

Politics of Deliverance and Community Oriented Attitude: An Appraisal of 1988-1990.

M. Javaid Akhter^{*}

Abstract

In this article an effort has been made to analyze two years of Benazir Bhutto's government after the demise of Zia. It will be seen, how far Pakistan Peoples Party and other political parties, after assuming the charge of government at the centre and in the provinces transform their political agenda into practical reality. Agenda of Pakistan Peoples Party was, like any political government in the world, development and betterment of the people. In this context state-society matrix remain vibrant if parties or any other group work according to the priorities of the people. In this article the performance of the central and provincial governments will be judged in the deliverance of development to the people of different regions.

Introduction

The maturity and strength of a political government can be judged by having an experiential and as well as the descriptive view of a particular set up working in a state-society context. Political arena for development of the masses is arranged by the political parties. They garner mass support, through their organizational setup and electoral program, in elections, to control the seat of power. The existence of political parties in power could be sustained only if they deliver according to the wishes of the people. Political parties devise their strategies in their election manifestos to articulate the interests of masses. Deliverance politics is an indispensable part of the party in office but it has many and different modes to fulfill the needs and desires of the different segments of the society. This article focuses on that deliverance mechanism which had been evolved by the political government of Benazir Bhutto to get the community's response through institutional mechanism. One of these modes include patronage by which associations of different groups and

^{*} M. Javaid Akhter is Lecturer in the Department of Pakistan Studies, Bahauddin Zakariya University, Multan.

factions are controlled and anchored for the coming term. Sometimes it ruptures the confidence of masses over the system and leads to political crisis. Pakistan Peoples Party in its tenure of government tried to act on the agenda of public development.

Definition of the terms

Here explanation of the terms is considered essential for their proper understanding in the explanation of this research article. It is indeed descriptive but it explains the dynamics of politics to understand the nature of political discourse.

Community: The word ‘community’ relates to the group of people living in geographical proximity. In 1887 Tonnies distinguished between two categories of social groups, the *Gemeinschaft* (the Community) and the *Gesellschaft* (Association).¹ He was thinking more of normative concepts, of ideal types, than of concrete objective classification. The distinction entailed a certain judgment of value. Tonnies’ ideas may be used to make an interesting classification of social groups which remains very general but throws light on the solidarity of their links within the parties. The community (*Gemeinschaft*) has two essential characteristics. First of all it is a social group founded on proximity, it can be a geographical proximity: neighborhood, village, the commune, the parish, the nation. It can be a physiological proximity, a blood relationship. Here family is the best example. It can be spiritual closeness. Friendship also comes into its domain if it is based on freedom of choice, for the community constitutes a spontaneous natural social group, older than the individual. A community is not created, it is discovered, which is its second characteristic. One does not really become member of a community; one belongs to it automatically, willingly and unwillingly. One is born into community and does not escape from it. Being part of ones family, one’s village, one’s country and ones race is natural and involuntary.²

Sarah Ansari has also accepted the elusiveness of the term ‘community’ and states that ‘...idea of the community has exerted a strong hold over both the intellectual and popular mind for some

¹ Maurice Duverger, *Political Parties*, London, 1967, p.124.

² The Association (*Gesellschaft*) shows diametrically opposed characteristics. It is voluntary social group, based on the contract and the adhesion of the members. It is created because it is in someone’s interest to create it. *Ibid.*, p.125.

considerable time'.³ The label of community can apply to groups of people who have something in common. This shared element is often understood geographically, that is, in terms of territory or place. In contrast to this, sense of community there is another meaning where people are linked by factors such as common ethnic origin, religion, occupation and so on. There is also a third sense of community—a community of attachment. It involves interaction with other people and a shared sense of identity.⁴

These characteristics are evident in the four regions of Pakistan. In this study, it has been tried to judge how far political set up of the country tried to embrace all the social patterns to make their existence functional for the proper adherence of democratic norms.

Political deliverance: Here the deliverance is being visualized as the phenomenon of penetration and social exchange.⁵ Political deliverance is being referred as political penetration and the involvement of governmental agency to render community oriented services for the inculcation of their response into the political system. If this response is lacking in the system then there are chances of systemic collapse. Lucian Pye suggests that 'penetration crisis ... involves the problems of government in reaching down into society and effecting basic policies'.⁶ Leonard Binder regarded penetration as a process, stating that the 'crisis of penetration is brought on by the several pressures to increase governmental capabilities'.⁷

Broadly, political and administrative penetration is aimed at state-building, in other words at creating the structure for a viable body politic. 'Penetration crisis', as this problem has also been called, highlights the need for governments of new states to make their authority effective throughout their territorial jurisdictions.⁸ This kind of political move on behalf of political governments make them more acceptable if

³ Sarah Ansari, *Life after Partition: Migration, Community and Strife in Sindh: 1947-1962*, Karachi, 2005, p.2.

⁴ D.Lee and H. Newby, *The Problem of Sociology*, London, 1983, Chapter 4.

⁵ Peter M.Blau, *Exchange and Power in Social Life* (New York: John Wiley & Sons, 1964), p.91.

⁶ Lucian W. Pye, *An Analytic Study: Aspects of Political Development*, (Boston: Little Brown, 1966), p.64.

⁷ Leonard Binder, unpublished MS, cited in Audrey Wipper, 'Penetration', Working Paper, Political Science Research Program, Makerere University College, 1965.

⁸ *Ibid.*, pp.64-5.

they expand their delivery network which will cause less burden on the state exchequer. It will determine their efficiency and mark their governance as good. It corresponds to one of the major characteristics of political modernization set forth by Eisenstadt, namely, 'the extension of the activities of the central administrative and political organizations and their gradual permeation into all spheres and regions of the society'.⁹

Pakistan Peoples Party after assuming the charge of government in 1988 was very assertive in the realm of political deliverance for the regeneration of its past image as the party of ordinary man.

Background of Pakistan's politics

Benazir Bhutto after a long period of self-exile in London came to Pakistan on 10 August 1986 when it was felt by the Government of Muhammad Khan Junejo, formed after non-party election in 1985, that for the proper functioning of democracy, space should be opened up for political competitors who should enjoy freedom of expression and association.¹⁰ Pakistan experienced the long spell of intermittent military rule from 1958 to 1970 and 1977 to 1988, which had its own mechanism to rule the country and justified by its self-proclaimed ideologies and program. Some of the material changes in the structural formation of the society were introduced through social and economic reforms by the military governments. Ayub introduced private sector led economic growth. He mechanically followed Rostow's model of economic growth without realizing the social implications of his economic policies. Likewise Islamisation of Zia was more cosmetic without any material change in the institutions and the life styles of the public. Seemingly these policies and programs were introduced to get legitimacy for the respective regimes and to lay down on effective base for military in the society.

