

Documents *July-December 2011*

I. Foreign Policy

A. PAKISTAN AND AFGHANISTAN

Prime Minister's arrival statement on his condolence visit to Kabul on the *shahadat* of Professor Rabbani

I am here to offer my heartfelt condolences and deepest sympathies to Afghan people especially to the family of Prof. Burhanuddin Rabbani and to the families of all others who lost their lives or were injured in this appalling attack. Pakistan condemns in the strongest terms the terrorist attack that led to the *shahadat* of Prof. Burhanuddin Rabbani. His death is a huge loss not only for Afghanistan but for the whole region. The people of Pakistan stand by their Afghan brothers in this moment of grief.

Acts of terrorism constitute a common threat to both our countries and we are together in our joint struggle to combat and eliminate this menace. Prof. Rabbani being a visionary leader was convinced that violence was not an answer to the problems of Afghanistan. He believed in political solutions. We have been working closely within the Afghanistan-Pakistan Joint Commission for Peace and Reconciliation on a vision for peace and prosperity in Afghanistan. I fondly recall his two visits to Islamabad in January and June this year.

We will always remember Professor Rabbani as a great friend of Pakistan and an emissary of peace. He was killed by those who were enemies of peace in Afghanistan. This cowardly act has only reinforced the resolve of the people of Afghanistan to pursue peace and stability. I have no doubt that Prof. Rabbani's dream for peace will come true and we will see a peaceful Afghanistan on its way to progress and prosperity.

23 September 2011. *source: www.mofa.gov.pk.*

B. PAKISTAN & INDIA

1. Joint Statement following meeting between S.M. Krishna Minister of External Affairs of India, and Hina Rabbani Khar, Minister of Foreign Affairs of Pakistan

1. The Minister of External Affairs of India, H.E. S.M. Krishna and the Minister of Foreign Affairs of Pakistan, H.E. Ms. Hina Rabbani Khar met in New Delhi on July 27, 2011.
2. The Ministerial level talks were preceded by a meeting between the Foreign Secretaries of India and Pakistan on July 26, 2011.
3. The talks were held in a candid, cordial and constructive atmosphere.
4. The Ministers reviewed the status of bilateral relations and expressed satisfaction on the holding of meetings on the issues of Counter-Terrorism (including progress on Mumbai trial) and Narcotics Control; Humanitarian issues; Commercial & Economic cooperation; Wullar Barrage/Tulbul Navigation Project; Sir Creek; Siachen; Peace & Security including CBMs; Jammu & Kashmir; and promotion of friendly exchanges.
5. The Ministers affirmed the importance of carrying forward the dialogue process with a view to resolving peacefully all outstanding issues through constructive and result oriented engagement, and to establish friendly, cooperative and good neighbourly relations between Pakistan and India.
6. The Ministers underlined the need for sustained effort by both countries to build a relationship of trust and mutually beneficial cooperation in conformity with the determination of the people of both countries to see an end to terrorism and violence and to realise their aspirations for peace and development.
7. The Ministers agreed that terrorism poses a continuing threat to peace and security and reiterated the firm and undiluted commitment of the two countries to fight and eliminate this scourge in all its forms and manifestations. Both sides agreed on the need to strengthen cooperation on counter-terrorism including among relevant departments as well as agencies to bring those responsible for terror crimes to justice.
8. The Ministers noted with satisfaction the fact that since the resumption of dialogue earlier this year, the process of release of prisoners and fishermen from both sides has continued. In this regard, the Ministers agreed with the recommendations of the Judicial Committee on Prisoners regarding (a) early repatriation of the prisoners who have completed their sentences and whose travel documents are available; (b) adoption of a humane approach in dealing with cases of fishermen, women, elderly, juvenile prisoners, prisoners terminally ill or suffering from serious illness or physical / mental disability and (c) need to monitor the welfare of prisoners in order to ensure their humane treatment.
9. The Ministers attached importance to promoting peace and security, including Confidence Building Measures, between India and Pakistan and agreed to convene separate meetings of the Expert Groups on Nuclear and Conventional CBMs, in Islamabad in September 2011.
10. The Ministers held discussions on the issue of Jammu and Kashmir and agreed to the need for continued discussions, in a purposeful and forward looking manner, with a view to finding a peaceful solution by narrowing divergences and building convergences.

11. On Cross-LoC trade and travel facilitation for Jammu & Kashmir the Ministers decided the following:-

CROSS-LoC TRADE:

- i) List of 21 products of permissible items for Cross-LoC trade will be respected by both sides. The Working Group will review the trading list with a view to further specifying permissible items to facilitate intra-Jammu & Kashmir Cross-LoC trade.
- ii) Both sides will provide adequate facilities at the trade facilitation centres on each side.
- iii) The number of trading days stand enhanced from 2 to 4 days per week. Truck movements shall take place on Tuesdays, Wednesdays, Thursdays and Fridays, both on Srinagar-Muzaffarabad and Poonch-Rawalakot routes.
- iv) The Designated Authorities will resolve operational issues concerning cross-LoC trade through regular interaction.
- v) Regular meetings between the Chambers of Commerce and traders of both sides will be facilitated.
- vi) Existing telephone communication facilities should be strengthened.
- vii) The meetings of the Designated Authorities will be held alternately at the Terminal of the Crossing Points on both sides of the LoC every quarter or as and when deemed necessary.

CROSS-LoC TRAVEL

- i) Cross-LoC travel would be expanded on both sides of the LoC to include visits for tourism and religious pilgrimage. In this regard, the modalities will be worked out by both sides.
- ii) Facilities including waiting area, terminal and clearing procedures at the operational crossing points will be streamlined by both sides for smooth Cross-LoC travel.
- iii) The Cross-LoC bus service between Srinagar-Muzaffarabad and Poonch-Rawalakot routes will henceforth run on every Monday.
- iv) Application forms and requisite documentation in respect of travel across LoC will be exchanged by email between Designated Authorities of both sides. Such email transfer of application forms will be backed up by hard copies.
- v) Both sides will expedite the processing time for applications, which shall not be more than 45 days.
- vi) Six month multiple entry cross-LoC travel permits will be allowed by the Designated Authorities after completion of the required formalities at an early date.
- vii) Coordination meetings between the Designated Authorities will be held at the Terminals alternately on both sides of the LoC every quarter or as and when deemed necessary.

It was agreed that the Joint Working Group will henceforth meet on a bi-annual basis to review existing arrangements and suggest additional measures for Cross-LoC travel and trade.

12. The Ministers agreed that increase in trade and economic engagement between the two countries would be mutually beneficial. In this context, they emphasized the importance of early establishment of a non-discriminatory trade regime between the two countries, including reduction/removal of tariff and non-tariff barriers. They also emphasised the need for facilitating trade and redressing trade imbalance. The Ministers noted with satisfaction that during their meeting held in Islamabad in April 2011, the Commerce Secretaries of the two countries had decided on a number of important steps to realize the full potential of bilateral trade.
13. The Ministers agreed that discussions will continue on Siachen, Wullar Barrage/Tulbul Navigation Project and Sir Creek to find a mutually acceptable solution to these issues. They reiterated their commitment to seeking early and amicable solutions to all these issues. They reaffirmed their commitment to the Indus Waters Treaty.
14. The Ministers also agreed that people of the two countries are at the heart of the relationship and that issues of people-to-people contacts and humanitarian issues should be accorded priority and treated with sensitivity. They noted with satisfaction the progress made towards finalization of a revised Visa Agreement which would help liberalise the visa regime and facilitate people-to-people, business-to-business and sports contacts.
15. The Ministers also emphasized promotion of cooperation in various fields including, facilitating visits to religious shrines, media exchanges, holding of sports tournaments and cessation of hostile propaganda against each other.
16. The Ministers decided to resume the work of the India-Pakistan Joint Commission and agreed that the Technical Level Working Groups should hold their meetings to identify avenues of further cooperation in these fields.
17. They reaffirmed their commitment to the goals and objectives of SAARC and agreed to make joint efforts to promote cooperation for regional development in the SAARC framework.
18. It was also decided that the Foreign Ministers will meet again in Islamabad in the first half of 2012 to review progress in the dialogue process.
19. The Ministers agreed to the continuation of the dialogue process and to the convening series of Secretaries level meetings on Counter-terrorism (including progress on Mumbai trial) and Narcotics Control; Humanitarian issues; Commercial and Economic cooperation; Wullar Barrage/Tulbul Navigation Project; Sir Creek (at the level of Additional Secretaries/Surveyors General); Siachen; Peace & Security, including CBMs; Jammu & Kashmir; and Promotion of Friendly Exchanges. Dates of all these meetings will be decided through diplomatic channels and will be held prior to the next Ministerial meeting.
20. The Ministers noted that Shri Anand Sharma, Hon'ble Minister for Commerce and Industry of India, has extended an invitation to his

counterpart, H. E. Makhdoom Amin Fahim, Minister of Commerce of Pakistan to visit India at a mutually convenient date.

21. The Minister of Foreign Affairs of Pakistan will be calling on Dr. Manmohan Singh, Hon'ble Prime Minister of India. She will also be calling on Smt. Sushma Swaraj, Hon'ble Leader of the Opposition (Lok Sabha).

Islamabad, 27 July 2011.

2. Remarks made by Foreign Minister Hina Rabbani Khar in New Delhi

Excellency Shri S.M. Krishna,
Minister of External Affairs of India,
Members of the Press Corps,
Ladies and Gentlemen,

First of all, I wish to thank the External Affairs Minister, Shri S.M. Krishna for the gracious hospitality extended to me and my delegation ever since our arrival in New Delhi.

I am indeed delighted to be in this historic city to carry forward the important process of Pakistan-India engagement.

I bring to the people and leadership of India warm greetings from the people and Government of Pakistan. I also bring the personal commitment of President Zardari and Prime Minister Giliani to usher in a new era of bilateral cooperation.

My talks today with the External Affairs Minister have been substantive and were held in a cordial atmosphere. I told the External Affairs Minister that after having an intensive dialogue with him I am more confident.

It was my endeavour to reach a deeper level of understanding, which would enable us, together, to impart the requisite political will for a productive and result-oriented dialogue process.

We express our satisfaction on the holding of subject-specific meetings during the last five months. We have agreed that this process should continue in fact, there is no alternative to dialogue and a constructive engagement.

Pakistan and India are not only close neighbours but also have a special responsibility to promote stability, peace and work for the prosperity of our region as a whole. We are partners in SAARC and subscribe to SAARC's vision of shared prosperity and peace.

I have conveyed to the External Affairs Minister, Shri Krishna that Pakistan seeks friendly, cooperative and good neighbourly relations with India. To achieve this objective, we need to invest more in building mutual trust; infuse greater political will in resolving all outstanding issues through peaceful means; and continue to work the process of dialogue to deepen our understanding.

We must make every effort to narrowing down divergences and building convergences. It is important that as responsible states, we take ownership for our affairs.

In recent months, we have seen intensification of contacts at different levels between our two countries. Following the meeting of the Prime Ministers of Pakistan and India in Thimphu last year, a momentum has been generated. It is important to sustain this momentum and develop a truly people-centered approach. We are not unmindful of the challenges that confront us. However, there are also enormous opportunities to create what I would call win-win scenarios.

It is in this spirit that I wish to convey to the people India, Pakistan's desire to open a new chapter of amity and understanding between our two countries. A chapter that is supported by all political parties in Pakistan.

I was heartened by what Minister Krishna informed me in the meeting. He said that at the Commonwealth Games the team that received the most applause from the crowd after India during the "march of nations" was Pakistan. This reflects that the youth of India and Pakistan are looking towards a new era of friendship and cooperation.

I have noticed a mindset change in both countries. I bring you the message of a mindset change in Pakistan that wants friendship with India.

We have agreed to issue a Joint Statement that gives the salient points of our discussion as well as the decisions taken. I need not amplify these here.

I wish to thank Shri S.M. Krishna, once again, for his invitation and for being a gracious host.

New Delhi, 27 July 2011.

3. Joint Statement issued on the fifth round of Pakistan-India expert level talks on conventional CBMS

As agreed during the meeting of the two Foreign Ministers in New Delhi on 27 July 2011, the Fifth Round of Expert Level Talks on Conventional CBMs between Pakistan and India was held in Islamabad on 26 December 2011.

The Pakistan delegation to the talks was led by Mr. Munawar Saeed Bhatti, Additional Secretary (UN&EC), Ministry of Foreign Affairs. Mr. Y.K. Sinha, Joint Secretary (PAI) of the Ministry of External Affairs, led the Indian delegation.

The talks were held in a cordial and constructive atmosphere.

The two sides reviewed the implementation of existing CBMs, including the ceasefire along the LoC, and reaffirmed their commitment to continue discussions on conventional CBMs.

The two sides will report progress made during the current round of talks to their respective Foreign Secretaries

Islamabad, 26 December 2011.

4. Joint statement issued on the sixth round of Pakistan-India expert level talks on nuclear CBMS

Pursuance to the agreement between the two Foreign Ministers in New Delhi on 27 July 2011, the Sixth Round of Expert Level Talks on Nuclear Confidence Building Measures was held in Islamabad on 27 December 2011.

Pakistan delegation was led by Mr. Munwar Saeed Bhatti, Additional Secretary (UN&EC), Ministry of Foreign Affairs. Mr. D.B. Venkatesh Varma, Joint Secretary (DISA), Ministry of External Affairs, led the Indian side.

The talks were held in a cordial and constructive atmosphere.

Both sides reviewed the implementation and strengthening of existing CBMs in the framework of Lahore MoU, and agreed to explore possibilities for mutually acceptable additional CBMs.

The two sides agreed to recommend to their Foreign Secretaries to extend the validity of the "Agreement on Reducing the Risk from Accidents Relating to Nuclear Weapons" for another five years.

