important actors and initiatives. Chapter Four focuses on national commitments and global objectives, whereas Chapter Five has covered the areas of rights and obligations in national health governance. The sixth chapter has presented case studies of Malawi and India.

The last chapter deals with the issues emerging from the question that whether getting means and establishing a health/vaccine infrastructure is enough. A point mentioned here is about relevance of data for whom—local, national or global health establishments, or the vaccine manufacturers. It is argued that epidemiology of a disease deals with the causes of diseases, and research into it can lead to recommending vaccine in different ages, different risk zones, different climates, as compared among countries and regions at global and national levels. However, an optimum schedule can be made only after studies in the local conditions. In Pakistan, there is a practice to detect high-risk areas of polio by checking the sewage of the areas, and if found contaminated by polio virus, the campaign is conducted strictly and the

refusal cases are followed there even more strictly. There are mentioned reasons found in Western Europe (19th century) to resist smallpox vaccine, and Nigeria (2003) to resist polio, as emerging from the political cleavages within the state and the society. Unfortunately the same has emerged as the major cause in Pakistan. Generally, in addition to misinformation and ignorance among parents, there are vaccine doubts and anxieties which are related to the questions of 'individual autonomy, responsibilities, citizenship, the legitimacy of state action, the influence of multinational corporations, and the market: in short the things that vaccines and immunisation programs are seen as signifying'. (p. 198). So it is more about the administration system of vaccine and not about the vaccine itself. In Pakistan and elsewhere, the questions of adequacy of data on success indicators, sustainability, and vertically controlled nature of EPI is also debated.

There is a suggestion that a system to boost incentives for ensuring accurate reporting must be devised. The communities who are not enjoying an efficient healthcare providing structure, still need to be made aware and alert in reporting such cases, since it is the community which has to suffer in the long run, and not the health worker only. The book suggests taking the community as a unit of analysis, and collecting research data for devising public health policies, so that a renewed emphasis on accountability of the government to the citizens is ensured. (p. 203) Reverting to the case of Pakistan, it has to be highlighted that responsibility of the government to control the menace of terrorism of all sorts is beyond any doubt. However, since the factors behind growing terrorism are not indigenous but make a network of factors rooted internationally, the responsibility of the global community and global civil society is also beyond any doubt.

The problem of polio-eradication is very complex in the case of Pakistan, much more than what has been portrayed for India or Malawi, which are taken as case studies in this book. The main problems identified in these case studies include in building and maintaining trust in vaccine, administering professionals, government and the health system controlling the whole operation. As 'the local realities' are the crucial factor in the case of Pakistan, and the ground situation in Pakistan demands that the issue of trust building has to be studied even more carefully. Moreover, there have been reports of 'expired vaccine', and children going through complications, illness and even death after taking it. It shows that the whole system of immunization in Pakistan needs to be revamped, rooting out all sorts of laziness and corruption, for the sake of health of the young Pakistanis.

In the concluding pages the book suggests ways out of this morass. The authors believe that the trust can be built slowly by the functionaries of the health system who work at the grassroots level. For these workers rewards/incentives are not sufficient to motivate them to work; building trust requires personal interest, which the majority of workers lack. Hence they try to meet the targets set for short term, and report good performance, but they miss out identifying and reporting the crucial drawbacks of the system which engender the problems. For instance, malnutrition or birth weight being low, or similar other causes go unreported.

Outbreak of any epidemic or adverse political climate, which may emerge suddenly, break trust, and this is where one would find the book very much relevant to Pakistan. A handful of political elements are bent upon killing the polio workers due to the grudge they have against the political system. This is resulting in alarming increase in polio cases detected in recent months in Pakistan. The compensation schemes that were devised were run half-heartedly and so the deadly virus has been gaining sufficient room to sprawl. A point highlighted by the authors is of the cases not reported so far, as those are either not detected or are hidden deliberately. Such cases are another potential danger. As reported in this book, the lessons learnt from India, having conditions much similar to Pakistan, refer to rumors and collective resistance to vaccine which caused by the absence of institutionalized mechanism for investigating and reporting suspicions regarding vaccines in the community.

The authors assert that they are interested in rescuing the immunization programs from the strategic interests defining global health, making them knowledge-based rather than evidence-based, integrating these programs into the processes of community development and consequently, ensuring health of the children as the ultimate goal, and not the use of any deployment of health technology as an indicator of progress of nations (p.203). These sentences also sum up the approach of the book. In Pakistan, due to alarming increase in the polio cases there has emerged a renewed interest in handling the cases of polio by the government, and so relevance of this book has been enhanced manifold.

Kalidas, *Vikramorvasi*, Muhammad Aziz Mirza Lakhnavi (Urdu tr.), Lahore, 1961, pp.162, price, n/a.

The reputation of Kalidas [c. 500 CE] has achieved a global vogue. He wrote in Sanskrit – a language that was the medium of communication among the educated elite but which became a ‘dead’ language early in the first millennium A.D. The richness of Sanskrit drama became known to the world largely through translations. The efforts of Sir William Jones [d. 1794] while in India, and the early English Sanskritists, are noteworthy in this regard. Sir William Jones translated the *Shakuntala* of Kalidas shortly before his death. His translation was used by Goethe [d. 1834] for his own poetic re-telling. Later in the 19th century, the other plays of Kalidas were translated – such as the verse translation by Prof. H.H. Wilson of *Vikramorvasi* [1827] and the prose translation by Prof. E. B. Cowell of the same play in 1851. The Urdu translation under review refers to Prof. Wilson’s verse translation only – from which the Urdu version was prepared as the translator did not know Sanskrit – although he refers to his knowledge of Marathi. In the drama, the educated characters use the Sanskrit while the women [not being literate] use a demotic version called Prakrit. So a translator would need to know both – the literary and the colloquial – in order to translate into another language. The drama treats of the love of King Vikram for the nymph Orvasi which proceeds along the standard pattern (in Sanskrit drama) of love → reciprocity → jealousy → separation → resolution. The chief merit is in the expression of heightened emotion at the right places.