Early years of Pakistan's history also provide evidence of authoritarian tradition when Ghulam Muhammad dissolved the first

⁹ S.N. Eisenstadt, 'Bureaucracy and Political Development', in Joseph LaPalombara, *Bureaucracy and Political Development*, Princeton University Press, 1963, p.99.

¹⁰ General Zia and Junejo represented two different institutions. Even if their roles were defined in constitutional terms, the logic of their respective positions had conflicting compulsions. While thanking the members for the confidence reposed in him, Junejo declared that the civil-government and martial law could not go together. The parliamentary system depended for its operation on a party system. Hamid Yusuf, *Pakistan: A Study of Political Developments 1947-97* (Lahore: Maktaba Jadeed Press, 1998), pp.205-11.

constituent assembly in 1954 without any sense of guilty despite the decision of the Sindh court which was later changed by the federal court. Governor General Ghulam Muhammad paid scant regard for public accountability of his high office when he dismissed the Nazimuddin cabinet in 1953. Many of those who succeeded him, followed the same tradition and demonstrated similar disdain as the baton of authority passed from one autocrat into the hands of another. Major General Iskander Mirza, who succeeded Ghulam Muhammad had the distinction of being the first President of the Islamic Republic of Pakistan. He abrogated the 1956 constitution with impunity and imposed martial law in 1958.

The Army Chief, Ayub Khan took over as Chief Martial Law Administrator- and deposed Iskander Mirza at the first opportunity. Ayub Khan ruled the country without any constitutional authority for some years before inducting a brand of controlled democracy. Yahya Khan, who followed Ayub Khan as the army chief, also decided to grab power with the offering of another brand of political dispensation with no mandate from people. He held general elections on adult franchise in which two main parties emerged. One Awami League, from East Pakistan and Pakistan Peoples Party from West Pakistan. Due to embedded interests of the establishment and the politicians, transfer of power was checked and the country was torn apart with the emergence of Bangladesh in December 1971.

After the breakup of Pakistan, the country was led by Zulfikar Ali Bhutto, who tried to revive the public confidence over the political process and infused a sense of nationhood with his appeal of populism. He ruled for seven years and after the elections of 1977, the Pakistan National Alliance launched a movement against Bhutto on the charge of rigging of the elections. Once again the army took the advantage of civilian unrest and General Zia-ul-Haq, who had been hand picked to serve as army chief, betrayed his benefactor. He had the support of a coterie of political leaders even though by virtue of the very constitution that he had sworn to uphold, his *coup d'état* was an act of high treason. For eleven years he ruled with impunity plunged the country in unprecedented constitutional and political chaos, the reverberations of which continue to rock Pakistan even to this day. It was the fate which served the nation when, on 17 August 1988, C-130 was crashed and the Zia-ul-Haq along with some of the senior most military men met their destiny. Court gave the verdict over the issue of dissolution of Junejo's government. It declared that dissolution of the assembly was illegal but

assembly cannot be restored because appeal to the electorate for the fresh election had been already made in Pakistan.¹¹

Politics of interests at the centre and in the provinces

If the politics is taken as a consensus based strategy then it is not the name of authoritative allocation of values, neither is it the way and manner to develop consensus over those values. Bernard Crick defines politics as 'the activity by which differing interests within the given unit of rule are conciliated by giving them a share in power in proportion to their importance to the welfare and the survival of the whole community'.¹²

The pattern of politics related to community development has always remained supreme on the agenda of political parties. Politics of the subcontinent has more or less the same pattern. In the community development politics of the Punjab before partition different political parties used the ideological abstractions, cultural symbols and historical references to create political awareness for the mobilization of the masses and then tried to harmonize this political awareness with the social realities of the time through their programs. Unionist Party which was formed in 1923 in the Punjab addressed the issue of money lending which brought the poor farmers of the Punjab under stress. Unionists manipulated such issues of local nature and won in the 1937 elections. Pakistan Peoples Party under Zulfikar Ali Bhutto created new dynamics of politics by mobilizing masses on the issues of local and national importance. This heritage of Pakistan Peoples Party made it different from the others. Viewed as an anti-establishment party, it talked about the ordinary people despite contradiction in the views of its leadership which has had a feudal background.

In the period of Zia (1977-1988) non-party elections were held in 1985 PPP did not participate in these elections due to its active role in the Movement for the Restoration of Democracy (MRD). In the election of 1988 which were held after Zia, Pakistan Peoples Party took the advantage of its political programme and long forcible absence from the political process. It gained more seats as compared to other political parties or their coalitions like IJI. PPP got 91 seats as compared to IJI's 54 in the National Assembly. IJI got political advantage in the provincial elections, but its victory was concentrated more in the Punjab as compared to other provinces. IJI with the total of 108 seats as compared

¹¹ Hamid Khan, *Constitutional and Political History of Pakistan*, 2nd ed. (Karachi: Oxford University Press, 2009), pp.399-400.

¹² Bernard Crick, *In Defense of Politics*, London, 1962, p.21.

to the PPP's 94. The success of IJI was being related to the past performance of Mian Nawaz Sharief as the Chief Minister of the province in the period of the military dictator. The past performance of the Nawaz Sharief in the Punjab government strengthened the public view that he has the capacity to deliver. So people favoured IJI more as compared to PPP in the 1988 Punjab provincial election.

Some time issues of national concerns are not given weightage by the central and the provincial governments due to the compulsion of the alliance which show the accommodative stance or posture of the governments. The issue of Kalabagh dam remained high on the agenda of concern. The central government completed its feasibility study of the project but due to the reservation of the federating units stopped implementation of this project. Aftab Ahmed Khan Sherpao, Chief Minister of NWFP, head of coalition government of ANP and PPP stated that construction of the dam is against the interests of the province.¹³ Sindh Chief Minister, Qaim Ali Shah, expressed similar views: '...it is technical issue and it should be decided with the consensus of the four provinces'.¹⁴ It was good political move to harmonize provincial concerns by broader consensus developed over the interests of national and provincial concerns. Seeking maximum participation of the groups and the parties over issues of development was the need of the time. Such behaviour showed maturity of the leadership. It did not give the impression that national and provincial interests were at odd with each other. It was the character of the democratic process which generated public opinion over the issues of their concerns. Where the consensus was lacking over the agenda it was stopped or revoked.