Both sides will report the progress in talks to their respective Foreign Secretaries.

Islamabad, 27 December 2011. *Source: www.mofa.gov.pk.*

C. PAK-IRAN RELATIONS

Joint communique issued at the conclusion of the official visit of Syed Yusuf Raza Gilani, the Prime Minister of the Islamic Republic of Pakistan to the Islamic Republic of Iran

1. The Prime Minister of Islamic Republic of Pakistan, His Excellency Syed Yusuf Raza Gilani, paid an official visit to the Islamic Republic of Iran from 11-13 September, 2011. He was accompanied by Foreign Minister, Mrs. Hina Rabbani Khar, Minister for Professional and Technical Training, Mr. Riaz Hussain Pirzada, Minister for Textile Industry, Makhdoom Shahabuddin, Senator Sughra Hussain Imam and senior officials.
2. The Prime Minister of Pakistan was accorded a very warm and cordial welcome on arrival in Tehran, reflecting the close bonds of brotherly relations between the two countries.
3. The Prime Minister held talks with President Dr. Mahmoud Ahmadinejad and the First Vice-President Mohamad Reza Rahimi. He also met the Speaker of the Iranian Majlis, Dr. Ali Larijani.
4. The talks were held in a cordial atmosphere and covered the entire spectrum of bilateral relations as well as regional and international issues of mutual interest. The discussions were characterized by similarity of views on

important issues. Special emphasis was placed on enhancing bilateral cooperation comprehensively. They noted that Iran and Pakistan shared deep cultural and historical bonds and that there were immense opportunities to optimally utilize their economic complementarities for shared progress and prosperity.

5. The two sides expressed their determination to further strengthen the bilateral relations by enhancing closer cooperation in all areas including political, security, economic, commercial, cultural and people to people relations.
6. They noted that a number of mechanisms including a Joint Economic Commission at ministerial level are already in place and a number of agreements have been signed for the promotion of bilateral economic interaction. They agreed to fast track implementation of various joint projects, create a facilitative regime to enhance economic and trade cooperation, upgrade rail and road connectivity and take steps for shared progress and prosperity.
7. Both sides agreed to enhance cooperation in counter terrorism and to interdict drug trafficking.
8. The two sides agreed that the ECO region possessed great potential for the development of economies of the member countries. They shared the view that ECO could play an important role in accelerating the progress and development of the entire region.
9. It was agreed between the two sides to enhance mutual interaction through regular exchange of high level visits with a view to strengthening the fraternal relations between Pakistan and I.R. Iran. For this propose they decided to establish a Joint Working Group led by the two Foreign Ministers and a Security Committee, led by the two Interior Ministers.
10. Expressing satisfaction over the two countries' cooperation in energy including Oil, Gas and Electricity, both sides stressed implementation of the agreements within the framework of the signed documents pertaining to Gas Pipeline and Iran-Pakistan Electricity transmission line.
11. In view of the importance of cooperation in banking for promotion of trade and economic cooperation both parties stressed the necessity for providing the two countries' businessmen and employers with appropriate banking facilities.
12. Both Parties stressed the need for taking full advantage of the potential of Iran-Pakistan Joint Investment Company (PAIR) to implement joint projects in the two countries.
13. Both parties agreed to upgrade the necessary facilities for strengthening cooperation in the tourism and cultural fields.
14. The two side agreed to enhance mutual corporation in the areas of medical, scientific and technical training.
15. Underlining the importance of peace and stability in Afghanistan the two sides expressed their support for an Afghan-led and Afghan- owned process of reconciliation and peace in Afghanistan. Keeping in view the importance

- of a regional solution the two sides reiterated their commitment to the Afghanistan-Iran-Pakistan trilateral mechanism.
16. The Prime Minister of Pakistan also visited his ancestral city in Gilan province as well as the city of Mashad to pay homage at the mausoleum of Hazrat Imam Reza (A.S).
 17. The two sides agreed to declare Multan and Rasht (capital city of Gilan province) as sister cities. Necessary legal formalities in this regard will be completed expeditiously by the concerned authorities.
 18. The Prime Minister of Pakistan expressed his appreciation for the warm welcome and the traditional hospitality extended to him and the members of his delegation.
 19. The Prime Minister of Pakistan extended cordial invitation to the President and the First Vice President of the I.R. Iran to pay official visits to Pakistan. The invitations were accepted with gratitude.
 20. Done at Tehran in two copies in English and Persian on 13 September 2011, corresponding to Iranian date 22 Shahrivar 1390, both texts being equally authentic.

14 September 2011. *Source: www.mofa.gov.pk.*

D. PAKISTAN & THAILAND

1. **Message from Prime Minister of the Kingdom of Thailand on 60 years of establishment of diplomatic relations between Thailand and Pakistan**

On the auspicious occasion of the sixtieth anniversary of the establishment of diplomatic relations between the Kingdom of Thailand and the Islamic Republic of Pakistan, it is my privilege and honour to extend my warmest greetings and best wishes to the Government and people of Pakistan.

The ties between our two countries and deeply rooted in culture and history which have enabled our friendship to blossom over the past sixty years. The State Visit to Pakistan of His Majesty King Bhumibol Adulyadej and her Majesty Queen Sirikit in 1962 cemented this friendship in the hearts and minds of the Thai people.

Thais know Pakistan as a historical center of higher learning. Over the decades, thousands of Thai students graduated from Pakistan, broadening the friendship between our two peoples. This is most vividly reflected in the compassion and mutual assistance extended by the two countries to one another when the other faced natural disasters.

Today, it is important for the two countries to build on this strong foundation and take our relations to new heights. We therefore hope to see greater interaction between the Thai and Pakistani business communities, in order to bring forth greater trade, investment, and mutual prosperity.

We extend our sympathies and support to the continuing efforts of Pakistan to address the challenges of terrorism and extremism as well as Pakistan's aspiration to enhance its links with Southeast Asia and ASEAN. We also believe that the two countries can expand and deepen their cooperation in countless other fields of mutual interest.

Looking forward, Thailand will continue to expand and deepen our excellent relations with Pakistan as part of our "Look West" policy so that, the peoples of Thailand and Pakistan will continue to enjoy friendship and cooperation for generations to come.

(Yingluck Sihanawatra)

Prime Minister of the Kingdom of Thailand

26 October 2011.

2. Messages of the Prime Minister and Foreign Minister of Pakistan on 60 years of establishment of diplomatic relations between Thailand and Pakistan

Prime Minister Mr. Yusuf Raza Gilani and Foreign Minister Ms. Hina Rabbani Khar, have sent messages to the Prime Minister and Foreign Minister of Thailand on the occasion of 60 years of establishment of diplomatic relations between Pakistan and Thailand. The messages reiterate the strong bonds of friendship and cooperation between the two countries and express the resolve to carry forward the relations from strength to strength. The messages sent by the Prime Minister and the Foreign Minister of Pakistan are reproduced below:-

Message of Prime Minister, Yusuf Raza Gilani

Excellency,

On the auspicious occasion of the 60th anniversary of diplomatic relations between Pakistan and Thailand, I have great pleasure in conveying, on behalf of the government and people of Pakistan, and on my own behalf, our cordial greetings and warm felicitations to the government and people of Thailand.

The diplomatic journey that Pakistan and Thailand have traversed together is six-decades old now. But, on the civilizational journey, we have been together for over two thousand years. Pakistan has proudly preserved and promoted the Gandhara heritage that forms an immutable bond between our two countries and peoples. This cultural connection will always be a central pillar of our relationship.

Over the past sixty years, Pakistan and Thailand have developed bilateral relations on the basis of cordiality, mutual trust and understanding, and close cooperation. The highest point of our shared history has been the landmark state visit of Their Majesties King Bhumibol Adulyadej and Queen Sirikit to Pakistan in 1962 and it continues to serve as beacon of light for the future.

As our political ties have deepened in the past decades, so has our trade and commercial collaboration expanded appreciably. Today, our multifaceted relations encompass diverse areas – from security to education to science & technology.

Located strategically in their respective regions, Pakistan and Thailand have also made significant contributions in these years to the promotion of peace, progress and prosperity. Through intensified mutual collaboration, both countries can advance shared objectives like regional connectivity and trans-regional development cooperation. Indeed, within the framework of Pakistan’s “Vision East Asia” policy and Thailand’s “Look West” policy, which are complementary and mutually-reinforcing, we can forge win-win-cooperation on the vast opportunities before us.

With flourishing bilateral ties and convergent regional strategies, Pakistan and Thailand are well-placed to build a strong partnership that helps advance the cause of peace and security as well as economic well-being of the people of our two countries and the region. I look forward to working with Your Excellency to promote this vision of our bilateral relationship in the years to come.

Please accept, Excellency, the assurances of my highest consideration.

(Syed Yusuf Raza Gilani)

Her Excellency,
Ms. Yingluck Shinawatra,
Prime Minister of the Kingdom of Thailand,
Bangkok.

Message of Foreign Minister, Ms. Hina Rabbani Khar

Excellency,

It gives a great pleasure and privilege for me to convey our sincere and heart-felt felicitations on the auspicious and joyous occasion of the 60th anniversary of establishment of diplomatic relations between Pakistan and Thailand.

The Pakistan-Thailand relationship is rooted deep in history and culture and has always been marked by cordiality and close cooperation. In the sixty years since establishing diplomatic ties, our two countries have collaborated fruitfully, both on the bilateral as well as regional plane. We have also worked closely in the multilateral fora to promote shared ideals and objectives.

It is gratifying that bilateral cooperation continues to grow steadily and encompass myriad fields – including political, trade investment, commercial, security, education, science & technology, culture and people-to-people

contacts. Regionally our collaboration on issues of common interest continues to strengthen at the bilateral level as well as within the framework of ASEAN.

As we look to the future, we have no doubt that this journey of friendship between our two nations will lead to a strong partnership of mutual benefit in all areas. Both countries possess the requisite political will to move in that direction and our respective “Vision East Asia” and “Look West” provide a complementary framework for such a transformation.

I wish to take this opportunity to reassure Your Excellency of our commitment to work together in the years ahead for the realization of this common objective and for building a Pakistan-Thailand partnership that serves our two nations as well as the cause of progress and prosperity in the region and beyond.

Please accept, Excellency, the assurance of my highest consideration.
(Hina Rabbani Khar)

His Excellency,
Mr. Surapong Tovichakchaikul,
Minister for Foreign Affairs,
of the Kingdom of Thailand,
Bangkok.

Islamabad, 11 October 2011. *Source: www.mofa.gov.pk.*

E. PAKISTAN & THE UN

Foreign Office statement on the launch of UN’s Rapid Response Plan for Pakistan

The United Nations launched in Islamabad, on 18 September, the Rapid Response Plan (RSP) for Pakistan Floods 2011 that has asked for assistance worth US \$357 Million to help the Government of Pakistan in its efforts to respond to the needs of over 5.4 million people affected by monsoon rains and flooding in southern Pakistan. The Plan is based on six months needs and will be revised within 30 days to reflect the evolving humanitarian needs.

The Plan was launched by Timo Pakkala, UN Humanitarian Coordinator in Pakistan. Dr. Firdous Aashiq Awan, Minister for Information, representatives of diplomatic missions, international agencies, INGO’s and senior government officials were present at the launch. Mr. Pakkala urged the international community to support the RSP. This would help save human lives. He added that international partners should assist in the government-led effort to meet the immediate needs of the affected people.

Minister for Information thanked the United Nations for the Plan and requested an urgent response to address the needs of the affected people in Sindh and Balochistan.

UN Office for the Coordination of Humanitarian Affairs also released the Rapid Response Plan Floods 2011 in Geneva on 19 September in coordination with the Pakistan Permanent Mission to the United Nations. Minister for Information addressed the participants in Geneva through video link from Lahore. A presentation was made from Islamabad by Member Operations of the National Disaster Management Authority (NDMA) and the UN Humanitarian Coordinator.

Dr. Awan urged the international community to generously contribute to the Plan and help the affected people. She assured the participants that the Pakistan government will ensure transparency and accountability in the delivery of relief goods. Ambassador Zamir Akram, Pakistan Permanent Representative in Geneva, thanked representatives of member states and international organizations for their expression of support.

The assessment of the affected population is ongoing. NDMA estimates that as of 20 September, the affected population in Sindh and Balochistan has risen to over 8.15 million.

Islamabad, 20 September 2011. *Source: www.mofa.gov.pk.*

F. PAK-US RELATIONS

1. **Foreign office statement on Foreign Minister Hina Rabbani Khar's meeting with the US Secretary of State Hillary Clinton**

Foreign Minister Hina Rabbani Khar met US Secretary of State Hillary Clinton last night for three and half hours. The two Ministers held in-depth exchange of views on all aspects of bilateral relations, regional and international issues.

The talks were marked by the desire to deepen understanding and by candour. They were constructive and forward looking. The need for clarity and coherence was emphasized. It was also agreed to re-set relations and to endeavour to overcome “perceptual” issues.

The meeting was multi dimensional and covered all aspects of the bilateral relationship. Issues of economic development, cooperation in energy and infrastructure development as well as effective delivery to the people were emphasized. The issue of ROZ legislation was also raised. Foreign Minister Khar underscored the fact that the relationship was not aid dependent and that the focus should be on enhancing trade between the two countries.

Both sides agreed on the importance of fighting terrorism and terrorist outfits wherever they were. This required coordinated action.