In a lengthy preface, Muhammad Aziz Mirza gives the history of the evolution of drama from ancient Greece to India mentioning the various genres of drama common in India – such as comic, tragic, satiric and historical. An account is also given of the cast and characters comprising the dramatic action and its unfolding. An essential element of Sanskrit drama is magic (both positive and negative) and the presence of gods and goddesses who participate in human affairs. It was quite common (as in ancient Greek drama) for a god or goddess to fall in love with a man or woman. This is why, perhaps, that Muslims did not enter the field of original compositions of drama [in the Indian languages] until the end of the 19th century and that too only after a vast corpus of translations had been made both from western and eastern drama. One example of such a translation is the Urdu verse translation of Shakespeare’s *A Midsummer Night’s Dream* by Syed Ghulam Qadir Wasti (1902). The rise of the theatre in Bombay and other places spurred the performances of such ancient drama in translation.

One aspect left untouched by Muhammad Aziz Mirza is that of stage performance. Were the female characters' role performed by young boys or were actresses used for this purpose? How were the 'explicit' scenes (so commonplace in Sanskrit drama) enacted?

In conclusion, we may state that the translation of Muhammad Aziz Mirza was a ground-breaking effort [made in 1905] and was a pioneering effort at presenting the riches of Sanskrit drama to the Urdu-knowing public.

Department of English
University of Karachi

Syed Munir Wasti

**United Nations Conference on Trade and Development (UNCTAD),
Trade and Environment Review 2013: Wake Up Before it is too Late,
United Nations Publication (2013), pp.321, price, n/a.**

One of the major challenges of 21st century is food security for the rapid increasing population the planet Earth has ever seen. After World War II, industrialized agriculture system gained ground to meet the food requirements. In recent years, the food crisis raised some questions for the policy makers and scientists to re-evaluate the cost of current agriculture system which is paid in form of environmental and land degradation. Food security is threatened by climate change as agriculture is the major victim of global warming. The main impact of global warming on agriculture includes high temperature, exposing plants and crops to pest and diseases. It is expected that changes in precipitation can enhance the water scarcity which may lead towards draughts. Weather extremes are likely to influence crop and livestock production. Excess floods may damage the farms and crops. Sea level rise is likely to influence trade infrastructure for agriculture. Hence climate change has potential to destroy physical infrastructure for agriculture. Poor communities of developing world are more vulnerable to be affected by climate calamities as they have less adaptive capacity and their resilience is lowest. According to Food and Agriculture Organization (2012), 'a combination of temperature and precipitation changes might result in complete loss of agricultural activity, in a few locations agriculture might become impossible'. Therefore, impact of climate change has significant consequences for land, crop production and trade of agriculture.

Keeping in view all such issues, UNCTAD with more than fifty experts published Trade and Environment Review 2013. The report comprises five main theme research articles along with additional

commentaries to investigate, elaborate and support the respective themes. The first chapter highlights the challenges of the fundamental transformation of agriculture, second is about livestock production, third part deals with role of research, technology and extension services, fourth; point out the role of changes in land use and last part of report discusses the importance of international trade rule for transforming global agriculture.

Trade and environment review outlined three major challenges in the global agriculture; (a) to produce 70 per cent more for a projected population of nine billion by 2050, (b) increasing risks of climate change and commodity price volatility and, (c) ensuring and enhancing the provision of ecosystem—such as climate change mitigation and water regulations.

The current industrialized agriculture system has been quite productive but still it leaves about one billion population undernourished and poverty stricken, 70 per cent of whom lives in rural areas.

Factory farms have been the important part of industrialized agriculture, where animals are kept indoor, their feed includes high calorie diet sometimes supplemented with antibiotics and hormones to maintain their weight. The shift from the feed system based on grass and plant to one based mainly on crops have some demerits too. The basic source of fodder is no more farm itself but foreign grown crop. With increase demand of livestock fodder, more land is required to grow animal feed rather than crop food, led to land conversion including deforestation of rainforests. This land conversion is mainly taking place in South to meet the demand for animal feed in North. For instance, EU's livestock protein originates from South America but the excrements are produced in European countries. Excrements are not important as natural fertilizer is not used in farms and artificial fertilizer is in practice, thus creating a huge disposal problem. Commonly, this slurry is dumped on pasture lands as water disposal, reducing the pasture quality. Nitrous Oxides, ammonia and Co₂ emissions caused by synthetic nitrogen fertilizer are associated with the intensive production of animal feed, and it has direct and indirect impact on climate. Another aspect is related with the conversion of grassland to crop land. With high demand of protein rich animal feed industrial agricultural production is responsible for the removal of tropical rainforests and conversion of grasslands to croplands. Grasslands are carbon sinks. The ploughing causes huge losses of carbon and biomass contained in the soil. The permanent and dense grass cover protects soils and prevents soil erosion. The environmental costs of intensive animal feed production includes damaged to the ecosystem and climate, reduction of biological diversity, N₂O emissions caused by excessive use of synthetic fertilizers,

nitrification of soils and water course and enhanced ammonia load in the atmosphere. It is suggested that under sustainable pasture conditions cattle produce milk, meat from grass and forage and thereby make a significant contribution to the preservation of soil fertility and climate change mitigation. How cattle's are reared will determine the scenario for destruction or protection of land and atmosphere.

A very important aspect of today's agriculture system is overproduction mostly in industrialized countries. The excess food production is at environmental costs contributing 47 to 54 percent of the total GHG emissions, accelerating the climate change. This issue can be dealt with Agriculture Knowledge Science and Technology (AKST) policies. In the developed world current system is supported by subsidies that reinforce unsustainable practice. On the other hand farmers in developing countries have to compete with these subsidized products. There is a lack of knowledge exchange and in most of the cases transformation capacity is not available for them to purchase information and equipments. The report suggests for the creation of new research centres, institutions to find solution through research to transform the current agriculture system at regional and international level. There is a need to revise or to replace the current agriculture practices to new agriculture paradigms. Sustainable\ green agriculture is the solution suggested by International Assessment of Agricultural Knowledge, Science and Technology for Development (IAASTD). (2009). UNEP (2011) stated 'investment in sustainable agriculture can meet the need for food security in the long term, while reducing agricultures carbon footprint, thereby making it part of the climate change solution.' It is expected that not only food security, but also environmental and social goals can be achieved with a sustainable agriculture system. IAASTD (2009) also favors organic and green practices which can be beneficial to absorb three to four times as much as Co₂ as conventional agriculture practices before saturation occurs with some fifty years. While investing into AKST, it is highly recommended to look into agro ecological \ organic farming practices which will slow down the process of land degradation. The benefits of sustainable agriculture practices is likely to result in soil conservation, reforestation, lesser land degradation, improved soil fertility etc. sustainable agriculture requires institutional strengthening (land rights, good governance etc.) along with national and international policy innovation especially international trade policy. Such policy changes should focus on reforming' environmentally harmful subsidies that artificially lower costs of agriculture inputs and promote their excessive uses.