Community of an area could be different from the concerns and priorities of political parties due to the nature of their agendas. It was evident by the defeat of Awami National Party leader, Khan Abdul Wali Khan, and its provincial president, Khan Muhammad Afzal Khan, from their constituencies of National Assembly. The defeat of ANP's leadership showed that people of the NWFP had the practical maturity by not pursuing ANP's agenda at the national level. People of the NWFP also rejected the electoral appeal which was made by the ANP through its electoral manifesto that the name of the NWFP province will be 'Pukhtoon Khaw' if they come in to the government and will support the cause of trans-regional government of the President Najib in Afghanistan.¹⁵

¹³ *The Nation*, 11 December 1988.

¹⁴ *Ibid.*, 21 January 1988.

¹⁵ *Ibid.*, 21 November 1988.

Community has the good judgment of evaluating their interests and needs which were important for them in the circumstances over which they bargained for their collective gains. To get in touch with the apparatus of deliverance for the distribution of tangible benefits to the community, it was stressed by the provincial governments to have their direct role in dispensation of political patronage. That was the reason for which Government of Punjab issued the order to withdraw the powers of recruitment from officials in grade 1-15. It was mandated to the political government and the power of recruitment was vested in the chief minister and his cabinet.¹⁶

Political parties have to rest on the support of the voters and they have to keep their interaction consistent on the basis of patronage. So parties tried to galvanize the support of the community by adopting the mechanism of recruitment and deliverance. This kind of attitude was shown by the ANP – a coalition partner of the provincial government of NWFP. ANP was not satisfied with the patronage politics of the Aftab Ahmed Khan Sherpao which was partly biased and ignored the projected development needs of its coalition partner. ANP then decided to make an alliance with the IJI in the provincial assembly to topple the government of PPP but Sherpao managed to retain his majority of 53 members out of a total 87.¹⁷ ANP believed that the chief minister had deliberately ignored it on many issues. Matters like peoples programme, ban on recruitment and transfers in government departments, appointment of chairman district development advisory committee created serious differences between the two coalition partners.¹⁸ Provincial governments of Punjab and Balochistan demanded in the meeting of National Economic Council more funds for the development of their regions. The central government responded to their call with generosity and gave the right to the provinces to formulate their schemes of development worth Rs.60 million in the fiscal year 1989-1990 as compared to the previous year's requisition of Rs.30 million.¹⁹

No political government can eschew development concerns if it has to contest next election and remain alive among the people as a popular party. Chief Minister of NWFP in his budget speech announced that Annual Development Schemes would be identified by the District Planning and Development Advisory Committees (DPDAC) whereby every MPA would recommend establishment of six primary schools, up-

¹⁶ *Ibid.*, 5 April 1989.

¹⁷ *The Muslim*, 24 June 1989.

¹⁸ *Ibid.*, 6 June 1989.

¹⁹ *Ibid.*, 24 May 1989.

gradation of two schools to middle level, two rural water supply schemes and improvement of five kilometers of rural roads. He also disclosed that each Union Council would be granted Rs.1 lakh out of the ADP for community upliftment.²⁰ This local agenda catered to the needs of the community, was acted upon by the political forces. Political forces in this way legitimize their existence by the policy of deliverance and thus harness the support of the voters.

Community issues have their own dynamics whose psychological impact is different from that of national issues. Political forces try to adjust the demands of every corner of their associations. In this way parties and leaders remain conscious to the different needs and aspirations of their constituency. Muhajir Quami Movement (MQM) always stressed the issue of repatriation of stranded Biharis in Bangladesh and the former MQM chairman, Tariq Azim, time and again, made it clear that stranded Pakistanis did not necessarily need to be rehabilitated in Sindh, but anywhere in Pakistan. However, on the other hand, a prominent member provincial assembly from Sindh, Makhdoom Khaliquzzaman maintained that Biharis did not belong to any of the four provinces of the country and announced to withdraw himself from the committee for the repatriation of the Biharis. He further stated that according to the 1981 census Sindhis were 6.5% of the total population and by the repatriation of the Biharis we do not want to be strangers in our own land.²¹

Issues of national concern were not always compromised, they have been given preference over and above regional issues. When the issue of the Biharis settlement was raised in the Senate, senators from Punjab offered that, they should be rehabilitated in Punjab on humanitarian grounds.²² Similarly on other issues leaders of provincial stature gave their utmost support for the cause of national integration. In the Punjab Assembly, Law Minister, Nasrullah Khan Dareshik, talked about switching over to Urdu language in all spheres of life. He said that

²⁰ *Ibid.*, 18 June 1989.

²¹ Central government remained unbiased in its attitude in the adjustment of this problem and it made every effort to tackle this problem by constituting a committee for the repatriation of the Biharis and contributed Rs.250 million with the Rabita Trust – constituted for the repatriation of the Biharis. Even the chief minister of Punjab showed his support when he met to the Rabita's Assistant Secretary-General, Ameen Aqeel, that 'Punjab is ready to take all possible measures for the rehabilitation of the stranded Pakistanis and would distribute agriculture land among them'. *Dawn*, 10 October 1989.

²² *The Nation*, 16 February 1989.

Article 251 of the 1973 Constitution describes that the country should switch over to Urdu within 15 years after the promulgation of the constitution.²³ All the time issues of national importance were adhered to by the leaders and the parties of national stature. This kind of spirit showed the farsightedness of the leaders who compromised the issues of local importance for a national cause. Punjab and Sindh governments settled their water issue under the chairmanship of Nasrullah Kahn Dareshik, provincial minister of power and irrigation. Punjab government agreed to transfer some portion of its water share from the Taunsa barrage to the province of Sindh as a gesture of goodwill.²⁴ To ameliorate the social conditions of the people of Pakistan and to generate the prospects of equal development, central government inaugurated the Pasni Harbour in Balochistan and promised to build such harbours at Gidani and Jiwani.²⁵ This was the practical manifestation of the policies of the central government to introduce equal pattern of development.

Agenda of social development

Social development is the main focus of each political government. All stake holders of the system are very much concerned with this issue for amassing the support of the people. Delivery mechanism in Pakistan's context is based on patron-client relationship and so its nature is selective one. It could create fissure in the political system rather than refurbishing political values. The section below evaluates the systemic performance in this contest.