Foreign Minister Khar stressed that the onus of responsibility of effectively countering terrorism must be shared by all. Areas that harbor terrorists on the other side of the border from where attacks are launched on Pakistani men, women and children must be dealt pro-actively. It was agreed that both sides need to coordinate their counter-terrorism effort to be able to achieve results. Foreign Minister Khar emphasized to Secretary of State Clinton

that Pakistan needs to be assisted by the world at large for the unique role it has played. Ordinary Pakistanis must feel that their sacrifice is being recognized. Pakistanis longstanding request for greater market access must be viewed as a step towards targeting the root cause of terrorism by providing economic opportunities that limit terrorist outreach to vulnerable populations.

The meeting provided the opportunity for good substantive discussions on all issues.

Islamabad, 19 September 2011.

2. Statement issued by the defence committee of the cabinet on the NATO/ISAF attack on border posts

1. An emergency meeting of the Defence Committee of the Cabinet was chaired by the Prime Minister this evening at the Prime Minister's House. Federal Ministers, Chairman Joint Chiefs of Staff Committee, Services Chiefs and members of the DCC attended.
2. The DCC strongly condemned the attack by NATO/ISAF aircrafts on Pakistani border posts in the Mohmand Agency which has resulted in the loss of precious lives of officers and men of Pakistan Army and injuries to several.
3. The DCC expressed heartfelt sympathies and condolences to families of the brave soldiers who fought valiantly and embraced Shahadat, and also prayed for the early recovery of those injured.
4. The DCC reiterated the resolve of the Pakistani people and Armed Forces to safeguard Pakistan's sovereignty, independence and territorial integrity at all costs.
5. The DCC noted that strong protests had been lodged with the United States and at NATO Headquarters in Brussels conveying in the strongest possible terms Pakistan's condemnation of these attacks which constituted breach of sovereignty, were violative of international law and had gravely dented the fundamental basis of Pakistan's cooperation with NATO/ISAF against militancy and terror. NATO/ISAF attacks were also violative of their mandate which was confined to Afghanistan. Pakistan had clearly conveyed to US/NATO/ISAF its red lines which constituted an integral element of Pakistan's cooperation that was based on a partnership approach. The attack on Pakistan Army border posts is totally unacceptable and warrants an effective national response.
6. In accordance with the resolution of the Joint Session of the Parliament of 14 May 2011, the DCC decided to close with immediate effect the NATO/ISAF logistics supply lines.
7. The DCC also decided to ask the US to vacate the Shamsi Airbase within 15 days.

8. The DCC decided that the Government will revisit and undertake a complete review of all programmes, activities and cooperative arrangements with US/NATO/ISAF, including diplomatic, political, military and intelligence.
9. The Prime Minister will take the Parliament into confidence on the whole range of measures regarding matters relating to Pakistan's future cooperation with US/NATO/ISAF, in the near future.

Islamabad, 26 November 2011. *Source: www.mofa.gov.pk.*

II: Political Developments

A. NATIONAL SECURITY

1. Prime Minister Gilani's statement on national interest

In a statement made today, Prime Minister Syed Yusuf Raza Gilani said the propaganda blitz against Pakistan is indeed most unfortunate. It vitiates the atmosphere and is counter-productive. It tends to ignore the sacrifices by the people of Pakistan and negates all that we have endeavoured to achieve over the last so many years. More than 35,000 Pakistanis have fallen victims to the acts of terrorism and many many more have been injured. We have taken resolute action against terrorists and militants. We have done so in our national interest. The United States knows very well the full account of large number of Al-Qaida operatives that were interdicted, captured and killed by our security forces. Terrorists are targeting innocent civilians, bombing our markets and places of worship and carrying out targeted assassinations against security and law-enforcement personnel.

The allegations betray a confusion and policy disarray within the US establishment on the way forward in Afghanistan. Clearly, there is concern over the deterioration of the security situation in Afghanistan. Recent attacks in Kabul including on the US Embassy were disquieting. We condemn these attacks. I was in Kabul recently to convey our condolences and express solidarity with people and leadership of Afghanistan on the tragic assassination of Professor Rabbani.

There is the need for close policy coordination between Afghanistan, Pakistan and the US. We need to develop a clear and coherent strategy together. A clear roadmap so that all three i.e. Afghanistan, Pakistan and the US are on the same page and work together for achieving the stated goal of reconciliation and peace. It is with this in view that we established the Trilateral Core Group which has met four times.

Clarity and strategic coherence would lead to the necessary operational policy coordination. Realities and the dynamics of the situation on the ground

also need to be objectively factored. It is with this in view that we consistently signaled closer and deeper engagement with the US and Afghanistan.

Blame-game is self-defeating. We strongly reject assertions of complicity with the Haqqanis or of proxy war. It will only benefit the enemies of peace. Only terrorists and militants will gain from any fissures and divisions. Pakistan's credentials and sacrifices in the counter-terrorism campaign are impeccable and unquestionable.

Pakistan cannot be held responsible for the security of US NATO/ISAF forces in Afghanistan. While there have been terrorist attacks in Kabul and Wardak, there have also been numerous attacks on Pakistan launched from sanctuaries and safe havens in Nooristan and Kunar in Afghanistan. It is as much the responsibility of the Afghan National Army, NATO and ISAF not to allow such cross-border militancy. Joint operations and coordination are essential. Let's be objective and not get carried away by emotions.

In our recent interaction with the United States, including Foreign Minister's meeting with the Secretary of State, as well as at the military and intelligence tracks, we have emphasized the need for deeper engagement. However, this can only take place on the basis of mutual respect. Let's avoid mutual recrimination and recommit ourselves to working together for eliminating terrorism and for reconciliation and peace in Afghanistan.

Pakistan's national interests will guide our policy

Islamabad, 24 September 2011

2. Opening remarks of the Prime Minister at the conference of the leaders of the political parties

• Honourable Leaders of the Political Parties,

Assalam-o-Alaikum

I wish to thank you, first of all, for kindly accepting my invitation for this meeting of the leaders of the political parties of Pakistan and have given a clear message of national unity to the nation and the world.

We are gathered here today to deliberate on issues relating to national security.

The purpose, of course, is not only to brief you on the complexity of regional developments but also to have in depth discussion with a view to adopting a well considered national response.

The political parties are the authentic representatives of the people of Pakistan. It has been democratic government's consistent endeavour to forge national consensus on all important issues.

National security is a foremost priority. Complete unity in our ranks and a well-deliberated policy is of critical importance.

Our nation is proud and resilient. Collectively we can overcome any challenge. We must acquit ourselves of this high responsibility honourably and in the national interest. Situated in a region of geo-strategic significance, Pakistan has been impacted directly and severely by the turbulence in our immediate neighbourhood.

I need not to go into the history of conflict and strife that engulfed Afghanistan since 1979. However, it is clear that conflicting interests of global and regional powers have collided in this region with devastating consequences.

Believing in the principles of humanity and mindful of our responsibilities under the Charter of the United Nations, Pakistan has carried the burden of the international community and made relentless effort in the interest of regional security, stability and peace.

We are at a new turning point in the regional situation. The quest for reconciliation and peace in Afghanistan is compounded by an increase in violence.

On the request of the Government of Afghanistan, we signaled our readiness to facilitate an Afghan-led, Afghan-owned inclusive process for peace and reconciliation. A Joint Commission was established for this purpose which is co-chaired by President Karzai and myself.

We also agreed to form a Trilateral Core Group consisting of Afghanistan, Pakistan and the United States for the purposes of consultation, cooperation and coordination at the strategic and operational planes.

While these initiatives were ongoing, the security situation in Afghanistan, particularly in Kabul, started to deteriorate. There have been several terrorist attacks in Kabul recently. The tragic assassination of Chairman of the High Peace Council Professor Burhanuddin Rabbani constitutes a huge setback to peace process.

It is in the backdrop of these developments that we were surprised by statements from responsible US officials. These were in sharp variance with Pakistan's numerous sacrifices and achievements in the struggle against terror and militancy.

We have rejected these assertions and underscored the importance of addressing all issues in a mature, reasonable and responsible manner.

We have always said that the only way forward is to engage constructively by deepening engagement at all levels.

Blame game is counter-productive. This should end and Pakistan's red lines and national interests must be respected.

Any perceptual differences and issues should best be resolved through a constructive dialogue.

The only reasonable basis for conducting inter-state relations is to adhere to principles of sovereign equality, mutual interest and mutual respect. Pakistan cannot be pressured to do more.

Our national interest must be respected and honored.

Our channels of communication remain open. We are reaching out to the international community.

I am confident that the political leadership and the people of Pakistan will once again reaffirm, in unequivocal terms, their resolve to defend the sovereignty, independence and territorial integrity of our sacred motherland.

Pakistan is proud of its armed forces and has full confidence in their capabilities for ensuring national defence.

Every new challenge presents new opportunities. Insha'Allah, we will rise together and prove equal to the tasks at hand.

Setting aside our political differences, we have gathered here to uphold national security. I request that we should focus today on the challenge to our country, so that the nation and the world can see that we stand united in safeguarding Pakistan's sovereignty, territorial integrity, national dignity and honour.

Now I request the Foreign Minister to brief the meeting

Islamabad, 29 September 2011.

3. Resolution of the conference of the leaders of all the political parties

1. On the invitation of Prime Minister Syed Yusuf Raza Gilani, the leaders of Pakistan's political parties met in Islamabad on September 29, 2011 to consider issues relating to national security.
2. The conference was briefed by Foreign Minister Ms. Hina Rabbani Khar and Director General ISI, Lt. Gen Ahmed Shuja Pasha on the security environment of the country and the regional situation.
3. After in-depth deliberations, leaders of all political parties unanimously resolved, as follows.
 - i. As a peace-loving country, Pakistan desires to establish and maintain friendly and cordial relations with all countries of the world on the basis of sovereign equality, mutual interest and respect.
 - ii. All parties Conference recognized that there has to be a new direction and policy with a focus on peace and reconciliation. "Give peace a chance" must be the guiding central principle henceforth.
 - iii. Pakistan must initiate dialogue with a view to negotiate peace with our own people in the tribal areas and a proper mechanism for this be put in place.
 - iv. We need to further enhance our brotherly bilateral relations with Afghanistan at three levels on priority basis: government to government, institution to institution and people to people.
 - v. The APC recognized the sacrifices of the people and the Security Forces of Pakistan, especially the people of Khyber Pukhtunkhwa and tribal areas. The international community needs to recognize these tremendous sacrifices as well as the colossal magnitude of destruction in Pakistan.

- vi. Pakistan can enhance its self-reliance comprehensively. Trade, note aid, should clearly be the way forward. We should also focus on internal economic and tax reforms as well as resource mobilization and the curbing of corruption.
- vii. Defence of Pakistan's sovereignty and its territorial integrity is a sacred duty which shall never be compromised.
- viii. National interests are supreme and shall guide Pakistan's policy and response to all challenges at all times.
- ix. Pakistan shall continue to endeavor to promote stability and peace at the regional and global planes, in accordance with the principles of the Charter of the United Nations and international law.
- x. All earlier unanimous resolutions of the Parliament, the recommendation of the Joint Parliamentary Committee on National Security must be implemented.
- xi. APC rejected the recent assertions and baseless allegations made against Pakistan. Such assertions are without substance and derogatory to the partnership approach.
- xii. The Pakistani nation affirms its full solidarity and support for the armed forces of Pakistan in defeating any threat to national security.
- xiii. A Parliamentary Committee be formed to oversee the implementation of earlier resolutions as well as this Resolution and progress on the same be made public on monthly basis.

Islamabad, 29 September 2011.

4. Statement by Prime Minister Yusuf Raza Gilani at defence committee of the cabinet

Federal Ministers,
Chairman Joint Chiefs of Staff Committee,
Services Chiefs,
Members of the DCC,

I have convened this emergency meeting of the Defence Committee of the Cabinet to evaluate the situation arising from the NATO/ISAF air attacks on Pakistani border posts in the Mohmand Agency in which 24 officers and men of the Pakistani Army lost their lives and 13 were injured, some of them critically.

I have, on behalf of the Government and the people of Pakistan, expressed our strong indignation and condemnation of these attacks. On my instructions, a strong protest has been lodged with the US and at the NATO Headquarters in Brussels.

The Foreign Secretary called in the US Ambassador and conveyed in no uncertain terms that these attacks constituted a grave breach of Pakistan's sovereignty were in flagrant violation of international law and a breach of the

red lines that had been clearly indicated to the United States as well as to the NATO/ISAF.

The whole basis of Pakistan's cooperation with NATO/ISAF that was based on mutual respect and mutual trust has been called into question by these attacks. The border coordination mechanisms and established norms and rules to ensure against such incidents were bypassed or ignored.

Our cooperation with the United States, NATO/ISAF was premised on fundamental and essential understanding on following a partnership approach to curb militancy and terror.

Targeting of Pakistani posts well inside the Pakistani border, especially when the location of these posts were known to the other side, cannot but be seen as extremely unfortunate and provocative and thus calls into question the very basis of cooperation.

I have called this meeting of the DCC to not only evaluate the situation but also deliberate the steps necessary in providing an effective national response to these unwarranted and unacceptable attacks.

I wish to express my heartfelt condolences to near and dear ones of the brave men who embraced Shahadat and also our prayers and good wishes to those who sustained injuries.

I would now call on the Director General Military Operations to give us a briefing.

5. Press release on the meeting of the federal cabinet

The Federal Cabinet met today under the Chairmanship of the Prime Minister Syed Yusuf Raza Gilani at the Governor House Lahore.

The Cabinet offered Fatiha for the Shuhada (martyrs) of the Salalah check post in Mohmand Agency.

The Cabinet condemned the NATO/ISAF attacks on Pakistani soldiers and termed them as an assault on the sovereignty of Pakistan.

The PM took the Cabinet into confidence on the decisions of the Defence Committee of the Cabinet (DCC). The Prime Minister stated that there could be no compromise on Pakistan's sovereignty and territorial integrity nor on the nation's resolve to safeguard its frontiers no matter what the cost.