Another problem linked with current agriculture system is increasing trend of land conversion especially in developing world. On small scale farming the effects of land conversion can be both positive and negative, but overall; the impact on climate are likely to be negative. Agricultural expansion into forest land and dry land areas is the most threatening global process. Non agriculture dry land (Savannahs, bush, shrubs and scrub lands) are converted into small scale crop growing farms. It is estimated. 'Since 2005, about 0.5 per cent of the global land surface has been converted from cropland and dry land for food and feed to crop land for biofuel production'. The expanding urban settlement in dry lands and agricultural land is another trend in global land use change. Increased energy security is the major motivation behind biofuel production. It is believed that most of the land conversion for growing crops is at expense of forests and pastures. Studies of the palm oil industry in South Asia shows, 'from 1990 to 2005 close to 60 per cent of oil palm expansion was at the expense of forests with strong negative impact on biodiversity and carbon stocks'. The increase in cultivation of biofuels (sugar cane) leads to increased water withdrawal, creating problems where water is already scarce. The State of Food and Agriculture (SOFA) believed that 'recent growth in biofuels production and processing was the major driver of the food price hike in 2008'. According to World Bank (2011) the world forests are reduced between 1990- 2010 by 3.3 per cent or by almost 138 million ha. Steinfeld et al (2010) estimated that 34 per cent of livestock related carbon emissions are due to deforestation, 25 per cent are from enteric fermentation and 25.9 per cent from manure. Farming systems are focusing on cropping, livestock rearing and combination of both. Small scale farming and rural poverty are intrinsically linked. Urbanization, desertification, overgrazing, conversion of grassland to cropland and unsustainable cultivation practices played a key role in land and environmental degradation process. Global food security is primarily dependent on the food production along with distribution and availability of food for consumers. To improve the food security globally and locally, there is a need for land conservation regulations, ensuring land tenures, improving market access, developing gender equality, promoting sustainable land management, removing subsidies and anticipating climate change.

National trade policies (subsidies and support measures) trade restrictions, tariffs and international trade rules have a significant impact on food security. In order to revise the agriculture system, it is necessary to remove harmful subsidies provided mainly by developed countries and to allow special treatment and safeguard mechanism for developing countries. The global agriculture trade framework is an awkward

combination of liberalization and protectionism. Increased agriculture trade can offer opportunities for poor.

Trade liberalization did not benefit the rural communities and small scale farmers in developing countries became the net losers. On contrary, the largest agricultural producers from developed countries benefit more easily from the opportunities resulted from the improved market access. De Schutter (2009) wrote, 'the most vulnerable group who experience hunger are the small holders, landless labors, pastoralists, fisher folk, forest dwellers and the urban poor. Any trade regime that fails to benefit these groups, or affect them negatively, is likely to lead to the denial or violation of the right to food'. The weakness of the international trade system permits developed states to continue to subsidize and protect their agriculture at the cost of developing countries. Due to this farmer in developing states are unable to export to the subsidizing developing countries markets. They are also unable to compete in third market because products are sold at artificially lower prices by developed states and finally they have to compete in their own local market with subsidize products coming from developed states. Thus for the farmer in developing world, this affects market share, incomes and livelihood negatively. It is getting worst with the rise in food prices and increasing social instability. IAASTD stated'. A further increase in world food price in 2011 and 2012 has given rise to uncertainty and insecurity in the net food importing countries. As a result some of these countries have shifted their focus back to achieving greater self-sufficiency and increasing local food production and to adopting trade policies in support of this objective'. Presently, international supply chains are dominated by major food processors and retailers; while agribusiness is controlled by few multinational companies providing inputs such as pesticides, seeds, crop and genetically technology, machinery etc. these multinational companies supports industrialized agriculture system which depends on external inputs giving them power to manipulate agribusiness in their own favor. These MNCs in agribusiness also supports monoculture crop production instead of diverse multi cropping and integrated livestock and farming system. They bypass traditional markets where small holders sell to local markets and traders. To overcome the imbalance it is necessary to eliminate subsidies and protection in developed countries to uplift the status income of developing countries farmer.

To deal with the hunger, poverty and malnutrition, transition towards more sustainable form of agriculture is required. Climate friendly agriculture, without imbalances in international trade regime must be the new paradigm. Organic farming should be encouraged as it

will provide trade opportunities to the small scale farmers and environment as well. A supportive trade framework can assist in the transition to ecological and organic farming and ensuring food security and sustainability.

Pakistan Study Centre
University of Karachi

Erum Muzaffar

Rajmohan Gandhi, *Punjab: A History from Aurangzeb to Mountbatten*, published by Aleph Book Company, Printed and bound in India by Replica Press Pvt. Ltd., pp.431, price, n/a.

To understand the politics of Pakistan, Punjab has to be understood. In united Pakistan, before Bangladesh seceded, without having majority in numbers, it had the major role in governing the country; Punjab, post Bangladesh, enjoys a dominant role as the majority provinces. Raj Mohan Gandhi's *Punjab, from Aurangzeb to Mountbatten*, certainly helps in understanding the Punjab phenomenon.

Rajmohan has documented the era from Aurangzeb to Mountbatten. From Moghuls to the Partition, Punjab saw its seat of power occupied by varied men, dynasties and invaders of different faiths but surprisingly none were Muslim despite the fact that for the majority of Punjabis' their religion was Islam. Why did they choose to be ruled and not contest for power? Rajmohan Gandhi gives an explanation in his narration.