Issue of human rights: In a democratic society the issue of human rights is considered the foundation to unfold the agenda of political liberalism. So personal liberty, freedom of thought, speech and association are the basic values for the better functioning of democracy. After assuming the

²³ *Ibid*, 16 December 1988.

²⁴ *The Muslim*. 18 May 1989.

²⁵ Pakistan has 1100km coastal line and Balochistan province with 770km has the biggest potential of natural fishing resources, *The Nation*, 6 April 1989. After assuming the charge of the Sindh government Jam Sadiq Ali, who was elected the chief minister of the province by the support of the members of the IJI and MQM (HPG), after the election of 1990, first passed a resolution on the Sindhi Language Bill 1990 in the assembly unanimously with out any opposition from the PDA and MQM. The leader of the opposition, Qaim Ali Shah maintained that Peoples Party always supported the rights of the people of Sindh and in their period of government they announced the setting up of authority for the development and promotion of Sindhi language in the province. *The Nation*, 20 November 1990.

charge of government in 1988, Pakistan Peoples Party's Interior Minister, Aitzaz Ahsan, expressed confidence that through presidential order a remission will be granted to political prisoners. Death sentences were commuted to life imprisonment. All women prisoners not convicted of murder were also released.²⁶ A total of 923 prisoners were set free from 28 jails of Punjab in the wake of this remission. Death penalty of 1889 convicts was commuted into life imprisonment and 129 prisoners including 50 women convicted by special military courts were freed.²⁷

To uphold this agenda other state institutions, particularly judiciary, took up the matter at the earliest. To up-hold human rights, Lahore High Court on 30 September 1989 challenged the establishment of the special courts which were constituted to check heinous crimes apparently but were used to fulfill the political agenda by targeting persons who were in the opposition camps. Court declared the working of the special court for speedy trials as illegal as the act, under which they were established, lapsed with in a year of its enactment in November 1987. Court observed that a section of the original act was in contravention of fundamental rights enshrined in the constitution.²⁸ Government was keen for the speedy trial of justice and to up-hold the dignity of man, it passed a Code of Criminal Procedure (Amendment) Bill, 1989 in the parliament which ensured the submission of interim *challan* against the charged person within fourteen days of the lodging of the first information report.²⁹

Combating drug menace: Government of Pakistan Peoples Party waged a policy of war against narcotics to wipe out drug barons from the country. The drug addicts in the country rose to two million and Chief Justice, M. Haleem, recommended that 'international cooperation in drug law enforcement is essential, medical detoxification and treatment is essential to check this menace'.³⁰

In getting the cooperation of the international community Pakistan, in 1989, extradited Malik M. Saleem to the US for his alleged involvement in the smuggling of *hashish* to America.³¹ A special team of

²⁶ *The Nation*, 7 December 1988.

²⁷ *Ibid.*, 10 December 1988.

²⁸ *Dawn*, 1 October 1989.

²⁹ *Morning News* (Karachi), 6 December 1989.

³⁰ *The Nation*, 11 February 1989.

³¹ Malik Saleem was one of 22 persons indicted in July 1988 in what US Attorney Dexter Lehtinen described as an 'international enterprise spanning the globe' since 1970. The ring operated in England, Spain, Portugal,

custom officers arrested a top drug baron, Anwar Khatak, in April 1989 on the alleged involvement in the smuggling of six and half tons of *charas* to Belgium. He admitted financing and organizing a number of major international drug operations. His network operated in major European countries and had powerful accomplices in Hong Kong and Netherlands.³²

Government of Pakistan with the help of the United States of America planned to raise the 5000 Interdiction Force for controlling the smuggling of narcotics but it could not accomplish this task. Pakistan decided to apply the 'principle of transfer of malice' which meant that a person who used another person, the teenager, for trafficking should be tried for drug offence.³³ The golden crescent region, including Iran and Afghanistan and Pakistan, remained one of the world's major production areas of illicit opium and heroin. During the Afghan war opium production peaked in Pakistan for which Pakistan with the help of United Nations Fund for Drug Abuse Control (UNFDAC) started a programme to control this malaise. UNFDAC with a total budget of 24 million dollars started a programme over a five years period that included Dir Development project, the Special Development Unit for opium producing areas, Treatment and Rehabilitation Project, Project for Preventive Education for Drug Abuse and Assistance in Drug Law Enforcement.³⁴

British government in July 1989 promised to give an amount of 25 million pounds for the development of social sector in which teacher training, primary health and slum improvement and anti-narcotics schemes were started.³⁵ Likewise Punjab provincial government started a programme of providing health and better living facilities to the laborers and stringent measures were taken to save the new generation from the narcotic abuse.³⁶

To fight against the drug abuse the countries of South Asia showed their commitment in the South Asian Association for Regional Cooperation summit meeting held in Islamabad in December 1988 by

Netherland, Singapore, Australia, West Germany, Phillipine, Thailand. Hongkong, Canada and the United States, *The Muslim*, 10 May 1989.

³² Anwar Khatak was tried in absentia by the summary military court in 1983 and was awarded one year rigorous imprisonment, 15 lashes and a fine of 50 million rupees, *The Muslim*, 3 May 1989.

³³ *The Muslim*, 18 June 1989.

³⁴ *Ibid.*, 26 June 1989.

³⁵ *Ibid.*, 28 June 1989.

³⁶ *The Nation*, 12 February 1989.

declaring that the year 1989 will be observed as the year for combating drugs.³⁷ Decisions and policies of central and provincial governments for the social development and amelioration of the lot of the poor were harmonized. The system was thus made responsive by the political participants, and its vibrant and viable nature sustained through this responsiveness.

Agenda of youth development: Government of PPP paid attention to the role of youngsters in the national development of the country and contended that without their active participation no plan could be made workable to cope with the challenges of the modern world. Ministry of Youth Affairs announced a youth policy in 1989 to increase the role of young people in the socio-economic and political development of the country. The purpose of this policy was to enable the youth to rediscover their identity; to restore their confidence; and to solve their problems of unemployment, illiteracy, and drug abuse. It tried its best to accomplish the agenda of national development in which participation of youth was felt obligatory.