After extensive deliberations, the Cabinet unanimously took the following decisions:-

- 1) The Cabinet appreciated the prompt initiative of the Prime Minister to convene an emergency meeting of the DCC.
- 2) Endorsed the statement and decisions of the DCC emergency meeting.
- 3) The Cabinet noted with satisfaction that the decisions of the DCC, which include immediate closing of NATO/ISAF logistic supply lines and asking the United States to vacate the Shamsi Air Base within fifteen days, stand implemented.

- 4) Endorsed also the decision of the DCC to review Pakistan's cooperation with the US/NATO/ISAF and regretted that despite Pakistan's continued efforts to play a positive role for stability and peace in countering terrorism and militancy in the region, the sacrifices of the nation have not been recognized. Actions such as these attacks were contrary to the spirit of partnership and business as usual was no longer possible.
- 5) Prime Minister also took the Cabinet into confidence of referring this incident to the Parliamentary Committee on National Security. The recommendations of the Committee will be submitted before the Joint sitting of the Parliament.
- 6) The Cabinet called upon the international community to take due cognizance of such attacks which constitute a violation of the UN Charter principles, international law and could have serious repercussions for regional peace and security. It was imperative that all sides realize the gravity of the situation and exercise utmost restraint.
- 7) The Cabinet reaffirmed Pakistan's support for stability and peace in Afghanistan and the importance of an Afghan led, Afghan owned process of reconciliation and expressed the hope that the international community will reaffirm its support for peace and development in Afghanistan at the forthcoming Bonn Conference. Pakistan looks forward to the success of this Conference but in view of the developments and prevailing circumstances has decided not to participate in the Conference.

Islamabad, 29 November 2011.

6. Foreign Office statement on Prime Minister's address to the concluding session of envoys conference

1. Addressing the concluding session of the two-days Envoys Conference today, Prime Minister Syed Yusuf Raza Gilani stressed that Pakistan's foreign policy was based on immutable principles. The Charter of the United Nations, norms of inter-state conduct and international law provided the framework for Pakistan's endeavours to ensure peace and security— both in its own region and the world.
2. The Prime Minister said that Pakistan's cooperation with US/NATO/ISAF was based on respect of Pakistan's sovereignty and territorial integrity. "Under no circumstances, Pakistan could accept flagrant transgression of our territorial frontlines. This remains the base line and there can be no compromise on our sovereignty, dignity and national honour".
3. The Prime Minister commended the Foreign Office for its continued efforts in ensuring that Pakistan's diplomacy had the resilience and efficacy to overcome all challenges posed by a complex global and regional environment.

4. Earlier, Foreign Minister Hina Rabbani Khar welcomed the Prime Minister and apprised him of the deliberations at the conference on (i) evaluation of the regional situation and implications for Pakistan; (ii) identification of core foreign policy objectives; and (iii) review of the terms of cooperation between Pakistan and US/NATO/ISAF.
5. Ms. Sherry Rehman, Ambassador nominated to the United States, presented the recommendations made by the Envoys Conference to the Prime Minister. She said that, as directed by the Prime Minister, the Envoys of Pakistan from select capitals evaluated important aspects of Pakistan's foreign policy. They were also guided by the resolutions adopted by Parliament (22 October 2008 and 14 May 2011) which reflected the aspirations of the people of Pakistan. The Envoys discussed a wide range of Pakistan's relationships with key countries, as well as international organizations and assessed the overall regional situation.
6. The Envoys Conference reaffirmed that Pakistan's external relations continued to be based on the principles of respect for sovereignty, independence and territorial integrity in accordance with international law as enshrined in the United Nations Charter.
7. Yesterday, the plenary session of the Envoys Conference was chaired by Foreign Minister Hina Rabbani Khar. In her opening remarks, the Foreign Minister emphasized that Pakistan's foreign policy was to realize the Quaid-e-Azam's vision of "peace within and peace without". She underlined that Pakistan's national interests would continue to govern its relations with other countries. The plenary session was also addressed by the Finance Minister, Chairman Chief Joint Staff Committee and Director General ISI.

Islamabad, 13 December 2011.

III: Human Rights

Balochistan: Blinkered slide into chaos Report of HRCP fact-finding mission

Balochistan is Pakistan's largest province, comprising approximately 43 percent of the country's total land area. It is rich in mineral resources and is the second major supplier of natural gas in an energy-starved Pakistan. Control over these resources and the extent of provincial autonomy have long remained contentious issues. But a larger issue has remained the exclusion of the Baloch people from the decision making regarding how their affairs are governed and persistence of the state with the use of force to address questions that are essentially political in nature.

Balochistan stands out for more than one reason even in the appalling human rights situation across Pakistan today. The state's security apparatus in the province has been accused of serious human rights violations. By far the largest number of enforced disappearances in any province of the country has been reported from Balochistan. In a recent aggravation, bodies of missing persons have started turning up in the province with increasing frequency. The right to life and freedom from arbitrary detention are violated with impunity. Violent streaks of sectarianism, extremism, nationalism and separatism have all played a part. An armed insurgency is underway in the province. Bands of extremists have a free hand in intimidating and killing people. Targeted killings and kidnappings for ransom are pervasive. Members of religious minority communities are at greater risk and have been forced to migrate to other parts of the country and abroad. Journalists and human rights defenders have been targeted for highlighting violations of rights. The state accuses other countries of seeking to destabilise Pakistan by interfering in Balochistan. Even if such a role is there, it has been made possible because the situation was volatile enough to begin with.

Besides demands such as the release of the missing persons, the people in Balochistan also have the same demands and yearn for the same rights as the people elsewhere in Pakistan. They demand realisation of their economic, social, cultural and political rights, in particular access to healthcare, education and work opportunities, building and improvement of basic infrastructure, and a say in matters that affect their life, including their rights over natural resources.

Deeply concerned by the rapidly deteriorating situation in Balochistan, the Human Rights Commission of Pakistan (HRCP) organised a factfinding mission to the province from May 4 to 7, 2011.

Earlier, HRCP had conducted detailed factfinding missions to Balochistan in 2005 and 2009. In October 2009, the entire Executive Council of HRCP spent one week in Balochistan, visiting various parts of the province to see firsthand the human rights situation as well as to meet senior government officials and representatives of the people. At the conclusion of the 2009 mission, HRCP had suggested the following recommendations with a view to improve the situation. These remain as relevant and direly needed today as they were in 2009.

1. There is an urgency to create a climate of confidence and trust in Balochistan so that wider consultation with all stakeholders becomes possible. As a first step towards confidencebuilding, demilitarisation of the province is essential.
2. There is a need to restructure laws related to civil armed forces and define their role and the substance of reform needs to be debated in parliament.
3. In the long run, all political forces of the province should be brought into the political mainstream.
4. The people of Balochistan need to be assured that they will have full authority to decide their affairs including the management and control of the province's natural resources.

5. Baloch people's overriding concerns about missing persons and displaced people should be addressed and decision-making powers restored to civilian, elected representatives of the people. On the issue of disappearances there is need to set up a high-level commission with powers to investigate cases of disappearance, examine witnesses and summon any state functionary who has had anything to do with these matters.
6. All those illegally held must be freed and compensated. Political prisoners need to be released and perpetrators of human rights violations brought to justice.
7. There is a need to raise awareness among the people outside Balochistan on what is going on in the province.
8. There is a need to set up industrial zones in Quetta and other urban centres of the province where the young people could use their potential and get employment.
9. Civil society needs to increase its activities in Balochistan to monitor the human rights situation and democratic development and mainstream the concerns of the Balochistan people.
10. National media's coverage of Balochistan is sketchy and inadequate; it needs to allocate more print space and airtime to the issues confronting Balochistan. The coverage of Balochistan issues needs to be made part of the national coverage.
11. The quality of education is quite low in Balochistan and owing to continued violence and subsequent closure of educational institutions the students of Balochistan have suffered in terms of education. In the circumstances, Baloch students cannot compete with the students of other provinces and need to be given preferential treatment in admission to colleges and universities and in government employment.
12. Last, but not the least, actions speak louder than words. The government needs to take practical steps to provide relief to the people of Balochistan, such as providing employment to the youth, increased funds for the provincial government, withdrawal of army and paramilitaries from the Baloch territory, release of political prisoners and disappeared persons and constitutional amendments for greater provincial autonomy. In short a political settlement is urgently needed and vital if Balochistan is to be spared any more pain.

The May 2011 fact-finding mission by HRCP was also aimed at assessing what changes had taken place in Balochistan since October 2009. Members of the mission visited Khuzdar, Turbat and Quetta and met a wide cross-section of people. They also met government officials, wherever they responded positively to HRCP's requests for meetings.

The Fact-finding mission

From May 4 to 7, 2011, the HRCP fact-finding mission for Balochistan visited Quetta, Khuzdar and Turbat (Makran) to meet people from all walks of life with a view to get first hand information on the human rights situation in the

province. The mission was divided into two teams, one meeting representatives of a cross-section of society in Turbat from May 5 to 7 and the other in Quetta (May 4, 5 and 7) and Khuzdar (May 6). In this report, many individuals interviewed by members of the mission have not been identified by their name for the sake of their safety.

The mission members were HRCP Chairperson Zohra Yusuf, Co-chairperson Kamran Arif, former chairperson Dr Mehdi Hasan, HRCP Balochistan chapter Vice Chairperson Tahir Hussain Khan, HRCP Sindh chapter Vice Chairperson Amarnath Motomal, HRCP Council members Hina Jilani, Zahoor Ahmed Shahwani and Habib Tahir, and HRCP National Coordinator for District Core Groups Husain Naqi. The mission members were assisted in their work by Fareed Ahmad, coordinator of HRCP Balochistan chapter, Ghani Parwaz, HRCP coordinator in Turbat, and Kamal Ayub, Turbat District Core Group Coordinator.

At the outset the mission expressed serious concern that the threats against human rights defenders in Balochistan had become particularly grave. HRCP expressed its deep anger and sadness at the killing of two of its activists, Siddique Eido and Naeem Sabir, in 2011. HRCP also expressed alarm at the lack of efforts to punish their killers despite repeated reminders.

At the conclusion of the visit, the HRCP chairperson announced the preliminary findings of the mission at a press conference in Quetta.

Visit to Turbat

Main areas of inquiry

A. Disappearances:

The mission interviewed family members of eight missing persons from various districts of Makran Division. Other material was also collected to assess the situation. The issue of the disappeared was also raised in a meeting with the Commissioner of Makran Division, and the District Coordination Officer (DCO) and District Police Officer (DPO) of Kech district.

The mission received information on disappearances from HRCP activists. Official figures on the disappeared were also obtained.

Findings and observations

In the cases of enforced disappearance brought before it, the mission found that there were credible allegations of the involvement of state security forces, particularly the Frontier Constabulary (FC).

There was material on record to substantiate claims of the families that the victims were disappeared by the FC or had been killed while in custody. Many of the disappearances had occurred at public places. In others, some of the individuals picked up along with the still missing persons had returned and confirmed that they were held in FC custody. However, they could not confirm the whereabouts of those still missing as, reportedly, everyone was confined separately during their detention. While the abductors were reported to be men

in plain clothes most of the time, the mission also heard of cases where some of them were in FC uniform.

Of those who reappeared after prolonged disappearances, most were left at remote places, and could not identify the exact location of their place of detention. This could be because of fear of retaliation for revealing any information regarding their custody by the FC, or because they were detained in such a manner that made it impossible for them to locate these places.

While First Information Reports (FIRs) had been registered with the local police in almost all cases of enforced disappearance, there had been no efforts by the police to investigate the cases. It seemed that the involvement of the state security agencies, particularly the FC, was well known and the police did not take any action despite the cases being brought to their attention. This indicated that there was either an unstated policy not to interfere with actions of the FC or the civil law enforcement authorities themselves feared the military and paramilitary forces. In one particular case, a young man named Abid Saleem was picked up from Chitkar Bazaar in Panjgur on January 23, 2011 together with five other men, who had no connection with him. Everyone present in that part of the bazaar saw uniformed FC personnel together with plainclothesmen take the boys into custody. An FIR was registered on January 26, 2011 with Panjgur Police Station and FC personnel were nominated for the disappearance. This was one of the many cases noted by the mission where FC personnel had been specifically nominated in the FIR on charges of abducting individuals. However, the mission did not come across even a single case where the police had included the FC personnel in the investigation. Instead of making any efforts to recover the disappeared persons, the police did not even ask any questions of the FC personnel.

The mission learnt that at least one of the persons picked up along with Abid Saleem was found alive. He had been shot and severe torture was inflicted on him and he was thrown by the roadside together with the dead body of another person disappeared with him on January 23 from Chitkar Bazaar in Panjgur. His tormentors had apparently thought that he too had died after being shot in the throat. There had been no investigation in this case by the police although an FIR was registered at the time of the disappearance. No medical records were collected, even though, reportedly, the survivor did receive medical treatment.

The mission did not meet any person who had returned from enforced disappearance, but from information given by the families of the disappeared with whom they had reportedly been in touch, it appeared that torture during detention was common.

The mission noted that the civil authorities in Makran Division were accessible to the people and in almost all cases heard by the mission the families of the victims approached them to brief them on their cases. However, the FC and other intelligence and security agencies involved were totally inaccessible to the people. The mission was informed that the people distrusted the security forces as much as they feared them.

The people were generally disappointed by the role of the political figures in their area. While they acknowledge that these people were sympathetic and accessible for listening to their grievances, they were completely helpless and had no influence over the military and paramilitary authorities. The people were aggrieved that these political elements lacked the courage to take political initiatives to curb the illegal activities of the FC.