The Punjab, of this book, is different from the present one divided in 1947. Out of the Indian Punjab were carved the states of Punjab, Haryana and Himachal Pradesh on linguistic basis. Of interest also is how Punjab was divided for administrative purposes in the period covered; the British having patterned it differently into divisions which more or less continue till the present times. In a broader sense, Punjab means where Punjabi is spoken. It's the language which defines 'punjabiness', not necessarily the land. So you see it being spoken in the offices in the capital of Pakistan, Islamabad despite Urdu being the national language, in the units of the army, in buses, bazaars, in distant lands just anywhere Punjabis' meet, a Punjab is created cutting across faith, sects, class and caste forgetting the discord between Sikhs, Hindus and Muslims!

This large province stayed aloof from the national stream of the struggle for independence from British rule, playing its tunes, more local than pan-Indian. Neither the Indian National Congress nor All India

Muslim League could gain support from the leaders or the Punjabis' themselves till very late when the British had decided to quit India. Hopes of all India leaders, like Gandhi and Jinnah, of bringing Punjab into the mainstream of Indian politics waned seeing the weak and vacillating response to the struggle for Indian self-rule or independence. Rajmohan gives an analysis with proofs of this atypical response to all Indian politics. 'After a discouraging visit, Jinnah left Punjab swearing he would never come back', 'it is such a hopeless place' (p.309) he wrote in 1936. The towering Muslim man of influence then was Fazl-e-Hussain who rose to be a member of the Viceroy's Council. He had excessive respect for the British saying: 'As long as there is a single Britisher in India, the idea of any Indian community dominating... in a province like the Punjab is moonshine and nonsense' (p.308). He later added that 'Jinnah should keep his finger out of the Punjab pie' (p.308).

Given the history of mutual distrust and animosity between the Sikh and Muslims, the former opposed the idea of Pakistan. Along with the Hindus of Punjab they agitated after the Pakistan resolution was passed in 1940, held meetings, mobilized people and vowed to take arms to fight the carving of a state of which Punjab was to be a part of. Jinnah tried to lure the Sikhs saying they would be more comfortable in the new Muslim state but to no avail. The seeds of discord had been planted long ago, each new decade saw it spreading despite periods of being on board due to respective interests. The British played its game of divide and rule, encouraging Sikhs, Muslims and Hindus to perpetuate the differences and maintaining separate distinct identities. A common Indian stance against the Raj was prevented by the colonial rulers through subtle moves and deliberate planning. The book gives examples of this trait. Sensational is the disclosure that the idea of Pakistan was floated in 1939 by the Viceroy Linlithgow... 'it would seem that Zafrullah Khan, a member of the Viceroy's executive council, was asked by Linlithgow to draft a note advising the Muslim League to demand a separate nation' (p.315). 'By January 1940, Jinnah was saying publicly that Hindus and Muslims were two different nations ...and in March when the Muslim League convened in Lahore, separation was formally called for'.

Rajmohan Gandhi unfolds the events leading to the Partition and the unfortunate massacre which laced the biggest migration of the population, tainting the happiness of freedom with hues of pungent bloody red. It is clear from what he writes that it was not unexpected.

Past, present and future interlink to form the history of a land. The book goes into the details, revealing, informing, shocking and

providing some new insights as one goes chapter by chapter from Aurangzeb, the waning of the Mughal rule to Wavell's replacement by Mountbatten overseeing the end of the Raj and transfer of power to two dominion states, India and Pakistan. As the title of the book says, the author has focused on the rulers and the ruling class, not much on the ruled who bore witness to the changing dynasties, chiefs, sardars and invaders of their land, often silently subject to the favors or follies of those in power. What about these, the people of Punjab? What did the common man go through while the rulers battled for power, often devastating villages, killing innocent men, abducting or raping the women? It appears that they suffered much but resisted little throughout history. There was division in the ruling class on religious grounds but how did the various faiths, sects and races live together over the centuries? How did they interact at the roots? Were they Punjabis' first, then Hindus, Sikhs and Muslims, Rajputs, Arain, Jats etc? Gandhi in response to the demand for a Muslim state, pleaded, 'How are the Muslims of Punjab different from the Hindus and Sikhs? Are they not all Punjabis, drinking from the same water, breathing the same air and deriving sustenance from the same soil?' (p.316). This clarification is not without base – a base upon which Punjab lived for centuries. One learns from history and this book proves that the common Punjabi, regardless of faith, lived like good neighbors in the villages, 'misl' towns and even cities interacting socially, sharing joys, sorrows, everyday matters while the rulers battled for power, often devastating villages, killing men, abducting and raping women, looting and plundering. The people were one regardless of faith; Punjabis first then Hindus, Sikhs or Muslims. There was no divide between them. Gandhi alludes to this in the book mentioning about Waris Shah and his rendition of Heer, but recited from Akbar's time, which touched every one of all faiths and races in Punjab. Was this the real Punjabi?, No text gives a better picture of life in Punjab of the period and preceding periods than Waris Shah's celebrated *HEER*, composed in 1766.... Waris's *HEER* superseded earlier versions because the blunt and earthy Punjabi of his verses was what the peasants spoke, because the 'bait' metre offered the rhythm they loved... because the love he narrated—the longing for each other in Heer and Ranjha which Waris likened to the longing for God in each soul — was what, in reality or imagination, they too possessed, (p.121). The Punjabi peasant or goat-herd might not have known comfort or dignity but he or she was capable of love, or of imagining it. 'It was this understanding of the human heart, not his memorable imagery', that was the secret of Waris's success and fame (p.122). How a bleeding Punjab, turbulent and chaotic, without a moment of peace and stability produced powerful poetry has been

explained by suggesting that despite constant clashes 'there still were large areas left' away from the routes of the armies,' where peace prevailed' and poetry could be composed and recited (p.121).

Punjab, home to eminent sufis like Baba Farid, Bahauddin Zakaria, Shah Rukn Alam, Data Hajveri, Shah Hussain, Madho Lal, Bullay Shah and Gur was seeped with Sufi thoughts.

Husain Nasir

Vazira Fazila-Yacoobali Zamindar, *The Long Partition and the Making of Modern South Asia Refugees, Boundaries, Histories*, published by Oxford University Press, Karachi, 2008, first edition by Columbia University Press, New York 2007, pp.288, price, Rs.495.

Partition of India was one of the most significant events of the history in terms of the volume of migration across the borders and the involved huge human cost. It happened in a proportion which was not imagined before hand at the states' level. Therefore, unpreparedness of the two governments involved in it was the major reason behind the bloodshed and human misery caused by it.