In this policy of refurbishing the youth with a new zeal, it was envisaged that all out efforts will be made to reduce illiteracy in the country with the support of youth literacy corps with a chain of 60,000 Awami Literacy Centres throughout the country in a period of five years.³⁸

Political economy of the federation and the provinces

As Seymour Martin Lipset pointed out decades ago, the evidence is overwhelming that economic development has a strong positive effect on democratization.³⁹ In short, if you wish to produce democracy, promote economic growth. There are several reasons for this relationship. Economic development involves higher levels of urbanization, literacy, and education. It also involves a shift in occupational structure, development of a middle class and an urban working class. The latter groups increasingly want a voice in and influence over policies that affect them. With higher levels of education, they are able to organize trade unions, political parties, and civic associations to promote their interests. Second, economic development produces more resources, public and private, for distribution among groups in society. Political

³⁷ *Morning News*, 8 December 1989.

³⁸ *The Muslim*, 22 June 1989.

³⁹ Seymour Martin Lipset, *Political Man: The Social Bases of Politics*, see Ch. 2, 'Economic Development and Democracy', New York, 1960.

parties try to enhance the compromise and toleration among contenders of power and ensure better distribution of these resources. In Pakistan's political context, however, democracy and development sometimes could not go simultaneously.⁴⁰

In Pakistan infrastructure has been built up over a long period of time to sustain a process of development and, in the power matrix, contenders of power did their best to distribute whatever they could to keep the support for their cadres intact. Democracy is incompatible with total economic equality but it is also incompatible with gross inequalities in wealth and income. Economic growth eventually reduces these inequalities and hence facilitates the emergence of democracy. Here it would be appropriate to have an overview of different policies and activities which had been performed by the power units to understand the delivering mechanism of Pakistan's power brokers and their influence on the functioning of political system of the country. It has been described by Benazir Bhutto that her government's freedom of action was institutionally, economically, politically [and] structurally constrained.⁴¹ She said her government will try to ensure economic progress, when taking the oath of office on 2 December, eradicate illiteracy and poverty, restore student unions, liberate political prisoners, provide equal rights to women and free the media.⁴² In his development drive the Ministry of Labour, headed by Mukhtar Ahmed Awan, issued the directive to reinstate social workers of the trade unions in Pakistan Broadcasting Corporation (PVT), and the Security Printing Corporation who became the target of political vendetta in 1978.⁴³ Ban on trade unions were lifted from Pakistan International Airline (PIA), and Pakistan Broadcasting Corporation (PCB). In this regard Senate, passed two bills which were approved earlier by the National Assembly. They dealt with the restoration of the trade unions in the above said bodies and repealed the Martial Law Regulation No.60 and allowed normal student union activities in the educational institutions in the federal capital area.⁴⁴ This kind of posture of PPP activated the passive strands of the political system to give their input in the system to make it more responsive.

⁴⁰ See Lawrence Ziring, 'Benazir Bhutto: A Political Portrait', *Asian Affairs*, Vol.18 (Fall, 1991), p.188.

⁴¹ Ian Talbot, *Pakistan: A Modern History* (London: Hurst & Company, 2005), p.298.

⁴² *Ibid.*,

⁴³ *The Nation*, 8 December 1988.

⁴⁴ *Dawn*, 6 October 1989.

Fifth wage board award was constituted for the newspapers industry employees. Sixty per cent old age pension admissible to the widows of the workers was enhanced to 100%, full wage, to be paid during 'iddat' period and death grant enhanced from Rs.500 to Rs.1500 to the dependents.⁴⁵ Pakistan Peoples Party also fulfilled one of its agenda plank, to protect the rights of the labourers and workers, on the occasion of 1 May by reinstating those who had been sacked in the eleven years of the Zia regime. For the re-employment of workers who had been sacked from the industrial units, a National Industrial Commission was constituted whose function was to facilitate re-absorption of the workers in the industrial units.⁴⁶

Central government keeping in view the development priorities of all the areas of Pakistan, earmarked a portion of the budget for the provinces according to their population and development concerns. Provincial Annual Development Plan was granted an amount of Rs.12800 million which was distributed to the four provinces as per their share: Punjab got Rs.6595 million, Sindh Rs.2702 million, NWFP Rs.2177 million and Balochistan Rs.1326 million.⁴⁷ This attitude made center more acceptable to the units and enhanced the capacity of absorption in the system. It is the responsibility of the politicians to capitalize on the emotions of the units to strengthen the bonds of national integration. Federal government organized the 'zakat committees' for the better distribution of *zakat* fund to the destitute people. Government collected Rs. 120 crore in this fund, distributed Rs.68.85 million to the *deeni madaris* for looking after the poor students. PPP government in 1988 attached district magistrate for reorganization of the *zakat* committees.⁴⁸

⁴⁵ 1st May workers of Chicago went on strike in 1886 in support of the demand for an eight hour working day.

⁴⁶ 91 out of 129 removed employees of Pak ordnance factory were re-employed and 38 were provided full benefits of retirement in the period of Benezir Bhutto. *The Muslim*, 16 May 1989. For the betterment of the employees of lower grade, government announced 5% increase in their salary in the budget of 1989-90, *The Muslim*, 4 June 1989.

⁴⁷ *Ibid.*, 4 June 1989.

⁴⁸ *The Nation*, 21 December 1988. In 1991 Senate chairman, Wasim Sajjad in one of his ruling declared that *Zakat* and *Usher* are not money bills because its money is not collected in tax, and neither is it a part of the Federal Consolidated Fund. PPP government in 1989 made amendments in *Zakat* and *Usher* Ordinance 1980 through the Finance Act, 1989, passed by the National Assembly and declared it as money bill. *Dawn*, 1st February 1991.

PPP leadership tried to provide what was at its disposal to the public and wanted to reinvigorate the party in accordance with its left oriented agenda. For the betterment of peasant community, Prime Minister, Benazir Bhutto distributed 2243 acres of developed agriculture land among 143 landless peasants of Thatta district.⁴⁹ Likewise the provincial governments of the four provinces had taken up the agenda of social development which showed that each government approached maximum limits of its capacity and resources to meet the needs of the community. The Punjab government by the order of the chief minister issued orders to the special cell in the chief minister's secretariat to persuade entrepreneurs to provide lists to the government of required manpower so that government could provide manpower to the private sector and thereby create new job opportunities to the unemployed in the province.⁵⁰ Punjab government for the amelioration of the conditions of the poor people distributed 7 lakh residential plots under the three marla scheme in rural areas.⁵¹

Chief Minister of Punjab, Nawaz Sharif, relaxed the age for recruitment in the public services. To provide relief to the grievances of the public and lower scale employees against the bureaucratic red-tapism, a public welfare cell was constituted in Punjab secretariat. Medical cover cost of prescribed medicines, during indoor treatment of lower scale employees and their families, was allowed after countersigning the bills by the medical superintendent.⁵² A labour package of the amount of Rs.988 million was announced by the Punjab government in 1989 for labour colonies, construction of community centers, post matriculation scholarships, '*jahez*' fund and industrial workers children's study abroad.⁵³ The Punjab government also took up

⁴⁹ The 1980 agriculture census showed that the possession of 36.5% of agriculture land was concentrated in the hands of only 3.8% of landowners. On the other hand 47% of peasantry possessed only a meager 8.7% of available agriculture land in the country. Under the two land reforms of 1959 and 1972 nearly 2.48m acres of land was acquired but 30% of it still needed to be distributed. *Dawn*, 30 January 1990.