Enforced disappearances have created an acute climate of fear amongst the people of Makran Division, with many families affected by such incidents. These incidents have contributed to the growing alienation of the people from the state and hatred towards the security forces and intelligence agencies under the control of the Pakistan military.

The mission observed that young men between 16 to 25 years of age were being particularly targeted. Many of them were either students or unemployed youth. Some of the incidents indicated random picking up of young men, for example, from picnic spots and markets.

The mission was unable to gain authentic information on the affiliation, or otherwise, of any of the disappeared with any political or armed groups, nor was it in a position to ascertain their political views. It is, nevertheless, a distinct possibility that many of these young persons were targeted because of their political views rather than any legitimate suspicion of their involvement in illegal activities.

Many of those interviewed by the mission had appeared before the Commission of Inquiry on Enforced Disappearances set up by the government in early 2010. While most of them initially had high expectations of that Commission, its inability to procure the recovery of their missing relatives had given way to disillusionment and disappointment even with the judicial process employed by the Supreme Court.

Some of those who had appeared before the inquiry commission complained of intimidation by the intelligence personnel present at the hearings. Reportedly, the commission members did not intervene in such instances to reassure or give a sense of security to the family members appearing before it or to discourage the intelligence personnel from such conduct.

Relatives of the missing persons complained about the inquiry commission's expectation that the families would produce witnesses, when neither the commission nor the government had made any arrangements for protection of witnesses. The witnesses themselves and the families of the disappeared feared for the safety of the witnesses and did not want to risk exposing themselves to 'mischief of the agencies'.

They also complained that it was a financial burden for them to appear before the inquiry commission in Quetta and Karachi. The commission had made no arrangements for their travel nor reimbursed the travel cost. Some people had appeared before the commission more than once. They claimed that when the inquiry commission called for statements to be recorded by the local police, the statements were either tampered before being forwarded to the

commission or those recording the statement were intimidated or coerced into holding back facts that substantiated allegations against the security agencies.

Almost all the people that the mission met who had filed petitions in the Balochistan High Court against incidents of enforced disappearance were

Figures on enforced disappearances in Makran:

Jan 1, 2007 – May 5, 2011

HRCP figures as on May 5, 2011

District Kech: 9

District Gawadar: 7

District Panjgur: 6

Total: 22

Official figures obtained by HRCP

Total missing reported in 2010 & 2011: 53

Returned: 11

Dead bodies found: 22

Still missing: 20

disappointed and complained of lack of judicial independence, competence and capacity to give relief. Many had the disturbing perception that the judiciary in the province was deliberately refraining from interfering in the policies and actions of the security forces.

B. Extra-judicial and targeted killings:

The mission gathered facts and figures indicating the occurrence of a large number of extra-judicial killings in Makran Division over the past two years.

The official figures indicated that 22 dead bodies of persons reported to be missing had been found from different places. These were treated by the mission as cases of extra-judicial killings as the families of these persons had all claimed that they were ‘disappeared’ by personnel of state security forces and were later killed in custody. HRCP activists have listed 48 dead bodies of victims of enforced disappearance from Makran in the past one year.

The mission also heard of one incident in Turbat in which five persons were killed by FC personnel during an armed operation at the house of Ayub Jan Gichki, a local farmer and a leader of Balochistan National Party, on December 1, 2010. Those killed included two sons of Ayub Gichki and three other men. The FC personnel had taken a sixth man into custody.

From the information it received from the family and from the civil administration officials involved (the Commissioner, and the DCO), the mission could not but conclude that the incident was a case of deliberate killing by FC personnel. The mission heard credible accounts that supported the version of the family that no opportunity was given to the five men to surrender, even though assurances had been given while the men were still alive that they would surrender and would be handed over to the FC if the firing stopped and Ayub Gichki was allowed to proceed to the house with local notables. However,

Gichki was stopped about one kilometer away at an FC checkpoint and was not allowed through. He then contacted the Commissioner, the DCO, a senator and other influential political people, who joined him at the check point but were not allowed to proceed to the house.

The mission also visited the site and saw the house that bore marks of mortar and gunfire. One room of the house seemed to have been burnt by fire caused by the shelling. The destruction of the house observed by the mission pointed to disproportionate use of force by the FC. The mission noted that even if the FC version was true that a Kalashnikov rifle and two pistols had been recovered from the house and that they had been fired on from inside the house, any firing from the three weapons could not justify the intense retaliation by the FC that lasted for nearly nine hours, from around 4:30 am until 2 pm.

No inquiry had been ordered to ascertain the facts or to attribute responsibility for the incident, despite the serious charge of extrajudicial killings in an operation in which the use of disproportionate force was obvious, five people had been killed, and where denial of an opportunity of surrender was apparent from the accounts of responsible civil authorities.

The mission expressed concern that the blatant use of force by the paramilitary force without any accountability had not received any response from the civilian government in the province. No voice was even raised in the Balochistan Assembly with reference to the incident, in which the civil authorities were direct witnesses to the interventions with the FC at the local and provincial level in an attempt to spare the lives of the five men.

The mission noted that concerns raised by the United Nations, other international forums and human rights organizations had contributed to the pressure on the government to provide information in cases of killing of human rights defenders and other serious violations of human rights. The mission was shown requests sent to the authorities by the UN Special Rapporteur on Extrajudicial Summary or Arbitrary Executions as well as from the Working Group on Enforced or Involuntary Disappearances seeking information on progress in the cases of HRCP activists Siddique Eido and Naeem Sabir. Siddique Eido had become a victim of enforced disappearance in Pasni in December 2010 and his dead body was found from Ormara on April 28, 2011. Naeem Sabir was murdered in a targeted killing in Khuzdar on March 1, 2011.

The mission also received information on targeted killing of non-Baloch in Makran Division. Although still relatively fewer in number, the climate of fear that such killings had created amongst the non-Baloch residents in the region was intense. The mission noted that little had been done to investigate the cases and the tendency to relegate responsibility for these killings to vague, unidentified entities was contributing to a sense of insecurity amongst the targeted population of *abadgaars* (settlers from other regions of the country). The mission also noted with regret that a few amongst the Baloch nationalist elements tacitly condoned these killings and explained them as a 'natural reaction' to the oppression in the province.

The mission strongly disagreed with such sentiments and categorically stated that no cause justified the killing of innocent people and considered that anyone involved in such practices was committing a heinous crime and violating all principles of human rights.

C. Governance and law enforcement:

i. Civil-military relations in the province

The mission noted the absence of the political government and the civil authorities from critical areas of decision making. The political government had abdicated its responsibility towards the people and hid behind its own helplessness in the face of domination of the military and intelligence agencies in the decision making process in the province. Several incidents recorded by the mission on enforced disappearances, extra-judicial killings and other lawless actions of the security forces depicted the manner in which the political government had failed in its responsibility to protect people's rights and fundamental freedoms. The mission found it even more disturbing that the government officials at the higher level did not even attempt to negotiate on behalf of the people, and the political elements had not taken any political initiatives to change the power equation in the province.

The civil authorities at the local level were more willing to intervene with the military and paramilitary forces, albeit without much success. The mission noted in particular the complete disregard of the military authorities towards the political government and the civil authorities. There was not even a semblance of following the prescribed rules of governance under a democratic dispensation which made the situation in Balochistan different from that in the other provinces. The Makran civil administration was very open in their criticism of their marginalisation by the security apparatus from the law and order crisis. The Commissioner said that they did not even know what the military's security imperatives were in Makran Division. He emphasised that there was a security crisis and an insurgency was under way in the province and that this reality could not be ignored. He stressed the need for a civil intelligence network that would be accountable to the civil government, be that provincial or federal. The mission concluded from the information it received that the civil authorities were not being taken on board and there was no sharing of information by the military authorities, which made administration of law and order by the civil authorities impossible.

The impact on the people of a lack of democratic governance was more visible because of the complete inaccessibility of the security forces to the people. The mission noted that the military and intelligence agencies were equally inaccessible for the civil authorities. In the meeting with the Makran Division Commissioner the mission became aware of the frustration of the top local authorities when they were informed that the local commander of the FC became unavailable for any meeting called by the Commissioner and attended only when it suited him, regardless of the importance of the matters on the agenda. The HRCP mission also experienced this inaccessibility when, despite

repeated requests, it was not granted an opportunity to meet with the local FC commander in Makran or the FC Inspector General in Quetta. The mission, therefore, had no opportunity to get the FC version regarding the serious allegations against the paramilitary force.

On the other hand, it was observed that despite the knowledge that the civil authorities had no power to help them, people continued to approach the civil authorities and the political elements, including those in the government.

ii. Political viewpoints

The mission met with representatives of political parties and groups that represented a spectrum of political positions and opinion in the province.

These groups included:

- Balochistan National Party
- Balochistan National Party-Mengal
- Balochistan Students Organization
- Baloch Republican Students Organization (Bramdagh Bugti Group)
- Balochistan Students Organization-Azad
- Jamaat-e-Islami

While most of these groups had common grievances against the state, the alienation from the state was at varying degrees. The student groups, in particular were insistent that the Baloch had no option but to demand independence from Pakistan. Many of these groups did not support use of violence as part of the struggle for independence, but were very clear that the struggle was legitimate and that their right to selfdetermination should be a part of the political discourse on Balochistan. There were, however, those who felt that violence was justified as part of the struggle for an independent Balochistan in the face of aggression and repression by the security forces in the province. The representatives of one such group that met with the mission were extremely bitter because of what they saw as ‘the injustices by the Punjab’.

The demands of the pro-independence groups were:

- Removal of military and paramilitary forces from the province as a demonstration of a genuine commitment to end ‘occupation’ of the province;
- Eviction of all ‘settlers’ from the province, especially the Afghan refugees who had settled in the province permanently with rights of residence bestowed on them to change the demography of the province;
- Restoration of the traditional Baloch territories, e.g., Jacobabad;
- Independence of Balochistan as a separate state.

Within an independent Balochistan they wished to establish:

- a. An end to the tribal system;
- b. Liberal, social democracy;
- c. A secular state with equality of status for all citizens.

The political parties, however, spoke about self-determination more in the context of autonomy. They bitterly complained against the current political government, pointing towards corruption, failure to raise critical issues of military repression in the province and generally about their inability to govern and total subservience to military authority in the province. They insisted that the military had total control of decision making from issues of law and order to decisions on mega projects. They accused political parties of collaborating with the centre for dampening politics in the province. The mission concluded from these conversations that there was no longer any interest among the provincial political entities in a common platform to protect and promote interests of Balochistan within the Federation. This was largely the result of repeated failures of any initiatives to remove the ever-increasing sense of victimization and deprivation widely prevalent in the province. The political parties seemed also isolated by their individual interests.

Denial of control over natural resources as well as other benefits of development in the province was the major grievance. There was no support for the Aghaz-e-Huqooq-e-Balochistan package, which was announced by the federal government and approved by parliament. Almost everyone who met the mission said that the package was meaningless in the context of the situation in the province and that even the things promised under the package had not been delivered. The 5,000 jobs given under the package were also not of much value as these were one-year contracts and offered no permanent solution to the acute unemployment amongst the Baloch youth.

Almost everyone that the mission met said that the killing of Nawab Akbar Bugti in a military operation in August 2006 had been the turning point in Balochistan and that it had led many Baloch to support the call for independence. The mission noted in particular the absence of a political discourse amongst the political elements in the province. When asked the question, most of the political groups responded that the environment of fear was not compatible with any political discussion. Several political rallies in the recent past had been fired upon as a measure to repress political activity. This was a major cause of underground movements springing up. Some also stated that the time for politics was over, and now even within the province there was a polarization of views on whether politics in the context of Pakistan was of any relevance.

iii. Civil society

The mission met with representatives of human rights and development NGOs, journalists, local Bar associations, teachers, associations, academics and religious minorities.

The main issues of concern raised by the civil society were:

- Enforced disappearances and killings
- Obstacles in the freedom of movement by the FC, in particular humiliation at the check points.

- Surveillance and interrogation of human rights defenders (HRDs) and NGO workers:
 - i. Community trainers were under particular scrutiny.
 - ii. HRD activities were difficult when the community withdrew engagement out of fear of security and intelligence agencies.
 - iii. Workshops with participation of foreigners were not possible without obtaining no-objection certificate (NOC) from the federal government
 - iv. Activists attending the funeral of HRD and HRCF activist Siddique Eido were harassed to the extent that an FIR was reportedly registered against some of them on trumped up charges.
- Lack of academic freedom, because of a threatening environment created by both state agencies and political activists
- Deteriorating educational standards and lack of facilities for students, especially girls
- Problems faced by teachers included:
 - i. Political influence in the Education Department
 - ii. Appointments, postings, promotions determined not by merit but by political affiliation
 - iii. A freeze on all increments
 - iv. Repression of the freedom of association
 - v. Unheeded demands despite strikes and protests
 - vi. Retaliatory action against leaders of teachers. associations
- Targeting of leadership of youth and student organisations by the security apparatus in the province
- Activities of insurgents exacerbating the climate of fear
- Role of the media
 - i. The national media had generally neglected the situation in Balochistan
 - ii. When the media did take up the situation there was a deliberate distortion of the real issues
 - iii. The regional press and journalists were under threat and feared both the state agencies and the nationalist forces
 - iv. The regional media was silent on women's rights issue, particularly on tribal practices that amount to violence against women
- Issues related to reparation and compensation for Mirani Dam affectees:
 - i. Those displaced were still living in camps
 - ii. Loss of land and livelihoods was yet to be compensated
 - iii. No protective measures had been taken against future inundation of habitations because of flooding of areas surrounding the dam
 - iv. There was no support on the issue from the political parties

- v. The media had raised the issue, but the government had paid no attention
- vi. Amenities had been disconnected in the camps where the affected population continued to live
- vii. The Disaster Management Authority had not responded to the demands of the affectees

Visit to Khuzdar

The mission met journalists, representatives of religious minority communities, workers and families of missing persons in Khuzdar district. HRCP District Core Group Khuzdar arranged a meeting of the mission with a cross-section of the local community, in the context of the March 1, 2011 targeted killing of Naeem Sabir, the HRCP Core Group Coordinator for Khuzdar. The mission began the visit by observing silence and offering prayers for Naeem Sabir at a meeting with members of HRCP District Core Group Khuzdar and later called upon Naeem Sabir.s family. No headway had been made in bringing his killers to justice. An organization by the name of Baloch Musallah Difa.a Tanzeem had claimed responsibility for his murder. The mission learned that Naeem.s brother had also been receiving death threats.