Years of conflict between Muslims and Hindus, forced the British Crown to divide the subcontinent into two independent states—India and Pakistan. Many historians, writers and scholars have narrated and analyzed the Partition, a turning point in the history of subcontinent. But the nature of work remained focused largely upon the political aspect. There is a felt need to re-write history of people in the recent decades. This dimension of history has not received enough attention in Pakistan as well. The same is case with the historiography of Partition.

The book under review is remarkable in this respect. It is an attempt at exploring new dimensions of the Partition, focusing on both sides of the borders. It is based on oral accounts and official documents. The genocidal violence and mass displacement, refugee rehabilitation and resettlement, controlling the movement of people and the making of citizenship, are the issues studied, in particular, to prove that people (Hindu, Muslim and Sikh) mutually created the history of Partition. Writer proves that the Partition was not *anecdote* of August 1947 only; it extends over decades, leaving lasting impact on the people of the subcontinent and creating long-term problems. On separated families of North Indian Muslim families, the author shows how Partition affected the people, their behaviors and future.

In the first two chapters, the author explains the reasons behind exodus of the Hindus from Pakistan and the Muslims from India. The governments of both states had agreed on transfer of population in the province of Punjab. When Hindus and Sikhs moved from Pakistan to India (Delhi) they narrated the stories of loot and plunder. It developed anti-Muslim sentiments. The main problem for newcomers in India was housing. They had left their houses in Pakistan; naturally they thought Muslims should go to Pakistan, too. This desire directed them to occupy Muslim houses forcibly, hence the violence. Many Muslims shifted to the camps for security reasons and so were declared evacuees. It became a big question for the Indian government to deal with rehabilitation of migrated people from Pakistan as well as the Indian-Muslim evacuees. The Indian government thus decided to allot Muslim's vacant houses to Hindu and Sikhs, who had migrated from Pakistan. It set up Muslim zones in particular areas for evacuated Muslim population. In presence of homeless Hindus, the decision to establishing Muslim zones received sharp criticism from the Indian government. Instead of resolving the problem this decision became a bone of contention between the refugees from Pakistan and the Indian-Muslims. As a result, the housing issue heightened the violence. Therefore, Muslim evacuees had no option—either move to Pakistan willingly or unwillingly. The author claimed that making of Muslim refugees was shaped by unexpected seizure of their houses against their will. Later on, from the camps Muslims travelled to Pakistan by train. The Muslim evacuees were unwilling to leave India but when they returned to their homes they found their houses occupied by refugees. No policy of Indian government or any motivation from Indian leaders could stop the Muslims exodus. The author believes that discriminatory their refugee status was given preference by the Indian government, the Muslim population, so treatments was meted out to them, revealing its inability and unwillingness of to rehabilitate Indian-Muslims.

To welcome a great number of refugees from India and to administrate them was an extremely difficult task for the nascent state machinery of Pakistan. Pakistani Government had no desire to own them at large scale. It was asserted that only refugee from East Punjab, and not from any other area, would be allowed. The author has also explored the causes of Hindu exodus from Pakistan (Karachi) to India (Delhi) in spite of peaceful conditions in the province of Sindh. She points out that panic was created when Muslim refugees attacked the *gurdwara* on 6 January 1948, where Hindus and Sikhs had gathered to leave for India by ship. It led to rioting and army had to be deployed. Also, stories of violence in the Punjab and Delhi made spillover effect on Sindh. Moreover, the author states that the Sindh provincial Congress Party

found Muslim League's dominating Pakistan in the provincial assembly, as a threat for the Hindu minority of the province. For example, a bill was passed to set up a university in Sindh, and it was beyond doubt that was for the majority—the Muslim population. Another effort was of Sindh landholders Mortgage Bill which was to give Muslim *zamindars* more power than Hindus. Such developments were propagated as measures to suppress the Hindu population. Furthermore, Sindh government tried to restrict the Hindu exodus through Sind Maintenance of Public Safety Ordinance. The policy was to stop the Hindu civil servants required as they were for smooth running of the government, but such factors alarmed the Hindu population and augmented their suspicions against the Pakistani government.

Apart from this, Muslim refugees from India also needed houses when they came after facing so many hardships. Temporarily, few arrangements were made for allotment of evacuated houses. This process could not cope fairly with emerging needs of the refugees. It was not easy to administrate them in an infant state. So their resentment against the government and anxiety led them to victimize Hindu population. It disturbed the law and order situation in the city and thus pressured the Hindus to think about leaving Pakistan. Eventually, such factors caused large scale Hindu exodus, as well. Despite Pakistani government's effort, like the Indian government, to stop Hindu population from moving out did not prove workable. In such a state of affairs, return of those who left Pakistan was a question mark similar to the issue the Muslims' rehabilitation in India.

In the third chapter the author examines that unexpectedly, in 1948, the Muslim refugees started returning to their homes in India. The Indian government did not want to have them back as there was already a sizable Hindu migrant population to deal with. Also, their return to India and claiming their belongings could intensify hostility among Hindus and Muslims. The Indian government viewed it as a conspiracy to create violence in Delhi to use it as a pretext for the UNO to claim control of Kashmir, and a plan for future army intervention. To overcome apprehensions in emergency a permit system was introduced by the Indian government to stop the Muslim influx. Later on, the government of Pakistan also adopted the same policy, in spite of early rejection, to restrict more refugees. Moreover, NOC and domicile restrictions were imposed to travel across the border and to claim citizenship. In short, those who left their houses were left with no option to return to their homes and those who desired to return were restricted by various state policies. Hence they were forced to live in India or Pakistan against their will. Many families were separated across the borders. Several cases

have been noticed by the writer where people were arrested and deported to Pakistan. Even both the governments ordered their civil servants to bring back their families or face termination. Many of those simply resigned to avoid long explanations. Those who failed to bring back their families were declared 'disloyal citizens'. In short, the partition caused an enormous emotional and psychological crisis for people of the subcontinent. The book also reveals the injustices occurred in the post-partition years whose impact continued for long time.