⁵⁰ *The Nation*, 25 January 1989.

⁵¹ *Ibid.*, 6 January 1989. The Government of NWFP also followed the same policy of social development. It distributed 1652 plots of 9 marla, 7 marla and 3 marla to the people in need of house. *The Nation*, 30 March 1989.

⁵² *Ibid.*, 2 March 1989.

⁵³ *Ibid.*, 13 March 1989. In 1991 Punjab Chief Minister, Ghulam Haider Wayne, ordered the construction of labour colonies in Lahore, Faisalabad, Kamalia, Burewala, Okara, Toba Tek Singh and Sargodha. Funds for these colonies were provided out of the 'Workers Welfare Fund'. *Dawn*, 3

the cause of peasants and decided to give them same kind of facilities as were declared for the industrial workers. A peasant commission was set up in the province which prepared the recommendations for the socio-economic uplift of the farming community. Peasant commission declared that a person holding 12.5 acre of land or less will be a part of the peasant community and he and his family will get complete social security benefits in the case of death and disability during work and free of charge medical treatment.⁵⁴ In the month of May 1989, Punjab government issued funds of Rs.450 million to the members of the Punjab Assembly for the development work; up to Rs.25 lakh for each member. This kind of mobilization worked on every body and galvanized them in the political fabric by way of their emotional gearing up.

Punjab chief minister also granted Rs.1100 million for the rehabilitation of the flood stricken people in 1988.⁵⁵ In the year of 1989 again flood hit the Punjab region and it affected 2,55,271 acres, with standing crops, for which Government of Punjab decided to give relief of Rs.35000 to flood victims, who left behind dependents, and Rs.20000 for the heirs of the victims of other category.⁵⁶ Punjab government in its budget 1989-90 announced '*Baitul Maal*' and the '*Jahez*' fund with Rs.100 million to help the poor and directed more towards eliminating poverty on the national scale rather than piecemeal poverty alleviation through meager assistance.⁵⁷ *Baitul Maal* was made a permanent institution that was to be financed from the federal and provincial government, local bodies, and through voluntary donations. Punjab government started the campaign for eradicating social evils by constituting the *Tehrik-i-Salat-o-Falah* which was aimed to reform the society and to inculcate Islamic ethos.⁵⁸ Sometimes to gain political advantage, parties in offices through their deliverance mechanism cause confrontation between them. It happened between PPP and IJI. PPP controlled the centre and had coalition governments in all the provinces of Pakistan except Punjab where IJI formed its government. This confrontation was being played on the turf of ethnicity; provincialism was given boost to champion the cause of Punjabism. Nawaz Sharif,

February 1991. Chief Minister of Punjab, Ghulam Haiedr Wayne donated Rs.10 million for the affectee of earthquake in NWFP as well. *Dawn*, 5 February 1991.

⁵⁴ *Dawn*, 26 July 1989.

⁵⁵ *The Muslim*, 17 May 1989.

⁵⁶ *Dawn*, 6 August 1989.

⁵⁷ *The Muslim*, 7 June 1989.

⁵⁸ *Dawn*, 3 March 1990.

Chief Minister of Punjab, announced to set up a provincial bank on 15 November 1989 with its own paid up capital of Rs.100 million. The logo of the bank was rising sun which was the symbol of Ranjit Singh, last ruler of Punjab, before its annexation to British India.⁵⁹ Pakistan Peoples Party vigorously opposed the Bank of Punjab Bill in the Assembly on 3 July 1989, declaring it unconstitutional and a treason against the federation. Same was the case with setting up a provincial television station because Punjab government complained that its achievements were not covered by PTV.

Pakistan Peoples Party government of 1988 in the centre infused the sense of equality among the labours and workers by granting them the right of forming trade unions in the new Labour Policy.⁶⁰ To complete the designed objectives of development Punjab government allocated Rs.26.05 crore for various development schemes in rural Punjab and likewise central government allocated Rs.425 million for the development of Northern Areas.⁶¹ It was very encouraging that after a long period of neglect, education figured as a major concern of the central and provincial governments. Central government increased the education budget from Rs.1.17 billion in 1988-89 to Rs.1.97 billion.⁶² Punjab government allocated Rs.7.08 billion for education and Rs.2.04 billion for health in the annual budget of 1989-90.⁶³ Punjab's annual development plan showed an increase of 1.6% in 1989-90 for education.⁶⁴

Sindh government gave highest priority to education for which Rs.3.5 billion was allocated from the revenue budget as compared an amount of Rs.2.9 billion a year before and the amount for health sector was annually increased.⁶⁵ Provincial government of PPP started Sindh urban development programme in 1990 by an amount of Rs.16 billion with the additional assistance of \$800 million from the United States of America.⁶⁶ This development programme intended to increase the institutional capacity for resource inflows and service delivery in the public sector. The province of Balochistan had a sizeable development outlay of Rs.1.7 billion under the Annual Development Plan and Rs.860

⁵⁹ Ian Talbot, *op.cit.*, p.301.

⁶⁰ *The Nation*, 20 January 1989.

⁶¹ *Ibid.*, 27 January 1989.

⁶² *Dawn*, 1 July 1989.

⁶³ *The Muslim*, 7 June 1989.

⁶⁴ *Dawn*, 1 July 1989.

⁶⁵ *The Muslim*, 15 June 1989.