Enforced disappearances and recovery of dead bodies

Journalists told the mission that many individuals who had disappeared had been picked up from outside courts. People whose relatives had been disappeared sometimes requested the media not to report the news for fear that they might also become victims of enforced disappearance. They said that bodies of the missing persons had started turning up in Khuzdar in June 2010. Dead bodies of three victims of enforced disappearance in the district had been found between May 1 and 5, 2011. The people who had managed to lodge cases of abduction of the missing persons with the police faced difficulties as dead bodies of victims of enforced disappearance were often found in the jurisdiction of a different police station and the police that had registered the case for abduction insisted that the case for the murder of the missing person should be registered with the police station where the dead body had been found. Around 50 bodies of victims of enforced disappearance had been found in Khuzdar in less than a year. All the dead bodies showed at least some signs of torture.

The mission was informed that Women protest in Quetta against enforced disappearances' the typical modus operandi for enforced disappearance was for the security agencies' personnel to stop young men on motorbikes at a picket where there would be a vehicle with tainted glasses nearby. If the person/s sitting in that vehicle identified a person as a suspect, he would be bundled into the vehicle. Many victims were picked up from their homes. Initially, the local people protested against such illegal measures by holding rallies but stopped doing that after rallies were fired upon. The mission was informed that an armed vigilante outfit calling itself the Baloch Musallah Difa.a Tanzeem was openly threatening the people of murder if they tried to register

cases with the police about disappearances or recovery of dead bodies of missing persons. They said the threats were made on the phone by callers who claimed to be Baloch. However, when addressed in the local Balochi or Brahavi languages, they reportedly failed to answer which led the people to believe that they were not Baloch. Even half-hearted efforts had not been made by the police to investigate the cases or even question the accused in cases where families of the missing persons had nominated personnel of security agencies for their relatives' abduction.

Challenges for journalists

Representatives of journalists and office-bearers of the Khuzdar Press Club informed the mission that the situation in the district was very disturbing and the media was working under pressure and amid threats from both the authorities and the insurgent groups. The journalists informed the mission that the political parties had stayed silent on people's concerns for the last three years. The media was expected to report facts but both the authorities and the insurgent groups demanded that only their version should be given coverage. Three members of the Khuzdar Press Club had been killed on account of their work as the situation had deteriorated, the mission was informed.

Minority communities. concerns

Local elders of the Hindu community shared with the mission their concerns about targeting of members of their community amid increasing lawlessness in Balochistan. The mission learned that Jawahari Lal, a member of the Hindu community, had gone missing on April 19, 2009 and his whereabouts remained unknown. No one had claimed responsibility for his abduction or made any ransom demands. As many as six members of Jawahari Lal's family, including his younger sister and mother, had died after he went missing. The family had been demanding that if Jawahari Lal had been killed they at least deserved to get his body back.

Workers' problems

Trade union leaders informed the mission that workers in Balochistan were neither paid the minimum wage nor registered with the Employees Old-Age Benefit Institution (EOBI). They said the workers were treated as bonded labour. Even stateowned corporations such as Pakistan Petroleum Limited, which was engaged in oil exploration in the province, neither paid full wages to their workers nor provided them with basic facilities.

Visit to Quetta

Members of the mission at Quetta met representatives of Bar associations, businessmen and workers, political parties, doctors, members of religious minority communities and concerned individuals.

Enforced disappearances

Lawyers, political activists and journalists informed the mission that enforced disappearances and extra-judicial killings had started in the province after the year 2004. Representatives of the Baloch Bar Association informed the mission that they had filed petitions in courts for more than 100 missing persons. Of those, only 16 persons had been released. None of the recovered persons had been presented before the court which had sought their presence. Instead government law officers had submitted affidavits of the persons who had been released and the court had accepted the same as evidence of their release. Those released as per affidavits were too scared to file petitions about their wrongful detention as they had been warned of the consequence by their tormentors.

A senior member of the Bar, Agha Zahir Shah, had been ‘disappeared’, reportedly by FC personnel in Sibi on February 21, 2011. He had been pursuing cases of disappeared persons. Earlier on February 13, 2011, his house was raided in his absence by personnel of FC, Anti-Terrorist Force (ATF) and police. They had taken away his younger brother, who is also a lawyer. The mission learned that the younger brother had been tortured in detention and later freed. He had initially not sought any action against his tormentors for fear that his family might be harmed and subsequently because he believed that that would endanger his elder brother’s life.

The lawyers said that there was active connivance of the state intelligence and security agencies, including the local police, in enforced disappearances. Whenever a court was petitioned in a missing person’s case it issued notices, through the Quetta Capital City Police Officer (CCPO), who is the top police officer in the provincial capital, to the security and intelligence agencies. Subsequently on the court’s query the CCPO would inform the court that no reply had been received from the agencies. In a stereotype reply the investigation officer would submit that military officials had verbally refused to join the investigation and the police lacked the capacity to force them to comply.

The lawyers felt that the courts had abdicated their responsibility and jurisdiction by failing to ensure compliance with their orders. They stated that the courts’ orders were being ignored by military and paramilitary forces, which the lawyers blamed for the spread of ‘blatant anarchy’. They said that throwing dead bodies of the disappeared persons in deserted areas was a vile method of making the habeas corpus petitions seeking their recovery infructuous. They felt that only ethnic Baloch were being targeted in incidents of enforced disappearance in the province and none of the disappeared was a ‘settler’. The lawyers said that the frequency of dead bodies of disappeared persons turning up by the roadside and in deserted places in the province had increased recently. They said that the disappeared youth now ‘reappeared’ as dead bodies within days of their abduction.

A medical doctor told the mission that his brother, Shamsuddin, a former *nazim* (elected administrator) of Khuzdar tehsil, was taking their ailing mother to Quetta on July 1, 2010 in an ambulance when FC personnel stopped the ambulance at Mian Ghundi’s first check post at around 7:30 pm. They asked

Shamsuddin to come out and checked his mobile phone. After around 15 minutes, an army vehicle with tinted glasses reached there. Four armed men in plain clothes came out and asked Shamsuddin to accompany them, ignoring his mother's pleas that she was seriously ill and that he should be allowed to accompany her. All this happened very close to the Saryab Police Post. When Shamsuddin's mother reached the home of one of her sons in Quetta, she told him about what had happened. For three days Shamsuddin's family tried to lodge an FIR but the police did not comply. The doctor told the mission that he had also appeared before the Commission of Inquiry on Enforced Disappearances, which had asked the Joint Investigation Committee (JIT) with the CCPO, DIG Operations and an FC officer to enquire into the matter. He stated that the JIT had acknowledged that Shamsuddin was abducted from the place cited by the family but added that it could not be established that those who picked him up were FC personnel. He told the mission that in November 2010 their house was raided and another of his brothers was taken away on charges of possession of illegal weapons. He stated that his family had received threats throughout this period and had been asked not to pursue the case of Shamsuddin. Shamsuddin's brother, who had been arrested in November 2010, was granted bail on March 4, 2011.

Many people that the mission met, including lawyers' representatives, said that they feared that an attempt was being made to blame the Baloch for the killing of Pashtuns in Baloch-dominated areas.

Political viewpoints

The mission met with representatives of political parties in Quetta. These included:

- Awami National Party
- Balochistan National Party
- Jamaat-e-Islami
- Jamhoori Watan Party
- National Party
- Pakhtunkhwa Milli Awami Party

All the political parties that met the mission expressed serious concern over not only the state's inability to protect the right to life and liberty of the citizens but also the role of official security agencies in violation of the same rights, mainly through enforced disappearances and subsequent recovery of bodies of missing persons.

Leaders of the Pakhtunkhwa Milli Awami Party (PkMAP) gave a detailed account of the history of the Pashtun and Baloch people in Balochistan. The party emphasised that the Pashtun and Baloch had distinct identities and should have equal status in all respects in the province, including representation in the provincial and national legislatures. They rejected the notion that Pashtun Afghan nationals had been given Pakistani citizenship or had settled in Balochistan with the help of PkMAP. The party felt that the Pashtun were being discriminated against in the province and claimed that out of the 5,000 teachers

employed in Balochistan under the Aaghaz-e-Huqooq-e-Balochistan package a mere 10 percent were Pashtun although Pashtuns met the eligibility criteria on merit and were unemployed. A common complaint was lack of observance of merit in any recruitment, under the Balochistan package or otherwise. A large number of educational institutions, including Degree College Quetta, remained closed in Balochistan for months and leaders of the PkMAP said that now there were more *madrassas* in Quetta than conventional schools. They stated that rule of law was absent in the province and the official agencies which were supposed to protect the people were involved in or patronised terrorism, kidnappings for ransom, drug peddling, extortion and other heinous crimes. There was a general lack of faith in courts, specifically that they had failed to perform their duties and that the judiciary acted as the intelligence services desired. The mission was informed by the political leaders that the political parties in Balochistan had formed a coordination committee in Quetta to look into the problems of the people living in Balochistan.

Leaders of the National Party informed the mission that thousands of Baloch had been displaced on account of actions by the state agencies. They said that many of the disappeared persons had been killed and around 130 bodies had been found from various parts of the province. Several bodies also bore torture marks and some were disfigured. They said that in early 2009 two persons who had opened fire in Mastung in an apparent bid to kill a teacher were nabbed by the people on the scene and handed over to the police.

An FIR was registered against the two. They claimed that the two men carried service cards of an intelligence agency. After a few hours they were reportedly taken away from the police station by military personnel. They highlighted that the provincial advocate general had informed the court that they were helpless in the matter of the missing persons.

The Balochistan Chief Minister had also publically stated that the military officials did not listen to him. The NP leaders also said that violations of the law by FC personnel in the province were provoking the people. They stressed the need for the political parties and civil society to mobilise the people to end lawlessness as well as illegalities of the security forces in Balochistan and improve the situation in Balochistan. They apprehended that a conspiracy was being hatched to blame various communities in Balochistan of indulgence in violence against each other and claimed that such acts were being committed by personnel of intelligence agencies.

Leaders of the Jamaat-e-Islami (JI) told the mission that the FC had established a post on their office premises without seeking their approval. They said that when a JI leader politely complained that they had not even been informed about establishment of the post, an FC officer there told him that the people who did not behave properly with them were disappeared. They said that lawlessness in the province knew no bounds and the people were being murdered after being accused of involvement in subversive activities. They said that the people were now aware of Balochistan's natural resources and wanted their rights and demanding one's rights was not an unpatriotic act. They advised

the authorities to initiate a dialogue with those striving for independence rather than making them disappear and throwing their dead bodies by the roadside.

Leaders of the Jamhoori Watan Party said that the main issues in Balochistan at the moment were disappearance of the people and internal displacement. They said that the women of Baloch families who had been forced to migrate to Afghanistan had no money and were reported to be begging in the streets. The lack of development would be addressed and the people's basic needs met if the Baloch people had a say in how their resources were used, they said, adding that the situation in the province could be improved if the disappeared persons were released. They demanded rehabilitation of the internally displaced persons of Bugti and Marri tribes at their native places. They complained that the housing census was not being conducted in places where the displaced families were presently living.

Balochistan National Party (BNP) leaders said in their meeting with the mission that targeted killings of BNP leader Habib Jalib, Nooruddin Mengal, Naseer Langov, Agha Mehmood Ahmedzai and Haji Liaquat had caused great resentment and frustration among the people. They demanded that the military and paramilitary forces should be withdrawn from the province, the missing persons should be released or produced in court and the Baloch people's right to their natural resources should be acknowledged. They felt that engagement with the affected people's representatives could help improve the situation. They stated that scores of BNP supporters had been killed by the security forces and bodies of many had been found with traces of torture. The Baloch were being humiliated by FC personnel, who cut their beard and moustache as well as slashed the multi-layered Balochi *shalwar* (trousers). They claimed that foreign nationals were 'buying' for large sums of money certificates of local residence—which made them eligible to apply for jobs in Balochistan—as well as Computerised National Identity Cards (CNICs) and passports.

Traders' concerns

Balochistan Anjuman-e-Tajran wa Dukandaran Chairman Hameed Bangulzai informed the mission that the business community was facing serious problems because of absence of peace and security in the province. Traders were being abducted for ransom. Traders and those working for daily wages faced severe financial difficulties on account of closure of markets for one reason or the other. Traders hailing from different communities, including those from the religious minorities, had been killed and abducted for ransom. He said that the lawlessness was such that no one felt safe and many families had withdrawn their children from schools for fear of their safety. Recovery of bodies of victims of enforced disappearance was fuelling people's anger. Even individuals kidnapped for ransom, such as Liaquat Agha, Munawwar Sarab and Haji Nabi, whose families had paid part of the ransom money, had not been released.

Afzal Zehri, senior vice president of Anjumane-Tajran wa Dukandaran said that the closure of most of the industrial units in the province had increased unemployment. He said there was utter lawlessness in the province and the land

mafia, car thieves and kidnappers ruled the roost. He claimed that 80 percent of the youth were unemployed and job vacancies were being sold. There was a glut of narcotics in Quetta.