To takeover and manage the properties of refugees till their return, the office of 'Custodians of Evacuees Property' was set up. But, this office made the displacements permanent by announcing the refugees' status as 'evacuees' and 'displace persons'. Many cases were reported in India when people had not migrated to Pakistan but their properties were declared evacuees' property. Seemingly, they were punished for having relations in Pakistan or visiting there temporary. To prove their being lawful heirs they had to litigate/struggle for years. Property confiscation made their economic conditions weak and altered their social status. In Karachi, the Rent Controller's Office allotted Hindus' homes and businesses to *mohajirs*. Many corruption stories are narrated about this office activity. For example, one house was allotted to many persons. One room was fixed for four people. People bribed the office so their properties could not be confiscated. Hence, fair-share was not possible. Some were ignored badly; few received more than they deserved. It led to anti-government feelings among the refugees. Those who could not get permit or did not bother to get it, continued arriving in Sindh by crossing the Khokhrapar border. In 1950, this in-flow increased as a consequence of effective evacuee's property laws and disturbances in the UP (India). Also in both parts of Bengal and Assam, thousands of people moved across the eastern frontier of India. The Liaquat-Nehru Pact signed in 1950 was an attempt to reassure religious minorities of their rights and to reverse displacement. The agreement was broadly meant for the protection of minorities so it covered both India and Pakistan. Many people returned. But two year later, with the introduction of passport system, again there was a withdrawal from the agreed freedom of movement, contrary to the freedom allowed under the Liaquat-Nehru Pact.

Somehow the Indian government agreed to take back Muslims from the UP who had left for Pakistan. Only 95,000 out of 135,000 registered to go back. Merely 23,000 returned. Remaining numbers were a question mark; either they would settle in Pakistan or India. Despite all devised restrictions, 4000 to 5000 people crossed the Khokhrapar border every day. It made rehabilitation process very difficult. The Pakistani

government declared Karachi as ‘overcrowded’ to limit the ‘one-way traffic’. Such response angered the *mohajir* community all the more.

In the fifth and sixth chapters the author explains how the passport system was introduced in both countries to control this one-way traffic, and what sorts of anomalies followed it. Still ambiguities remained there about those who claimed that they never visited Pakistan or discarded passports on reaching India and applied for permanent citizenship or over-stayed after expiry date of passports. The author maintains that Muslims were discriminated frequently in dealing with such ambiguities. She throws light on *phantasm* of passport. Holders of Pakistani passports were considered Pakistani nationals. Either they went to Pakistan to visit or some other purpose; they required a passport to return India. On return, they claimed their Indian citizenship but they failed, despite having their relatives and family there. Their Pakistani passports became a source of contention for them. Few of them were granted long time stay on humanitarian basis but their status was declared as ‘undefined’ people. Among victims were women as well, who migrated with their husbands and later on became widows or divorced. When they returned they were refused Indian citizenship.

The author has investigated the reasons behind migration of refugees, not only from India to Pakistan but also from Pakistan to India. Her account deals with great concern the impact of migration on social lives of the refugees. Here the facts are narrated very logically and the presentation is very interesting. She maintains that understanding of the Partition phase is imperative to the South Asian landscape. She views it as a long formative phase in which economic, bureaucratic and judicial institutions and policies/legislations of both the states evolved. It happened through permits, evacuee property legislation and passports to control the peoples’ movements across the borders and rehabilitate them. This partition, she argues, is not yet over; rising right in India is still threatening the Muslim minority in India and considers them outsiders. In Pakistan, the Mohajir Qaumi Movement’s violent confrontation with the state must be understood in the perspective of long Partition. The book provides a great deal of insight in this respect. It inspires the future researchers to explore what still lies in the oral histories of those who faced the historic event of Partition.

Naseer Memon, *Sindh ki Pasmandgi: Haqaeq o Asbab*, Mustafa Hussain (tr.), published by Sindhi Adabi Sangat, Hyderabad, 2007, pp.112, price, Rs.100/-.

Based on the articles written by the author during 2006 and 2007, the book under review presents a gloomy picture of the province of Sindh. Even though the review of the book is a bit late but the contents as well as the analysis carried out in it are still relevant. The author Naseer Memon is a social analyst as well as an activist who contributes regularly to the newspapers. His association with civil society organizations has enabled him to look into the social and political issues of the society as deeply as is possible in our country. The chapters of the book were mostly published as articles in the Sindhi daily *Kawish*. These have been translated into Urdu quite meticulously. The book reflects the indepth knowledge as well as the deep insight of the author who has assembled a huge stockpile of useful data. Despite the poor quality of composing and an un-understandable negligence towards proof reading, to the extent that no page of the book is free from grammatical as well as typographical mistakes, the book still worths a lot. It is a mirror which shows us the crude reality of the province which presents a sad picture as far as its social structure and economic conditions are concerned. The author has taken pains in highlighting the actual and sad facts about the social sector, poor state of human development, weak infrastructure and misuse of its material and human resources. The author has successfully argued that the weakness does not lie in the people, who inhabit the province, nor their ethnic diversity can be blamed for this state of affairs, rather it is the failure of planning and the lack of vision on the part of the rulers who have remained at the helm of affairs.

As the author has himself remained associated with the field of education, his knowledge of this area and the other related matters and institutions is also commendable. He has also demonstrated good skills in methodologically investigating socio-economic issues. He has looked into the governance of water resources and their impact on environment, particularly in the background of the province.

The first chapter deals with the resources of Sindh and its dream of a prosperous future. He deals with the economic indicators of the province at the time of partition in 1947. Comparing these facts with the present day situation he concludes that instead of developing, Sindh has actually progressively suffered after independence. Despite being the third largest province in terms of territory and second in terms of population, the province has not developed as it should have in the context of its potential. Sindh has immense reservoirs of crude oil, gas

and coal. But its contribution to the overall resources of the country does not reflect fairly in the standard of living of its citizens. The major reason behind this, according to the author, is the control of the economic resources by a small group of economic and social elite of the province.

The second article deals with the economic crisis of the province. Taking a World Bank Report PK 35,001 as a major point of reference, the author holds that Sindh is primarily an agricultural land. More than half of its population live in villages and is directly related to agriculture or agro-based industries. Due to distortions in economic system and misplaced planning, unemployment is increasing day by day. At times, the funds allocated by the centre are also left unspent due to which both agriculture and industries suffer. The author strongly holds that the rural areas of Sindh are regularly neglected and are subjected to discriminatory economic policies.