⁶⁶ *Dawn*, 3 April 1990.

million more for special development projects out of the total budget outlay of Rs.7.24 billion which sanctioned Rs.177 million for education followed by Rs.158 million for health.⁶⁷ The Government of NWFP allocated Rs.4978.49 million for the development of the social sector such as education, health, agriculture, forests and construction. So this amount constituted 53.6% of the total budget along with increase of 7% for education which indicated the preferences of the provincial government in consonance with the federal and all of the other provincial governments.⁶⁸

Chief Minister of NWFP announced electrification of all villages in the Chitral district with in the time span of three years and the work on the extension of the Shashi Hydel power station was taken up.⁶⁹ The Economic Coordination Committee of the cabinet allowed the Regional Development Finance Corporation to grant concessional loans at the rate of 6% instead of the normal 15% to the people of Northern Areas to enable them to setup small industries there.⁷⁰ A people's programme with an amount of Rs.2 billion was launched to undertake development activity in health, supply of clean drinking water, education, and communication.⁷¹

Federal government in 1990 decided to accord top priority to health sector and initially allocated one billion rupees to the health sector in addition to its original allocation in the budget of 1989-90. That was 5.17% of the total public sector development budget as against 4.59% in 1988-89.⁷² Central government of PPP in 1990 raised the prices of the fertilizer and petroleum to raise the revenue for the completion of the desired government agenda. The government adviser on economic affairs V.A Jaffery, said that due to rise in international price of oil from \$14 to \$17 per barrel, the government had to made this arrangement. He added that government has given relief to the farmer community by increasing the price of the wheat by Rs.11 per 100kg; hence increase in fertilizer price should not badly affect the farmers.⁷³ Against this decision Punjab Provincial Assembly admitted an adjournment motion and criticized PPP government's performance.

⁶⁷ *The Muslim*, 21 June 1989.

⁶⁸ *Dawn*, 1 July 1989.

⁶⁹ *The Muslim*, 14 May 1989.

⁷⁰ *Ibid.*, 23 May 1989.

⁷¹ *The Nation*, 9 February 1989.

⁷² *Dawn*, 23 April 1990.

⁷³ *Ibid.*, 2 April 1990.

Economic mismanagement has been the principal cause of the undoing of the many governments in Pakistan. Government of PPP in 1988 began its career with a promise of resurging the sagging economy that it had inherited from the previous regime. In any society the yardstick of success is the cost and pace of development, regulation and control of the price mechanism and a rise in the income level of population in real terms. In Pakistan at that time this rise was in the form of disguised taxation which penalized the people of lower cadre and checked the PPP agenda of an egalitarian society rather it fell more in line with International Monetary Fund (IMF) and other donor agencies agenda of conditional aid. PPP was not oblivious of the fact that poor people's life had been grievously hurt by the price hike. So PPP parliamentary party met under the senior minister Begum Nusrat Bhutto and constituted a 12 member special committee to look into the matter of price hike.⁷⁴ Central government of PPP in 1990 increased the amount of annual development programme to address the social deprivation of the poor people of Pakistan. Special priority was given to the construction of roads in rural areas and the development of model villages. For this purpose an allocation of Rs.646.7million was made in the development plan of 1990-91 and that was a good increase of 22% than the last year.⁷⁵ Federal government utilized the amount of Rs.110 million that had been sanctioned in the budget of 1990-1991 for the ongoing social welfare projects like the 46 special education centres providing education, treatment, training and rehabilitation services. For the uplift of the rural sector government, an amount of Rs.529 million for the construction and rehabilitation of the roads was provided. The main programme of the ministry of local government & rural development included road maintenance, construction under Asian Development Bank assisted farm to market road projects phase-1 and U.S AID road resources management project.

In the development plan of the NWFP chief minister announced up-lift plan for the province which was more in line with national concerns. NWFP Chief Minister, Aftab Ahmed Khan's up-lift plan's salient features demonstrated the development concerns of the province: multi-purpose Gomal Zame hydel project; constructing of Lowari tunnel between Chitral and Dir; restarting work on Indus highway, and provision of social amenities.⁷⁶ He announced security and tax free package for the industry which was to be set up in the NWFP. He also

⁷⁴ *Dawn*, 4 April 1990

⁷⁵ *Ibid.*, 8 June 1990.

⁷⁶ *The Nation*, 14 December 1988.

added, eight year tax free period, no import tax on machinery, no sales tax on production, and concessions for investment in the province. His government also exempted all such industries from local tax which were setup on 1 July 1985 or after that date.⁷⁷

Views of the regional and as well as national leaderships were harmonized on the agenda of social and national development. Chief Minister of Balochistan also made announcement of this kind having agenda of social and economic development. Chief Minister Akbar Bugti stated that provincial quota in the federal job will be enhanced from 3.05% to 5.14% and for the generation of employment opportunities, private sector will be encouraged to invest in the industries.⁷⁸ To fulfill his words Nawab Akbar Bugti announced the 'Accelerated Development Programme' at a total cost of Rs.220 million in the province and enticed the industrial people of Karachi to come to Balochistan for industrial investment.⁷⁹ He assured security and the safety along with some concessions to the investors to shore up their confidence. Federal government did not remain oblivious of the development of this remote province which had remained underdeveloped due to its inaccessibility. For the development of this province, the foundation stone of a fish harbour-cum-miniport was laid down by the Prime Minister Benazir Bhutto, on 14 December 1989, at Gwadar. This project was to be completed with the help of the Belgium government and its estimated cost was Rs.900 million, with a foreign exchange component of Rs.600 million and it was expected that port will be operational by mid-1992. On this occasion Benazir Bhutto announced the sanction of Rs.200 million for the construction of the Makran coastal highway and the amount of Rs.40 million for the construction of a dam to ensure regular supply of drinking water to Gwadar.⁸⁰

Federal government on 8 January 1989 announced the 'People's Development Programme' worth Rs.2 billion for the social up lift of urban and rural areas which was the part of the PPP manifesto of a new order for the 21st century.⁸¹ For the betterment of the people of Pakistan new plans for development were visualized in the National Economic Council (NEC). Meeting of NEC was convened in May 1989 which approved a sum of Rs.56 billion for annual development programme for the year 1989-1990. That amount included Rs.39.9 billion for federal

⁷⁷ *The Nation*, 19 March 1989.

⁷⁸ *Ibid.*, 6 March 1989.

⁷⁹ *The Muslim*, 16 May 1989.

⁸⁰ *Morning News* (Karachi), 17 December 1989.