Threats on account of religious belief

A social activist from the Hindu community drew the mission's attention to growing discrimination against minorities in Balochistan in the last few years. He said more than 30 persons from the Hindu community had been kidnapped for ransom. Those who tried to resist kidnapping attempts were killed. Temples were being occupied and members of religious minority communities feared joining social gatherings for fear of being robbed. He said that members of the Hindu community were migrating to other countries but that was possible only for the affluent ones. Education of the girl child in the minority communities had been seriously affected as parents feared that they would be kidnapped and forcibly converted to Islam.

He cited the conversion and marriage of one such girl, Sapna Kumari, where the Mullah who had kidnapped and forced her to embrace Islam threatened to murder her three brothers and father if she testified in court that she had been converted and married against her will. Kumari was a minor but the court ordered her to go with her 'husband'. He said that the troika of armed forces' officers, mullahs and tribal chiefs were indulging in crimes against religious minorities. He stated that all members of the Bahai community in Balochistan had migrated abroad because they could afford to do so. He said that members of the Hindu community were targeted by intelligence agencies' personnel who inquired about their relatives in India and elsewhere.

The mission was informed of incidents of abduction of members of religious minorities in Kalat, Mastung, Kachhi (Bolan), Sibi and Khuzdar

Discrimination against the Hindu community in Balochistan has increased in the last few years. The community faces kidnapping and terrorism in the name of faith. The ransom demands made by the kidnappers are far too high for the families to meet. One example is the case of Kirpal Das and his son Sunny Kumar who were kidnapped when they were travelling from Dera Murad Jamali to Jacobabad. The kidnappers let Kirpal Das go and asked him to arrange ransom money within a week if he wanted to see his son alive. Das was forced to sell his belongings and borrow money from others to raise the ransom amount. Of the total Hindu population in Balochistan around 10 percent are well off and they have been migrating to other countries. The rest cannot afford to escape. On retirement I would not have enough money to migrate and might well die because of my inability to meet ransom demands. The minority community in Balochistan is living in constant fear. There is also

discrimination in provision of jobs as Hindus with master's degrees are denied employment despite their qualification and eligibility on merit. The community that has been living in Balochistan for centuries is being pushed out of its homeland by those who came here later.' — *A Hindu government employee in Quetta*

districts of the province.

The mission also met representatives of the Hazara and Ahmedi communities. The Hazara delegation's leader stated that members of the community had been targeted persistently for the last 10 years in targeted killings and other acts of terrorism by sectarian outfits, particularly banned militant groups Sipah-e-Sahaba Pakistan and Lashkar-e-Jhangvi. The targeted Hazaras included businessmen and government employees. Religious processions of Hazara community had also been attacked and a large number of people had been killed. Even the suspects who had been arrested were reported to have escaped from police stations and prisons. He said that in July 2008 he was requested by the provincial chief minister to go and pacify the protestors outraged at the killing of dozens of members of Hazara community in an attack on a religious procession. When he reached the spot and announced that he had been sent by the chief minister, he was shot at and injured by official security personnel. He said on several instances shops owned by Hazaras had been looted and torched. The community's businesses were raided and businessmen were harassed and asked to pay bribes. He said that more than 80 people had been killed in the September 3, 2010 attack on an Al-Quds Day procession in Quetta. He said that the procession had been allowed by the local administration.

The Hazara leader also referred to an attack on the community that caused the death of six Hazaras in Quetta on May 6, 2011 when the HRCP mission was in the city. He said that despite an FC post and a police picket nearby the attackers had escaped from the scene unchallenged. The Hazara representatives also complained that businessmen from the community faced discrimination from state-owned transport companies which they claimed refused to take consignments from Hazara businessmen to different places. Hazara transporters had been targeted to force them to abandon their business. Earlier, the Hazaras of Quetta had their shops, and operated transport services in various areas of the city but now they had been confined to Abdus Sattar Road and Liaquat Road in the city centre. Hazara businessmen also decried discriminated even in the amount of bribes demanded of them during cross-border trade with Iran and Afghanistan. They said that traders from the Hazara community were asked to pay 10 times more in bribes than other Pakistani traders.

Maulana Syed Hashim Moosavi of Jamaat Wahdatul Muslimeen, a Shia organisation, said that peaceful Shia religious processions had been attacked a number of times in addition to targeted killing of members of the Shia

community. He said that the processions had always remained peaceful but when miscreants attacked and looted shops in Quetta in 2008 the authorities had blamed participants of the Shia procession. He said that over 100 Shias had been killed in attacks on religious processions.

S. M. Raza, a Quetta-based freelance journalist, informed the mission that more than a dozen shops owned by members of the Shia Hazara community had been looted at the time of an attack on a Shia religious procession in 2008. Those arrested after an attack on a Moharram procession and identified as associated with sectarian organizations had been released by a court. He demanded that activities of the elements who were promoting intolerance should be stopped and the sources of funding for such organisations looked into.

Ahmad Ali Kohzad of Hazara Democratic Party shared details of targeted killings of members of the Shia Hazara community in Balochistan. He said that over 300 Hazaras had been killed between 1999 and May 2011. A judicial commission inquiring into the killing of Hazaras in various incidents had submitted its report but that had not been made public. He said his party had prevented clashes between the Hazara, Baloch and Pashtun despite efforts of certain elements to instigate clashes. He alleged that Saudi and Iranian money had been used to fuel sectarianism in Pakistan and a proxy war was being waged in the country.

He said that police officials had noted that 78 groups of kidnappers for ransom were operating in the province. He claimed that the kidnappers were supported and protected by politicians, who asked the police to let them go if some of them were arrested. The killings and kidnappings had rendered many wealthy Hazara businessmen in Balochistan penniless. He named several Hazara businessmen who had been robbed or had to pay huge sums of money as ransom. He cited the murder of Professor Mumtaz Haider of Bolan Medical College by his abductors. The professor's family was asked to pay 10 million rupees as ransom for his release. They had paid 3.8 million rupees with help from the extended family and yet the professor was murdered. He said that several Hazaras had settled abroad because of the security situation. A few years earlier hundreds of Hazara boys and girls were studying at the university and colleges in Quetta but now the number had plummeted. He advised Pakistan to stop interfering in other countries' affairs, particularly its neighbours. He said there was a conspiracy to use one community against the other and one sect against the other. The Hazaras faced serious discrimination in access to jobs and even in the amount of bribe Hazara traders were asked to pay at the Pak-Afghan border.

Representatives of the Hazara Students Federation said that state institutions had completely failed in fulfilling their primary responsibility of protecting the people's lives. He observed that the situation of the Hazara community in Balochistan was no less critical than that of non-Muslims. The country was being led towards anarchy of the most violent order.

Representatives of the Ahmedi community also met the mission and complained that since 1986 an Ahmedi prayer house situated at Fatima Jinnah Road, Quetta, had remained sealed despite repeated pleas by the community. They said that in 1986 a procession led by local clerics had raided the prayer house in an attempt to take it over. Instead of prosecuting the culprits, the authorities had sealed the Ahmedi prayer house. They said that in the last several years anti-Ahmedi activity had forced dozens of Ahmedis across the province to leave their places of residence and move to

The price of defending rights

The work of human rights defenders (HRDs), NGO staff and journalists working to highlight violations of human rights has always been a risky proposition in Pakistan. However, the dangers for HRDs have become increasingly acute in Balochistan in the last few years. They face widespread intimidation, violence, and threats to their lives. Two human rights defenders associated with HRCP in Balochistan, Naeem Sabir and Siddique Eido, were killed apparently on account of their work in the year 2011. Crimes against HRDs went unpunished and unprosecuted. The state's shortcomings went beyond the mere failure to prevent the great personal risks that HRDs faced because of their work. In some instances, active complicity of state agents was strongly suspected. However, despite repeated requests to investigate such a role, no probe has been held.

Naeem Sabir (1977-2011)

Naeem Sabir had been associated with HRCP since 1997 and had been working since 1998 as coordinator of HRCP's District Core Group in Khuzdar. He was actively involved in promotion of human rights and monitoring and reporting of human rights violations in Khuzdar.

On March 1, 2011 at around 5pm, Naeem was attacked in a targeted killing by unidentified motorcyclists. He was shot at least seven times from a close range. He was critically injured and died on the way to hospital. He was 35.

Of and on, he had been targeted for his activities by minions of the state. But in the recent past, he had given no apparent cause for offence to anyone except the local satraps who could not bear his truthful coverage of human rights abuses. A group calling itself Baloch Musallah Difa'a Tanzeem claimed responsibility for Naeem's murder. The same group is known to have threatened the people of murder if they register cases with the police about disappearances or recovery of bodies of missing persons. Naeem is survived by his wife and a one year-old son. His brother has also received death threats.

While the police have registered a case, virtually no headway has been made in the investigation. HRCP has taken up the matter with senior police officials in Balochistan in writing as well as verbally and

expressed dissatisfaction over the investigation. The HRCP chairperson has also written to the Balochistan Police chief. However, no positive change has been witnessed so far.

Siddique Eido (1979-2011)

Human rights activist Siddique Eido had been working as Coordinator of HRCP Core Group in Pasni, district Gwadar, since 2000. His work was instrumental in highlighting human rights violations in the area. He also worked as a newspaper correspondent.

A case was registered against him on trumped up charges of disturbing public peace and attacking the coastguards. He was granted bail by the trial court in Gwadar and regularly appeared on dates of hearing of the case. He continued reporting human rights violations in Pasni and raising his voice against enforced disappearances. On December 21, 2010, he appeared before the court in Gwadar for a hearing of the case against him. He was returning to Pasni in a van along with other co-accused in the case as well as four policemen when the van was stopped by men in uniforms of the Frontier Constabulary (FC). They pulled Eido and another man, Yousaf Nazar, out of the van and despite protest by the policemen, took the two men away in a vehicle similar to those used by the security forces in the area.

HRCP lodged a strong protest with the government and expressed serious concern that Eido might be tortured and that his life was in grave danger. The FC denied any involvement in Siddique Eido's abduction. HRCP called for recording of statements of the witnesses, including the four policemen, who had seen Eido being taken away by men in FC uniforms. That was not done. A case was lodged with the police and Eido's name was also listed in the case before the Supreme Court about disappeared persons. Despite repeated appeals to government authorities for Siddique Eido's release, his detention remained unacknowledged and his whereabouts unknown until April 28, 2011 when his bullet-riddled body was found from Ormara. He was 31 when he was killed.

Siddique Eido's reporting of human rights violations in Balochistan, particularly enforced disappearances, was believed to have led to his abduction and murder. HRCP's demand for a transparent and credible inquiry into his disappearance and murder has been ignored. No effort has been made to identify or punish the culprits.

other provinces even to other countries. The poorer Ahmedi families had shifted to Quetta. They said that Ahmedis in Balochistan had been killed on account of their faith every year since 2007. They had also been kidnapped for ransom and some had been killed despite payment of ransom. Mansoor, an Ahmedi mine owner, who had been kidnapped for ransom, was killed despite payment of Rs 3.2 million as ransom. In March 2010, another Ahmedi, Iftikharul Haq, was

abducted and released only after he paid a large sum of money as ransom. After his release, he had chosen to settle abroad. Most of the targeted persons belonging to the Ahmedi community in Balochistan were ‘settlers’, members of the community informed the mission. The few Ahmedis who were ethnic Baloch had not been targeted. The Ahmedi community felt unprotected even while offering prayers at a place in Quetta that was established after the 1986 sealing of their prayer house. They said that during the government of Nawab Akbar Bugti in Balochistan their community led a secure and peaceful life, because Bugti had warned the clerics against harming any religious or ethnic community in the province.

Workers’ problems

Sattar Baloch, chairman of Agriculture Mehnatkash Union Balochistan, said that gross violations of labour laws and International Labour Organisation (ILO) conventions were the norm in Balochistan. He said the workers were forced to toil in dangerous conditions and cited a recent incident where at least 40 miners were killed in a coalmine operated by the state-owned Pakistan Mineral Development Corporation (PMDC). He called for holding a tripartite conference of representatives of workers, employers and the government to address workers’ problems. He said most of the disappeared persons were from the working class. He said private sector industries in Balochistan were run by those who should be called *kharkars* (bonded labour users) and accused the bureaucracy of patronising them. He regretted that the progressive political parties who used to train young trade unionists no longer performed that task. He condemned the disappearance and killing of teachers and shopkeepers. He said it would be incorrect to assume that the United States would support Balochistan’s independence.

Abdul Qadir, a veteran leader of All Pakistan Clerks Association, observed that while the judiciary had resolved the problems of lower judicial staff, it had kept petitions by workers’ associations pending. He stated that many young herdsmen were among victims of enforced disappearance. He said that agriculture production in Balochistan had plummeted on account of lack of electricity.

Balochistan Doctors and Paramedics Association representatives cited names of several doctors who had fallen victim to targeted killings and demanded provision of security to members of the medical profession. They said that many senior doctors were leaving Balochistan for other parts of the country as well as abroad because of threats such as targeted killings and kidnappings for ransom. They said that that was bound to aggravate a serious shortage of doctors and paramedics in the province. The shortage was also severe in diagnostic laboratories, particularly in the forensic section. They also stressed the need for more institutions for training paramedical staff. They criticised the print and electronic media for failing to give appropriate coverage to doctors’ problems.

Civil society perspective

Malik Subedar, a civil society activist from the mountainous Kalat region of Balochistan, said that the people in Balochistan led a very difficult life because of lack of essential facilities, including electricity, irrigation water and healthcare. He said the people of Kalat did not know where and how the amount allocated for their area was spent.

Quetta-based members of HRCP also met the mission and highlighted the following human rights concerns in Balochistan.