The third and fourth chapters make the Sindhi middle class the theme of discussion. It is suggested that due to partition in 1947 a major portion of the Sindhi middle class migrated to India creating a void here. The Hindus who left Sindh created a vacuum which could not be filled even today. The Muhajirs or migrants who come from India and settled here tried to fill the vacuum. The migrants were mostly urbanized who came from different major or small cities of India. They brought with them education and technical knowhow with which they, losing no time, created a space for themselves in their new homeland. The Mohajirs or Urdu-speaking class soon found a place for itself in the power structure and in the social and economic life of the province.

Those migrants who were educated went in the leading roles in different walks of life; many of them also benefited from the policy of claims according to which a migrant could ask for a land or a property in Sindh as a compensation for the land or property he had left behind in India. The local people were not allowed to purchase the agricultural lands which were given to the migrant claimants. The growth of Sindhi middle class due to these and other reasons remained slow. Successive governments also made policies discouraging the rise of Sindhi middle class and the promotion of Sindhi language and culture. However, despite all these facts, the author claims, a Sindhi middle class is fast emerging on the scene. It is but natural that it looks for an enlarged political space. This emerging middle class has access to modern means of communication, jobs in private sector and quality education. The women are also making their presence felt.

The fifth and sixth chapters deal with the issues of provincial autonomy and the legitimacy to rule. The author holds that the amendments made in the constitution would not bear fruit unless the

provincial governments do not come up with new policies responding to the challenges of the society. He rightly says that provincial autonomy, if it does not give to the provinces the control over their resources, would remain meaningless.

According to the 1973 Constitution, oil and gas were federal subjects. The governments and people of Balochistan and Sindh had been demanding ownership rights over both these resources. The federal government gave 12.5 per cent royalty over these to the provinces. The author raises the question why the provinces having mineral resources have to depend on the federal government's allocations which does not accept their rights as judiciously as it should. History is replete with instances when regions having been deprived of their resources, protested against it and at times revolted as was the case of former East Pakistan.

Another article discusses the issue of establishing two new cities on two islands, Bhindar and Dingi near Karachi. Both these islands have been identified by International Union for Conservation of Nature (IUCN) as important regions for environmental protection. In June 1992, Pakistan had signed the document of United Nations Earth Summit held in Rio de Janeiro. Despite this, decision to construct two cities on the islands was taken. These islands inhabit sea birds, tortoise and shrimps. They also have mangroves forests. The people who live on islands depend largely for their food on the available diet around the islands. With very scarce resources, it is not advisable to deprive the local people even from what they are getting at present.

The author devotes one full chapter to a drainage project initiated in 1984. Accordingly, the water level in Nawabshah, Sanghar and Mirpurkhas had to be lowered in order to make the land cultivable. Though, the project was good, local conditions and problems were not taken into consideration. The project, also called Left Bank Outfall Drain (LBOD)¹ was completed at the cost of millions of rupees but the local fishermen were not taken on board due to which a number of practical problems came to the fore later. The tidal link which was constructed to link the underground water to the sea was between four lakes. The 1999 flood broke the link and the four lakes were spoiled because of the mixing of saline water with it. Such eventualities should have been considered at the time of the planning of the project.

The ninth and tenth chapters of the book deal with the reports of Asian Development Bank and the World Bank. According to Asian Development Bank's report prepared by Anzdec Consultant, schemes

¹ See the following web link for detail, siteresources.worldbank.org/INTPAKISTAN/Resources/LBOD2005POERreport.pdf.

have to be started in the coastal areas of Sindh for the eradication of poverty. The author observes that all such schemes which overlooked the point of view and perceptions of the local population are always likely to show their inconsistency over a period of time. This is what happened here in the case of the coastal regions of Sindh. The World Bank's report was quoted by President Pervaiz Musharraf on a number of occasions. The report advocated the establishment of Kalabagh Dam. The author asks how ignorant the compilers of the report were who did not give any weight to the aspirations of the people. Even Musharraf quoted only those parts of the report which concurred with his own and the establishment's thinking. He never refers to other matters indicated in the report, for example lack of competence of WAPDA, wrong decisions taken in the past, disagreement among the provinces and the other issues. These are the aspects which the author deals with in detail in his book.

The eleventh chapter highlights the need for research on the issues of Sindh. In the twelfth chapter the role of mass media has been discussed with the emphasis that our media should adopt the policy to project the interests of the people and should also help in creating awareness among them.

The last chapter of the book deals with the social sector and poor governance in the country. It is an analysis of a report devised to see the work of Asian Development Bank. According to the report, the social sector of Pakistan has had a very poor record. A mere 08 percent projects' success cannot be taken as the real success. The reason behind this poor performance of social sector is the lack of continuity in the policies. The budget allocation for the social sector has been very low. Moreover, a large part of whatever is allocated is subjected to corruption. To meet its needs Pakistan's dependence on foreign aid and loans has also increased.

The above articles have been written in the context of Sindh but a number of national issues having bearing upon provinces and provincial autonomy have been discussed by the author at length. The objectively written chapters have a lot to offer to the students, researchers and other concerned persons who wish to address the poverty of Sindh. Another good thing about the book is that it is written in Urdu. In English we do get useful material and data but good researched books in Urdu, with focus on social issues are quite rare. The book under review, therefore, will be a useful addition to the literature on the Sindh province.

Qayyum Nazar Chaudhry, *Mohsin-e-Milat: Chaudhry Muhammad Ali*, published by Al-Qamar, Lahore, 2013, pp.184, price, Rs.250/-.

Chaudhri Muhammad Ali figures prominently in the history of Pakistan as he served as a senior civil servant and prime minister of the country. Before independence, though he was in the service of the colonial regime, he was quite close to the leadership of the Muslim League. His engagement with the government service gave him the knowhow about the organizational structure, its order and behavior and also the merits and demerits of its working. His contribution in the establishment and development of Pakistan civil service soon after the creation of the country, earned him the support of the Quaid-i-Azam who had posed his trust and faith in him.

After independence Chaudhri Muhammad Ali played very active role in statecraft. Pakistan was created in very unusual circumstances. As the Secretary General of the new government he had to work with all the ministries and had to remove differences and misunderstanding among different ministries. He was assigned the task to lay down the rules of business and to work out the rights and duties of the ministers. Quaid-i-Azam had himself appointed him as the Secretary General of the new state.