⁸¹ *The Nation*, 9 January 1989.

programmes and Rs.16.1 billion for the provinces. To satisfy the urge of development an additional amount of Rs.6 billion was sanctioned as compared to the previous year's annual development programme, and the amount of Peoples Programme was also increased to Rs.3 billion for the year 1989-1990 as compared to the previous year's amount of Rs.2 billion.⁸²

PPP's Financial Advisor, V.A.Jaffery, who set the targets of development all over the country and also laid down a scheme of priorities, announced intended increase in different sectors of the economy to move the progress line upward. In the annual development programme it was designed to increase the production of rice to 3.64 million tones, wheat to 15 million tones and cotton to 8.7 million tones.⁸³ Government announced its success in the field of oil production and the target of its daily production increased from 12000 barrels to 55000 barrels and the work for exploration of oil was expedited through an agreement between the Oil Gas Development Corporation (OGDC) and the Occidental Pakistan Inc.⁸⁴

Seventh five year plan was revised for remaining three years for the better utilization of available resources by their new sectoral distribution. Keeping in view the better resource position for public corporations an increase in the size of the remaining three years were made from the plan allocation of Rs.30.8 billion to Rs.48.1 billion, thereby increasing the seventh plan allocation for public corporations from Rs.49 billion to Rs.68 billion. Government allocated Rs.1.1 billion in provincial social sector development programme 1989-90 for primary education and Rs.3 billion was earmarked for large scale employment oriented training programme during the plan period.

The private sector made substantial investment during the first two years of the plan. As against the target of Rs.47.6 billion and Rs.52.5 billion for 1988-89 and 1989-90 respectively, the implementation came to Rs.56.7 billion and Rs.59.7 billion. That represented an increase of 16.3% over plan allocation. In view of this trend the size of private

⁸² *The Muslim*, 24 May 1989. National Economic Council (NEC) is an advisory body under Article 156 of the Constitution to make recommendations to the federal as well as provincial governments on matters relating to economic and social policies, *The Muslim*, 31 May 1989.

⁸³ *Ibid.*, 24 May 1989.

⁸⁴ The daily consumption of oil was still short of 75000 barrels. The cost and profit share in case of commercial discovery was equally distributed between the OGDC and Occidental Pakistan Inc. *Morning News*, 17 November 1989.

investment for remaining three years increased from 192.3 billion to Rs.202.8 billion. The seventh plan envisaged an outlay of Rs.350.0 billion in the public sector and Rs.293.4 billion in private sector to cover major sectors such as education, man power, health, nutrition and employment.⁸⁵ The Federal Republic of Germany also assisted Pakistan in the field of power, tele-communications, rural development and vocational training for the balanced growth of all the areas of community development. German government's involvement in rural development included Pattoki livestock production project, Lahore; the integrated rural development programme, Abbottabad and the Kaghan valley intensive forest management project.

In the field of vocational training programmes, Germany supported national staff training institute, Islamabad; training centre for orthopedic technologists, Peshawar; technical training centre at Quetta, Hub chowki and Lahore(for women).⁸⁶ Government of Pakistan was also involved in public sector development programme which was similarly started in the provinces with their own financial outlay and priorities. The fiscal year 1990-1991 proposed a public sector development programme (PSDP) of Rs.79.0 billion.

Table 1: Public Sector Development Programme (in billion rupees)

Particulars	Allocation Local rupees	For 1990- Foreign aid	1991 Total
BDP	<u>44.0</u>	<u>19.0</u>	<u>63.0</u>
A. Federal	24.6	18.4	43.0
B. SDP	4.7	0.6	5.3
C. Provincial	14.6	0.1	14.7
CDP	10.6	5.4	16.0

Budgetary Development Programme (BDP)
 Special Development Programme (SDP)
 Corporation Development Programme (CDP)
Source: Dawn, 8 June 1990.

⁸⁵ *Dawn*, 20 January 1990.

⁸⁶ *Ibid.*, 9 March 1990.

Table 2: Provincial Public Sector Development Programme

Province	Rupee	Foreign aid	Total
Punjab	7617	43	7660
Sindh	3068	46	3114
NWFP	2489	17	2506
Balochistan	1426	15	1441
Total	14600	121	14721

Source: Dawn, 8 June 1990.

For the uplift of the rural side of the country federal government of PPP provided an amount of Rs.529 million to the ministry of Local Government and Rural Development in the budget of 1990-1991. The ministry decided to undertake the works of road maintenance and construction under Asian Development Bank assisted farm to market road projects phase-1 and USAID road resources management project.⁸⁷ Different schemes of development were approved which examined 38 projects, approved 15 and cleared 10 for presentation to Executive Committee for National Economic Council (ECNEC). All had the worth of Rs.204million and more of them were for Sindh and NWFP province while one scheme each was for Punjab and Balochistan.⁸⁸

Conclusion

This kind of deliverance by the government at the centre or the provinces was remarkable which was made possible by the extension of government into all regions and areas of community development. It is inevitable part of democratic setup to create the systemic roles for the smooth functioning of political system. Here it is seemingly a positive role of Pakistan Peoples Party and other political parties in the provinces to inculcate their programme among the general masses and then after, assuming the office, they tried their level best to come up to their expectation by generating resources to fulfil the needs and desires of the community. For this purpose PPP even changed its old ideological stance to make the process of deliverance certain without further structural changes. PPP very pragmatically preferred a market economy rather than persisting with the socialist rhetoric. This was a sharp departure from the party's established image and program and required a reformulation of its

⁸⁷ *Dawn*, 8 June 1990.

⁸⁸ ECNEC, the highest political development organization which has the power to approve development projects costing more than Rs.60 million. *The Nation*, 3 July 1990.

principles but it managed its organizational capacity and relied on mass appeal to meet the demands of the time.

In this period there was good political and administrative penetration at levels of political dispensation and it supported the state building not only in material sense but also in value shifting to create a new base for community upliftment. The political mechanism operated in a way which regulated the socio-economic behavior of the regime and the society as well. The political penetration or the political deliverance started taking roots, gaining acceptance of its presence at the centre and the periphery to implement development policies and achieve national goals. It is generally believed that popular consciousness of participation in the processes of the country's governance not only gives vitality to democracy but also provides firm foundation for national security. The development approach of units and centre to uplift the social position of the people of Pakistan created a friendly environment for articulating interests of the community of the four regions of Pakistan by the political parties and made them realize that political governments were working for the rights and welfare of ordinary person. It was the sign of opening up of the system which democracy always demanded. Peoples participation in the system in one way or other was made sure by the political agents. And this kind of attitude of political agents at all levels of the system manifested the characteristics of democracy. It was seemingly accepted by the people that democracy is the ideal system which can render support to affiliated institutions for proper deliverance. Functions of the democratic values of a society became the ideal and were operational in the lives of the public with their consent and acceptance which lent legitimacy to the system. Seemingly it was being achieved but the pace of its working was not very smooth.