1. Poor law and order / kidnappings for ransom
2. Enforced disappearance and recovery of disfigured bodies of victims of disappearance
3. Insecurity faced by members of religious minority communities
4. Targeted killings
5. Pressure groups of armed militants, insurgents and Taliban and other extremists

A number of members suggested that fresh election should be held for the Balochistan provincial assembly at the earliest, as the government had abdicated its responsibility and the affairs of the province were being run by the FC. However, other members opposed the idea. The members stressed the need to combat the activities of extremists with sectarian agendas, who had been indulging in killings and attacking religious gatherings. They pointed out that many influential groups were involved in land grabbing. The need for a proper census across Balochistan was also stressed. Some members said that the census was not being carried out in certain areas. The issue of foreigners getting Computerized National Identity Cards and Pakistani passports was also raised. The members referred to targeted killing and kidnapping for ransom of educated individuals and added that most of them were not involved in any political or sectarian activity. They noted that the mainstream political parties were becoming irrelevant as they were not seen to be striving to address the issues facing the people of Balochistan. Some members pointed out that the people of Balochistan had a very liberal tradition of tolerance which was being lost and highlighted the need to involve all communities in combating divisive activities. Some members accused the intelligence agencies of harassing and extorting money from members of religious minority communities. They demanded reform of the syllabus taught at state-run and private schools and an immediate review of textbooks to weed out preaching of hatred and intolerance. Regulation of *madrassas* and their curriculum was also urged. An end to impunity for FC personnel as well as to military operations in the province was also stressed. HRCP members from religious minority groups also demanded that their representatives in the provincial and federal legislature should be directly elected by their votes rather than the prevalent practice of their selection/nomination by their political party. HRCP members pointed out that the long-held tradition in Balochistan of respecting the opinion of others was being abandoned because of the state's patronage of extremists. There was a strong demand for accountability of intelligence agencies.

The official version

The Human Rights Commission of Pakistan had made written and telephonic requests for interviews with the Balochistan Chief Minister, the Inspector General (IG) of FC in Balochistan, and the Balochistan Police IG. However, despite repeated calls and written requests the HRCP mission to Balochistan was not granted appointments to meet the chief minister and the Inspector General of FC. The acting IG of Balochistan Police Ghalib Ali met the mission.

The acting IG stated that the police had lodged 46 FIRs of cases of enforced disappearance at different places in the province. About an attack on members of the Hazara community in Quetta on May 6, a day earlier, he said the attack had taken place at a time when the police personnel deputed for the night shift had ended their duty and the policemen supposed to replace them for the next shift had not yet been deployed. He denied that a mobile police unit was present at the site and its personnel did not act as the attackers continued firing on the Hazaras for around 40 minutes. He said that there was a shortage of funds to buy fuel for the police patrol vehicles. He referred to a complaint by the Sibi District and Sessions Judge to the Balochistan High Court (BHC) that the accused imprisoned at Quetta were not being produced in the courts in Sibi for hearing. He said that after the police received directions from the BHC to take the detained accused to courts in different district, his department had informed the court that they lacked the funds to buy fuel for police vehicles, which was why the police were unable to take under-trial prisoners to courts in different districts. Asked by members of the mission if any refresher course was being conducted to train the police to deal with different crimes, including incidents of terrorism, the acting IG stated that he was not aware of any such course.

About incidents of enforced disappearance where dead bodies of the victims were found from different parts of the province, the acting police chief said that the police registered an FIR whenever a complaint was made. He said that police investigation officers tried to identify the mutilated bodies. He said that the complainants often stated that those who had taken away a person were members of intelligence agencies and were unable to identify the specific agency that they suspected of involvement. He said that the province had become a hotbed of extremists of all sorts including those seeking an independent Balochistan, or 'greater' Balochistan.

He was of the view that the police could not tackle the prevailing situation in the province on their own. He conceded that people had developed a lack of faith in the police force. There was also a trust deficit in governance, ethics and credibility of those in power. He also said after the revival of the Levies force in B Areas of Balochistan, the police could not intervene in those areas.

Findings and Conclusions

The HRCP fact-finding mission found the situation in Balochistan to be extremely precarious.

The key findings of the mission are:

1. Agents of the state, as well as the insurgents and extremists operating in the province share a common disregard for rights of the citizens. The insurgents have murdered 'settlers' in targeted killings with impunity. A few amongst the Baloch nationalist elements tacitly condone these killings and others do not condemn them openly. The extremists have treated members of religious minorities as fair game. The state, which is expected to hold itself to a higher standard, does not seem to be perturbed by actions of its agents, something that is apparent from a lack of investigation into allegations of serious human rights violations. There is strong evidence of involvement of the security forces in enforced disappearances and killings. FIRs registered against personnel of security agencies remain uninvestigated without exception. The police have not even managed to get an audience with the personnel of security forces accused of abducting the citizens, much less investigate them, and the courts have failed to ensure compliance with their orders.
2. Enforced disappearances continue to be reported from all parts of the province. Little headway has been made in ensuring the release of a large number of missing persons from unacknowledged custody of security agencies. The Commission set up to investigate the cases of enforced disappearance has been largely ineffective, leading to people's frustration.
3. In a new and worrying trend mutilated bodies of victims of enforced disappearance have started turning up by the roadside and in desolate places. These include several cases where witnesses had held agents of the state responsible for the disappearance. Not a single case has been investigated.
4. All authority in the province seems to vest with the security forces which enjoy complete impunity.
5. There have been widespread complaints against the attitude of the FC personnel at checkpoints.
6. The civil administration, elected by the people and meant to represent them, appears to have ceded its powers. The security forces in Balochistan do not consider themselves answerable or accountable to the political government or judiciary, nor feel compelled to cooperate with the civil administration.
7. The provincial government is seen as powerless and irrelevant and is accused of failing to raise issue of critical concern to the people, of a general inability to govern and of total subservience to military authority in the province. The political parties do not engage in a discourse among themselves on what their common demands should be.
8. Use of force rather than political engagement or dialogue remains the preferred approach. Promises made in the Balochistan package about concrete reform, inquiry into the murder of Baloch leaders, release of missing persons, economic opportunities for the people, and rehabilitation and settlement of the internally displaced persons in Balochistan remain little more than promises.

9. There is an acute sense of fear in the province, in particular among those whose relatives have gone missing or have been released after their enforced disappearance. People are hesitant to pursue the cases for fear that other members of their family might be targeted.
10. Targeted killings on the basis of ethnicity and belief are rampant. Those targeted include professionals such as teachers and doctors, as well as traders.
11. Members of religious minority communities speak of a heightened sense of insecurity amid targeted killings and kidnappings for ransom. In some instances, children have been taken out of school because of safety concerns. The Hindus, Ahmedis, and Hazara/Shias who have the means have migrated abroad in view of the security concerns. The relatively poor members of the targeted communities have relocated to Quetta or to other provinces. No effort has been made to promote harmony and reconciliation among the communities.
12. Rights of minority groups, women, children and workers have been neglected.
13. Those who have the misfortune of being non-Baloch 'settlers' in Balochistan have been doubly victimised. In a number of districts, large areas have been cleansed of 'settler' populations.
14. Lawlessness has proliferated at an alarming rate and has brought normal life and economic activity to a halt. At least 78 organised gangs are reported to be involved in abduction for ransom in the province. There is a widespread perception that criminal gangs and individuals involved in heinous crime enjoy support of politicians and security forces.
15. Human rights defenders and political activists have been targeted for no reason other than for raising their voice for people's rights and exposing violations of human rights.
16. Involuntary displacement continues in the province many years after the people were uprooted because of conflict and natural and manmade disasters.

It is a matter of serious alarm that all of the concerns that HRCP had highlighted after a factfinding mission to Balochistan in 2009 remain unresolved and in many instances there has been a marked deterioration. The mission also noted new and more alarming violations of human rights in 2011. HRCP is of the opinion that had a sincere attempt been made to implement the recommendations made at the conclusion of the HRCP mission in 2009 the slide into chaos might have been stopped, if not reversed. The challenges that the state faces in Balochistan are substantial indeed, but they are made even more difficult by the stubborn refusal to include the people in governance. At the risk of sounding repetitive, HRCP emphasises that the voice of the people must be heeded immediately.

Recommendations

The mission found that all the recommendations made by an earlier HRCP factfinding mission to Balochistan, in 2009, remain valid but unimplemented. (*See Annexure I*) It, therefore, reiterated all those recommendations and hoped that this time the recommendations would receive more serious consideration and would be implemented.

Additionally, the mission made the following recommendations:

1. The illegal practice of enforced disappearances represents a complete negation of rule of law and must stop forthwith. The state must ensure that actions of its agents remain within the confines of the law and that derelictions are investigated in a transparent and credible manner and punished according to the law. All victims of enforced disappearance must be immediately traced, released and given compensation. Those involved in illegally detaining them should be prosecuted. For reasons identified, the Commission of Inquiry on Enforced Disappearances does not enjoy people's confidence. Their dissatisfaction with the commission must be acknowledged and a mechanism that has people's confidence must be promptly introduced in order to investigate the cases.
2. All security forces operating in the province should be brought under civilian control. Any operation conducted by law enforcement agencies must be within the framework of rule of law, and under civilian oversight. The Frontier Constabulary should act only in aid of the civilian forces and under civilian control. The civil armed forces, wherever called in aid of civil authorities, should be under the control and discipline of civilian administration. In no case should they assume to themselves police functions or act arbitrarily. There should be an immediate end to the complete impunity from the process of law that the FC currently enjoys in Balochistan.
3. The task of policing in the province should be restored to the police, which must be properly trained, equipped and sensitised to ensure restoration of law and order and respect for people's rights. The police must exercise their responsibility of recording FIRs and actively investigating cases of enforced disappearances, targeted killings, discovery of mutilated bodies, and kidnappings for ransom. They should be given confidence to investigate complaints lodged against personnel of security forces involved in policing duties, irrespective of the rank of the accused or his affiliation with a security force.
4. The need for accountability of security forces and for eliminating the complete impunity with which serious human rights violations have been committed by them has been ignored so far. HRCP believes that illegalities by state agents persist mainly because of the impunity they have enjoyed so far and would cease to a large degree as soon as it is clear that illegalities would not go unpunished. HRCP emphasises that internal security can never be guaranteed by violation of rights. A formal mechanism should be established to systematically hold the law enforcement and security forces personnel accountable and probe any complaints made against by the

- people. Such a mechanism must inspire the people's confidence and must be convenient and accessible.
5. No one other than the authorities authorised by the law should take a person into custody. A detained person must be promptly informed about the charges against him, in accordance with the constitutional guarantees, should be produced in a court within 24 hours and his due process rights should be respected and facilitated. Failure to observe these rights should be vigorously prosecuted.
 6. It is a matter of grave concern that victims of enforced disappearance are now reappearing as mutilated dead bodies thrown in desolate places rather than being produced before courts of law. Every single instance where a missing person's body is found must be judicially probed and the report made public. Families of the victims should also be given compensation.
 7. The powers of decision-making and governance must be restored to civil political authorities in the province. The provincial government needs to assert its authority and act in the interest of the people. The provincial government must meet its obligation of ensuring law and order and respect for all the rights of all the people. It should not remain a spectator as people are killed because of their religious beliefs or ethnic identity. The government must ensure protection of all teaching staff and see to it that educational institutions function in a peaceful manner. The rights of all the people, including the so-called settlers, must be protected and violators brought to justice.
 8. The higher judiciary may instruct the subordinate courts to actively pursue cases of rights violations. The judiciary should also be more assertive in ensuring compliance with its orders.
 9. Complaints of support and patronage of elements involved in heinous crime, such as targeted killings and kidnappings for ransom, by politicians and security forces must be thoroughly probed, the findings made public and any individual found guilty prosecuted.
 10. The government must ensure, in consultation with the targeted communities, that all possible measures are taken to prevent targeted killings, to effectively investigate the cases and prosecute those accused. Proactive steps to increase religious, communal and ethnic harmony are in dire need and must be taken on priority.
 11. Places of worship and gatherings of minority religious communities must be protected and the communities assured of their safety.
 12. It is entirely unacceptable that a substantial number of internally displaced persons in the province remain uprooted and uncared for. Steps to rehabilitate and, as far as possible, resettle all displaced persons in the province in their native areas must be given priority.
 13. All victims of violence perpetrated by agents of the state must be compensated adequately and promptly.
 14. The government must recognise and prevent the great personal risks that human rights defenders face in the province. While the government is under

an obligation to provide a secure environment to all people, it is all the more important in the case of human rights defenders for no reason other than the fact that without their role many violations of human rights would go unnoticed. Incidents of killing of human rights defenders must be effectively pursued and no effort should be spared to bring the killers to justice.

15. There is a dire need to end the climate of fear in the province and to reassure the people. Unless that happens the people would not pursue legal remedies against agents of the state that they hold responsible for violating their rights, especially in the face of a state that has long looked the other way when it should be focussed on protecting rights.
16. The political parties and the larger civil society in Balochistan should hold wider consultations on the way forward. In particular, the political parties should engage in a discourse among themselves to thrash out their common demands to protect and promote the rights of the people and the interests of Balochistan. The political parties should also take up the situation in Balochistan in parliament. All political forces in the province should be brought into the political mainstream.
17. Improvement in the law and order situation is imperative for economic activity, which is vital to overcome poverty and large-scale unemployment in the province.
18. The steps announced by the government with the stated aim to empower and reassure the people in Balochistan have not had the desired effect. Measures in the spirit of ameliorating the lot of the people must continue to be pursued and implemented.

Source: Human Rights Commission of Pakistan, June 2011
http://www.hrcp-web.org/pdf/balochistan_report_2011.pdf