The Finance Minister Ghulam Muhammad also relied heavily on him, for preparing the budget. Chaudhry Muhammad Ali had also won the confidence of Prime Minister Liaquat Ali Khan. Ayub Khan goes to the extension to mention in his book that ‘Liaquat Ali Khan was under the considerable influence of Chaudhry Muhammad Ali’.² As Secretary General he helped ministries, on safety and peace issues particularly with respect to the provinces. Despite being a civil servant he made unusual interventions in country’s politics; he also played an important role in devising Pakistan’s policy on Kashmir.

Laying down, along with others senior civil servants, parameters of Pakistan’s foreign policy, establishment of its administrative infrastructure, resolving the rehabilitation problem of the migrants, etc., were some of the many noticeable tasks performed by him. Some people thought that the post of Secretary General was created just for him. Ali himself wrote about it in his book, *Emergence of Pakistan*:

I feel that it is necessary to state this because the post later came to be so closely identified with me that some thought it had been specially created for me. This impression was

² Mohammad Ayub Khan, *Friends Not Masters (A Political Autobiography)*, Oxford University Press, Karachi, 1969, p.40.

strengthened when the post of secretary General was not filled, but was allowed to lapse when I became Finance Minister in October, 1951.³

Friends and foes both acknowledged the good manners of Ali. Ayub Khan wrote in his book that Chaudhri Muhammad Ali had the least resources but he solved all problems. When he became the Prime Minister of Pakistan in 1955, he passed the 'One Unit' bill and said that it was conceived in the best interests of the country and the people. He also said that the unification of West Pakistan would bring the people of all provinces closer to each other and will provide opportunity to discuss common problems for their betterment.

After the establishment of One Unit he undertook the important task to frame the constitution, which was promulgated on 23 March 1956. However, Ali could not serve for long as the Prime Minister of the country as a crisis in his own party, the Muslim League, compelled him to resign.

When the constitution was abrogated and Iskandar Mirza declared martial law on 7 October 1958, the national and provincial assemblies were dissolved, and Ayub Khan imposed restrictions on political parties, Ali continued to raise his voice against dictatorship. He united different political parties and played key role in the formation of the united front of the opposition parties, the Combined Opposition Party (COP). The party gave tough time to Ayub Khan in 1965 elections. Likewise, Chaudhri Muhammad Ali played very important role in Pakistan's politics in 1968-69, during the anti-Ayub regime movement.

In his book Qayyum Chaudhry discusses the personality and achievements of Chaudhry Muhammad Ali. The author divides the book into seven chapters. In the first chapter, he discusses the family background of Chaudhry Muhammad Ali who was born in Jalandhar district. He got his early education in a small school but his interest in education was quite apparent right from the beginning. After completing studies, he joined the Indian Audit and Accounts Service.

In the second chapter, the author traces the earlier stages of Chaudhri Muhammad Ali's career. He presented his services as non-official advisor in the Interim Cabinet formed on the eve of partition. He requested Quaid-i-Azam and Liaquat Ali Khan to accept the ministry of finance in the Interim government. When the Interim government presented its annual budget, which was prepared by Liaquat Ali Khan with the help of Chaudhry Muhammad Ali, it at once became a subject

³ Chaudhri Muhammad Ali, *The Emergence of Pakistan* (Lahore: Research Society of Pakistan, 1989), p.243.

for discussions. Given its pro-people provisions, it came to be called the “poor man’s budget”.

In the third chapter, the author acknowledges the services of Chaudhry Muhammad Ali as the Secretary General of the new state of Pakistan. His office played a key role in the establishment of various economic institutions. The duty of the Secretary General was also to co-ordinate the work of various ministries and to ensure their smooth functioning.

Chaudhri Muhammad Ali became Finance Minister in October 1951. He setup the Planning Commission and Pakistan Industrial Development Corporation (PIDC). He played important role in the establishment of the State Bank and took keen interest in the Training Institute of Civil Service Officers, Pakistan Accounts Service, the Salary Commission, Kakul Academy etc. He was also behind the planning of the Mangla and Tarbela dams.

In the fourth chapter, Qayyum refers to the role of Chaudhri Muhammad Ali as the Prime Minister in 1955. His tenure as Prime Minister was very short but in this brief period he demonstrated his strong commitment to Pakistan. His economic policies were appreciated by both national and international press. He was successful in finally piloting the constitutional bill that became the first constitution of Pakistan. It was a remarkable achievement that after nine years’ long struggle the constitution was finally made and was promulgated on 23 March 1956. He was also a strong supporter of One Unit as he considered the One Unit scheme very important for the economic development of this region.

The fifth chapter discusses the role of Ali after he left the post of prime ministership. After his resignation he did not remain quiet. He worked for the restoration of democracy after the imposition of martial law in 1956. He joined the COP in 1964. The manifesto of the coalition party was also prepared by him. He discussed the Kashmir issue in his articles and speeches in that period. Not many politicians were raising their voice for the resolution of the Kashmir issue at that time.

The book under review is a good attempt in searching for the role of Chaudhri Muhammad Ali in the history and politics of the country, but it is not a comprehensive work on its subject. The author has collected some good documents / speeches of Chaudhri Muhammad Ali, has also seen the newspapers’ record and made use of the Urdu translation of the *Task Before Us*. In his address delivered on Iqbal Day at Lahore, Chaudhri Mohammad Ali spoke at length about Ayub’s policies and described the development era of Ayub Khan as a farce. When Ayub Khan abrogated the 1956 Constitution he was the first man

who raised his voice against Ayub's act. He gave comprehensive and argumentative reply to the questionnaire of the Constitution Commission, setup by Ayub Khan in order to propose what provisions should be kept in the new constitution.

In the seventh chapter the author gives a chronological overview of Ali's life. After reading the book, a number of questions emerge in the mind of the reader. The writer, for example, does not explain why Chaudhri Muhammad Ali joined the Nizam-i-Islam Party whereas he belonged to the Muslim League, or, why after the separation of East Pakistan he resigned from practical politics, and as to why he chose to support martial law of Gen. Zia-ul-Haq? Another lapse of the book is that under the heading of bibliography and references, both the sections have not been prepared properly.

Pakistan Study Centre,
University of Karachi.

Sadaf Masood